

REVIEWS

CONTRIBUTIONS TO PREHISTORIC ARCHAEOLOGY OFFERED TO PROFESSOR V. GORDON CHILDE, IN HONOUR OF HIS SIXTY-FIFTH BIRTHDAY. Edited by J. G. D. CLARK, assisted by K. P. OAKLEY and S. PIGGOTT. Pp. 310, Pls. XXX, many figs. The Prehistoric Society, c/o John Bellows Ltd., Eastgate, Gloucester. Price 42s.

The twenty-seven contributions in this volume (twelve by European and fifteen by British scholars) range in time from the Palaeolithic to the Iron Age, and are a reflection of Professor Childe's very wide field of endeavour and high achievement as one of the outstanding scholars of British and European prehistory. Appropriately, the first contribution, on a Micoquian tool from a raised beach in Morbihan, is by Henri Breuil.

The Neolithic period is represented by eight contributions, including an important paper on the Windmill Hill culture by Stuart Piggott. The six papers devoted to the Bronze Age include a much needed review of research in Hungary since 1936 by J. Banner. Among Iron Age contributions are papers by C. A. R. Radford, 'Contributions to the Study of the Belgae', and R. B. K. Stevenson, 'Pins and the Chronology of Brochs'.

The volume is illustrated by thirty half-tone plates, some of which (XI-XVII, for example), have no indication of scale, and by numerous text figures, among which is an invaluable series showing Continental La Tène art motifs in a paper by Ernst Sprockhoff. A study of anthropoid swords by R. R. Clarke and C. F. C. Hawkes includes an extremely useful bibliography and a register of fifty such weapons in Europe and the British Isles, 'An Iron Anthropoid Sword from Shouldham, Norfolk, with Related Continental and British Weapons'. A paper by Miss Nancy Sandars contains a detailed list, with references, of one-edged bronze knives in the Aegean area.

The final contribution is a bibliography, compiled by Isobel Smith, of Professor Childe's publications, which range from 1915 to 1956, a period of forty-two years. The numerous translations of his works into various European languages are themselves eloquent testimony of the high regard in which Gordon Childe is held by Continental scholars.

This collection of papers forms Volume XXI of the Proceedings of the Prehistoric Society and maintains the Society's usual high standard of publication. By present-day standards the price of two guineas is by no means excessive.

J. L. FORDE-JOHNSTON

EXCAVATIONS AT GOZLÜ KULE, TARSUS : II, FROM THE NEOLITHIC THROUGH THE BRONZE AGE.

By HETTY GOLDMAN, with chapters by MACHTELD J. MELLINK and I. J. GELB, and an Appendix by FREDERICK R. MATSON. Princeton, New Jersey : Princeton University Press, 1956. Pp. ix + 373, Pls. 460, 26 plans.

These two magnificent books complete the definitive report of the Bryn Mawr excavations at Gözlü Kule, Cilicia. The remains of the Hellenistic and Roman periods were published in 1950, and the present volume deals with the prehistoric levels, the investigation of which were the primary object of the expedition.

Gözlü Kule is a large mound rising over 22 metres above the modern road on the S.W. outskirts of Tarsus. Its archaeological importance derives from its location in the fertile and highly desirable plain of Cilicia, and at the junction of old trade routes leading from the Black Sea to the Mediterranean, and from North Syria and Mesopotamia through the Amanus Mts. to the west. Land-hungry colonists and itinerant merchants would therefore both be attracted here, and it was their traces which the American excavators sought. In an excellent final chapter Miss Goldman reviews the external influences which affected this corner of the ancient world. In the early periods the main source of influence seems to have been North Syria, and especially the Amuq region, though traces of western contacts, for instance with Cyprus, are not lacking. It was not until the latter part of the

Early Bronze Age, however, that the West invaded Cilicia in force; though we may suspect that the movement which brought so much Troadic pottery to Tarsus in E.B. III was more in the nature of a wholesale migration of families, with their domestic industries, than of a buccaneering enterprise such as Miss Goldman suggests (p. 348). Another invasion of (probably) nomadic tribes from Syria inaugurated the M.B. period here, as elsewhere in the Middle East; while the Late Bronze Age saw the gradual establishment of the Hittite power, which lasted until the story of prehistoric Tarsus, as recorded here, was brought to an end with the destruction of the town at the hands of the People of the Sea, c. 1100 B.C.

The architectural remains which this expedition uncovered at Tarsus are for the most part fragmentary and uninspiring; the two exceptions are the E.B. II fortifications, with their interesting evidence for the early use of timber as a reinforcing agent in the construction of mud-brick walls, and the 'Hittite' temple and houses of L.B. II. By far the greater part of the volume is devoted to a detailed catalogue and discussion of the portable objects found, including some most important hieroglyphic seals and a charming little crystal statuette of the Hittite period, besides the more mundane series of flint, bone, and metal objects. It is obvious that a great deal of careful work has gone into preparing these small finds for publication.

It would be pleasant to be able to say the same of the excavation itself, but unfortunately this is not possible. One must remember, when criticising the excavation methods used at Tarsus, that the work was begun almost a quarter of a century ago; it is disappointing, however, that the seal of publication has been given to these methods in 1956, without a word to suggest that they are not now adequate. The student who hopes to find a careful and detailed stratigraphic analysis of the remains at Gozlu Kule will be disappointed, especially in the accounts of the lower levels. Not until one reaches the E.B. II stratum is there any attempt made to sub-divide the broad archaeological periods into building phases, and to analyse the pottery and other finds on these lines; and this despite the fact that there are some 1.50 m. of Neolithic deposit and over 4.00 m. of Chalcolithic, all of which contain definite successive floor surfaces. The only sort of 'stratigraphy' seemingly recognised is that based on a meticulous record of the absolute depths of floors, walls, and objects, measured from a datum on top of the mound. There is surely no need to point out here that this is no substitute for the careful observation and graphic recording of building levels. It is only necessary to look at the published section (Plan 26) to realise that this latter has not been done. Apart from the exceedingly poor quality of the draughtsmanship (a remark which applies also to many of the plans, e.g. nos. 1 and 2), this section is much too schematic to be of any use. Neither does it tally in many respects with the text. For example, on pp. 5-6 the depth of the Chalcolithic deposit is said to be from about 26.50 m. to 30.50 m., while the section shows it as from 27.00 m. to 31.50 m. A similar textual (and archaeological) confusion occurs on p. 67, where it is said that only one sherd of Neolithic thin red polished ware was found 'at about its proper level (30.00 m.-30.50 m.)'; on p. 65, however, we were told that the upper limit of the Neolithic was at 30.50 m., while the section shows the same boundary at 31.50 m. This sort of confusion vitiates much of the detailed pottery analysis. How much simpler it would have been if the ceramic material had been grouped into phases, and each sherd had been given a definite level number, rather than the meaningless, however accurate, absolute depth. With all this uncertainty one is tempted to wonder how many of the 'transitional' periods, e.g. E.B. I (p. 92), are not really the products of a faulty stratigraphical analysis.

Both of these books are beautifully bound and printed. The drawings of pottery and other objects are excellent, as are most of the photographs of small finds. On the other hand, the photographs of exterior subjects are well below the standard necessary for a good excavation report: few of them contain any sort of scale, many are completely uninformative (e.g. nos. 1 and 2), and some are technically bad (e.g. nos. 6, 13, and 188), though much of this is perhaps the fault of the reproduction. Fewer, larger, and better illustrations would have been far more useful, and might have helped to reduce the cost of the books.

This, then, is a very uneven report, with many serious demerits, and the material in it will have to be used with great care. It remains, nevertheless, an indispensable reference book, and sheds much light on the broader outlines of Near Eastern prehistory. It will be for future workers to fill in the detail and to grasp the opportunity which the excavators of Tarsus have so unfortunately missed.

PETER J. PARR.

CHINESE BRONZE AGE WEAPONS. By MAX LOEHR. Pp. xiii + 233. XLVI pls. University of Michigan Press. London: Cumberlege, O.U.P. Price 140s.

This is a *catalogue-raisonné*, and a sumptuous one indeed for these days, of the Werner Jannings Collection of Chinese Bronze Age Weapons in the Chinese National Palace Museum in Peking. The ancient Palace Museum is virtually inaccessible to us and we are indebted to Dr. Loehr, Professor of Far Eastern Art and Archaeology in Michigan University, for making these remarkable bronze weapons, mainly of the Shang and Chou dynasties, available for study by careful descriptions, line-drawings, and photogravure illustrations. The record includes rubbings of marks, inscriptions and linear patterns on the weapons. Distribution, origins, and age are considered in a sectional preface, extending to nearly half the book, that comprises chapters devoted to axes, spearheads, dagger-axes, knives and daggers, and swords; in chapter VI discussion of Siberia in the Early Bronze Age concludes with an archaeological time chart for Russia, Siberia and China, a table of Chou chronology and sequence of styles, and a map showing the principal archaeological sites of Western, Central and Eastern Asia. The catalogue is completed by bibliographies of Chinese and non-Chinese literature and an Index. The illustrations of the weapons, many of full size, are admirably clear.

The work was intended for the *Monumenta Serica, Journal of Oriental Studies of the Catholic University of Peking*, but this project had to be abandoned in 1948 with the advent of the Communists, and the present catalogue was subsidised from the Charles L. Freer Fund administered by the University of Michigan and published in America.

A. R. DUFTY.

MODELS OF DAILY LIFE IN ANCIENT EGYPT FROM THE TOMB OF MEKET-RE' AT THEBES. By H. E. WINLOCK. Harvard University Press, 1955. London: Geoffrey Cumberlege. Price £3.

THE BURIED PYRAMID. By M. ZAKARIA GONEIM. Longmans, 1956. Price 18s.

Both these books contain accounts of remarkable archaeological discoveries. The first is the report, long overdue, on the finding of the splendid wooden models made for the high official Meket-Re'; the second is a preliminary, popular account of the first few seasons' work on the site of a ruined pyramid at Saqqara.

The tomb of Meket-Re', chancellor of King Nebhepetre' Mentuhotpe III of the XIth Dynasty (about 2010 B.C.), had been found in 1895 in the cliffs of Deir el-Bahari; it was plundered and wrecked. A careful clearance by the expedition of the Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, directed by H. E. Winlock in 1920 led to the discovery of a small chamber filled with models of daily life of the kind commonly found in tombs of the period from the late Old Kingdom to the early Middle Kingdom. They included models of Meket-Re''s house, his granaries, butcher's shop, weaving shop, an inspection of cattle and a number of boats. As a group they form the finest ever discovered both from the point of view of execution and preservation and in the amount of information they provide about the activities represented. Here in a three-dimensional form the life of Ancient Egypt is vividly illustrated. The volume in which these models are published has been prepared from the notes of H. E. Winlock. Each model is described in detail and, where they are required, explanations of the technical processes are given. The structures of the boats are examined and the use of the tackle determined as far as possible. A fine series of photographic plates completes the book which is an object

lesson in careful archaeological study. It is a rare phenomenon, a publication that matches in care the skill bestowed on the actual excavation.

In 1952 the archaeological world was startled to learn that a new pyramid had been discovered at Saqqara. The story of this discovery is told in *The Buried Pyramid* by Zakaria Goneim, the Egyptian archaeologist, who can claim for himself the credit of appreciating a site hitherto unrecognised for what it was and of conducting an excavation which, still unfinished, has secured many important results. All that remains of the pyramid is the lowest platform of a postulated stepped structure. It is extremely doubtful whether more of the superstructure was ever built, but, being unfinished, it retains many traces of constructional methods which may after further study help to solve some of the problems of pyramid building. The structure is dated most probably to the IIIrd Dynasty, but the identification of the builder as a king named Sekhem-khet is less probable. Much better evidence than that already found is needed before his name can be established. Beneath the main structure an elaborate system of passages and chambers has been found; in one of these chambers is one large empty alabaster sarcophagus. Some interesting gold objects, an inscribed ivory plaque and a large number of stone vessels have so far been discovered, but the appearance of the whole suggests that the complex was never finished and possibly never occupied. The discoverer remains optimistic of his chances of finding an undisturbed burial, but whether a King in a gold coffin is found or not, the importance of the site is already established and valuable results are already achieved. The story is here told with engaging modesty and in a very readable way.

T. G. H. JAMES

A HISTORY OF THE ANCIENT SOUTHWEST. By HAROLD STERLING GLADWIN. Pp. xx + 383, 179 photographs and drawings, 20 maps. The Bond Wheelwright Company, Portland, Maine, 1957. Price \$8.50.

The American Southwest, with its centre in Arizona and New Mexico, is the home of the Pueblo Indians, their ancestors and other predecessors, and of the nomadic Navajo and Apache. Much of its complex prehistory has been studied by archaeologists, including Mr. Gladwin, in very great detail. In this book he has distilled their work into a concise and most interesting story, to which he has added more than a spice of his own wit and independence of outlook.

Those who have specialised knowledge of the Southwest may well dissent violently from Gladwin's appreciation of their particular facet, but his ability to see the area as a whole will be of great benefit to us all. The book is well produced and clearly illustrated. All who try to follow developments in American archaeology should read it, and it should prove of great interest to many others.

G. H. S. BUSHNELL.

THE ANCIENT MAYA. By SYLVANUS G. MORLEY, Third Edition revised by GEORGE W. BRAINERD. Pp. x + 494, 102 plates, 57 figs., 10 tables. Stanford University Press, 1956.

This is a new and revised edition of a book of proved value. Some sections have been improved and important new discoveries have been included. A few of the plates still suffer from woolly reproduction, and the pottery of the earlier stages is still insufficiently illustrated, but otherwise the book is highly recommended.

G. H. S. BUSHNELL.

RECENT ARCHAEOLOGICAL EXCAVATIONS IN BRITAIN. Edited by R. L. S. BRUCE-MITFORD. Pp.xxiv-310; Pls. LII, figs. 81. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1956. Price 42s.

During the last war and since, field-work and excavation have increased to a scale unknown hitherto in this or any other country. To many, indeed, archaeology and excavation are synonymous. In this book eleven excavators give accounts, some for the first time, of major sites excavated in Britain since 1939. The theme of the book and the time of its appearance are apposite. The current popularity of and widespread interest in archaeology call for studies, condensed yet readable and scholarly, of a selection of excavations and new developments in the subject. But the book contains much more than factual reports; each chapter is a demonstration of the research and even imaginative reconstruction that go to make an excavation report long after the actual digging has finished. It is this aspect implied in the book that is probably the most valuable lesson it can drive home to the general reader.

Professor Grahame Clark leads off with a vivid account of the mesolithic settlement at Star Carr and its relation to comparable sites on the continent. The exceptionally good preservation of the more perishable materials, such as birch bark, has enabled him to reconstruct the life of these primitive hunter-fisher folk in remarkable detail. Next Mr. Rainbird Clarke narrates the events leading to the discovery of the Great Snettisham hoard of gold work. This forms the basis for a useful review of the political and social conditions in south-east Britain at the close of the Iron Age. The Brigantian earthworks at Stanwick, covering an extent of nearly $1\frac{1}{2}$ square miles, are lucidly described by Sir Mortimer Wheeler. This chapter is, of course, a model example of the inter-dependence of shrewd field-work leading to selective excavation, integrated with the fickle political history and intrigues of Queen Cartimandua. The results demonstrate the tactics behind this vast complex of strongholds, thrown up according to defensive ideas conservative to the point of futility when faced by the might of Rome.

Roman religion, both pagan and Christian, receives two chapters and part of a third. Professor Richmond describes the small mithraeum at Carrawburgh against the background of the cult as practised in the military zone of Hadrian's Wall. As we should expect, this includes a masterly interpretation of structures during the successive phases of the building's use. As a contrast in the civil zone, Colonel Meates gives a concise account of the Lullingstone Villa, now famous for its mosaics and marble sculptured heads, and above all for the wall paintings with Christian imagery.

Professor Grimes follows with a welcome account of excavations in the City of London, the difficulties of the conditions there, and some of the major results achieved by the Roman and Medieval Excavation Council during the past nine years. He has selected for fuller treatment the history of the town wall, the mithraeum on Walbrook, and the development of St. Bride's Church, Fleet Street. Special praise must be given for the axonometric drawings of a complex section of Roman and medieval deposits (fig. 43), and of the town wall and its ditch system at successive periods (fig. 48). These drawings are a novel and most informative way of summarising the evidence, expressed in exquisite draftsmanship.

Mr. Phillips has a subjective and exciting chapter on the excavation of the Sutton Hoo ship-burial under great stress at the outbreak of the last war. He conveys very vividly the difficulties under which the diggers worked, day by day uncovering and recording objects, both fragile and sumptuous, the nature of which they had scarcely time to consider.

From the rich trappings of a 7th-century king in East Anglia the scene shifts to late Saxon Cornwall, where at Mawgan Porth Mr. Bruce-Mitford directed the excavation of a 10th-century hamlet. A number of houses were recorded, also the cemetery adjoining the settlement. The domestic life of the inhabitants is ably reconstructed from structural features of the houses and the small finds. The distinctive bar-lip pottery found here and at several sites in Cornwall, also in Eastern England, is surveyed in relation to its analogues in Holland and north Germany. Some pertinent comments follow on the

extent and purpose of the Frisian trade behind the appearance of this exotic pottery as far west as Cornwall.

The unravelling of a site occupied in prehistoric and Viking times is illustrated by Mr. Hamilton's report on Jarlshof, far away in the Shetlands. For more than two millennia life developed in peaceful isolation, but latterly a broch tower was built, possibly as a defence against Roman slave-raiders. Jarlshof is, however, renowned for its Viking settlement, occupied without break over five centuries. The growth of the Viking farmsteads is traced from the few boat-loads of settlers who arrived early in the 9th century. Subsequently other farmsteads were added until the site became crowded with buildings; general decline set in about the end of the 13th century. The concise description of the dwellings in all periods is admirably set alongside the food economy of the people, their industries and trading connections. The Viking houses and middens have yielded a fine series of stone and bone objects illustrating the habits of the settlers, and even a harness mount looted from Ireland and converted into a brooch for one of the women. The most notable finds are the slate tablets incised with realistic drawings of ships, men, and animals.

Two chapters are devoted to the medieval period. In the first Mr. Hope-Taylor describes his remarkably productive excavation of the Norman motte at Abinger, where for the first time the complete plan and details of the post-holes for a wooden tower and its surrounding palisade were recovered. This factual account prompts a reconstruction of the tower, supported by the pictorial evidence of the Bayeux Tapestry and an attractive carving on a stone capital from Westminster Hall, and a search for possible antecedents among Roman watch-towers. A most stimulating essay, and of fundamental value for the study of motte castles and their wooden structures, until now the most grossly neglected of our earthworks. In the second chapter Mr. Hurst introduces deserted medieval villages, the latest and extremely numerous addition to British archaeology. The various causes that compelled the wholesale abandonment of the villages are discussed; the most potent, affecting most of the counties of midland England, being depopulation for pasture for sheep-farming. The geographical extent and density of the village pattern are shown by three maps covering most of England from the Border to the Isle of Wight. The special techniques required in digging deserted villages are demonstrated by the work at Wharram Percy, under the auspices of the Deserted Medieval Village Research Group. In the present context the balance of this chapter would have been improved by a paragraph or two on the cultural side of the villages; for instance, the types of pottery in use and their sources, and something on building materials (at Hangleton in Sussex roofing slates imported from Cornwall, and even possibly from Belgium, were found).

The book closes with two chapters on special subjects of general interest. In the past few years air photography has brought about a revolution in British archaeology, and here Dr. St. Joseph reviews the staggering additions made by him to the archaeological landscape in all periods. Finally, Mr. Bruce-Mitford contributes a short account of Treasure Trove, of which the dual findings, both legally logical, are so well illustrated by the cases of Snettisham and Sutton Hoo.

The aim of this book is avowedly the middle course between, on the one hand, full-dress archaeological reports, and on the other, frankly popular accounts. In its broad appeal the book is an unqualified success. Each contributor has given in good measure and the text is leavened by a generous allowance of excellent plates and well-drawn plans, maps, and drawings of finds. The illustration is greatly enhanced by six drawings by Mr. Alan Sorrell, of which those of the mithraea and Jarlshof are perhaps the most convincing. Such reconstructions are a testing control of all the planning and detailed recording that the excavator can hope to achieve.

As a comprehensive collection of essays the book suffers from two regrettable omissions, the avoidance of which would have made it a much more truly representative record of British archaeological achievement in recent years. Barrow digging has long been a preoccupation (it began in the Middle Ages), but the approach to this class of monument was revolutionized by the work of Sir Cyril Fox in South Wales during the

war, and has been followed by others since. As the Bronze Age is blessed with only part of a chapter, and that concerned with a Scottish site, one on the excavation of barrows and the interpretation of structural features in terms of ritual would be particularly valuable now, when the threat to barrows is country-wide, demanding much excavation. Likewise, since the war, not a few Anglo-Saxon cemeteries have been examined, and several hundred graves recorded in detail. However much we may be dazzled by Sutton Hoo, general advance in Anglo-Saxon archaeology will in the main be based on the material from such cemeteries, set in the appropriate regional contexts and against the wider background of the continent.

The predominant rôle of the Ministry of Works in initiating and financing excavation, throughout the period covered by the book, might be thought to have merited editorial comment over and above the incidental mention accorded in individual chapters, for it represents a new departure of first importance. That this is so is indeed illustrated by the fact that nearly half the undertakings described owed their inception to, or were financed by, the Ministry. Jarlshof represents the normal work on a site in the Ministry's guardianship; Mawgan Porth was uncovered as a prelude to guardianship; Sutton Hoo may be regarded as an embryonic starting-point of a multitude of rescue-digs; it is principally thanks to substantial and continuing grants from public funds that the Roman and Medieval London Excavation Council have been able to carry out the work that has given us the Walbrook Mithraeum, the Cripplegate Fort, and much else besides; Stanwick, again, was a research project which sprang wholly from Ministry initiative. These are facts which surely deserved more than passing mention.

G. C. DUNNING

MAP OF ROMAN BRITAIN (Third Edition). Pp. 45, 5 full-page text-figures and folding map, in full colours, 16 miles to 1 inch. Ordnance Survey, 1956.

The long-awaited new edition of the Ordnance Survey map of Roman Britain was published, appropriately enough, in the year which marks the seventieth birthday of its progenitor; and though the protocol of Government Departments has not permitted the inclusion of any reference to his name in its text, all students of Roman Britain will acclaim it as a worthy and welcome tribute to Dr. O. G. S. Crawford. A brief foreword by the Director-General notes that the map has been prepared, under the supervision of Mr. C. W. Phillips, by Mr. A. L. F. Rivet: that will be sufficient guarantee of thoroughness and discrimination in the execution of the project. A brief review cannot do more than draw attention to some of the most strikingly successful features of the new edition. The map itself is larger, taking in the whole of Scotland, with Orkney and Shetland inset, most of Ireland too coming in (though only in outline, with modern place-names to indicate find-spots of Roman material); the colouring to show physical features is paler, allowing the use of red for military sites and green for areas of surviving 'Celtic' fields and mauve for industrial sites (potteries and kilns, mines and quarries), in addition to an enlarged and improved series of symbols in black. In the 'military zone', the growth of civil settlements has been indicated by the attachment of open black circles to the red squares that mark forts or fortresses, and open red squares overlaid by the solid black of towns attest the military sites of the invasion period—and the Cripplegate fort in London (which surely deserved a solid red square). A special fount has been used for place-names whose attribution is not absolutely certain; and the evidence is conveniently summarised in an *Index of Roman Names* (pp. 25–27), based on a careful collation of the geographical sources, themselves discussed briefly (p. 17 f.) and well. The text-figures include Ptolemy's map, reconstructed; the British section of the Antonine Itinerary; the Castor area to a scale of 1½ in. to a mile, and North Oxfordshire (¾ in. to a mile) and the Dorset-Wiltshire area (8 in. to a mile); pp. 29–43 are devoted to a detailed topographical index, complete with grid references and references to parish, County 6 in. plan and 1 in. map, for every site shown on the map, subdivided according to categories (colonies, cantonal capitals, lesser walled towns, spas, other major settlements, and so on). It is difficult to say

whether the teacher, the student or the investigator will derive most benefit from this brilliant contribution to the further investigation of Roman Britain; my only serious criticism must be that the lack of a larger scale map, whether inset or text-figure, of Hadrian's Wall and its neighbourhood leaves that area least well served of all; along the coast of Cumberland in particular, where Mr. Richard Bellhouse's recent researches have been adding appreciably to our knowledge of the chain of coastal signal-towers, and in the Haltwhistle Burn area (with its wealth of temporary camps), this map has no help to offer. But something must be left for inclusion in the next edition!

ERIC BIRLEY

CATALOGUE OF THE ROMAN INSCRIBED AND SCULPTURED STONES IN THE GROSVENOR MUSEUM, CHESTER. By R. P. WRIGHT with contributions by Professor I. A. RICHMOND. Pp. 68. Pls. XLVII, figs. 3. Chester and North Wales Archaeological Society, Grosvenor Museum, Chester, 1955. Price 25s.

Haverfield's original catalogue of 1900 has long been out of print. As a permanent memorial to its centenary in 1949, therefore, the Chester and North Wales Archaeological Society decided to issue a revised catalogue. The work was entrusted to Mr. Wright who invited Professor Richmond to write the analysis of the sculptured stones; Mr. E. Birley, too, has given advice, and recourse has been had to Haverfield's original MS. notes. A book produced under such auspices is naturally of unexceptionable scholarship. A very full photographic record is provided, 181 stones or lead objects being pictured, some of them from more than one angle where called for. The great majority of these photos are of excellent quality: in one or two cases the blockmaker rather than the photographer seems to be the cause of some obscurity. Considerations of economy have naturally made it necessary to utilize each plate to the full; and this has meant that objects of different scale have been shown together. What is apparently a 1ft. or sometimes a 6 in. measure has accordingly been drawn below each. This, though ugly, is at least clear, but some readers, especially abroad, might have found it clearer if the real nature of this scale had been defined.

In the catalogue, which itself is subdivided under generic headings, each piece has a full description with measurements and find-spot, followed by a transcript and expansion of the Latin text and its translation. There follow explanatory notes and references. Appended to the body of the catalogue are some useful epigraphic indexes under such headings as *Nomina*, *Cognomina*, Emperors and their Families, Religion, Places and Peoples.

The wealth of learning in this book will be a valued source for students. Nothing but praise can be given to the work itself. Less satisfactory is the utility of its arrangement. Anyone reading the catalogue finds his way directed easily enough to the illustrations. But many will prefer to work back from the illustrations. Here one encounters a difficulty. The stones, etc., are arranged numerically. Now the only advantage of numbers is that they follow in a known and socially recognised sequence. In this catalogue, however, they do not always do so. This is infuriating to the reader, and it seems to follow from a misguided desire to retain Haverfield's numeration. The reviewer can see no advantage in doing this. Not a few stones have been recovered since Haverfield wrote: they occur here as 5*a*, 15*b*, and so on, being inserted into the subsections in the appropriate chronological or alphabetical position. Others, not in the Chester Museum, but at Eaton Hall or in the British or Ashmolean Museums, have been included for the first time very rightly, because they are Chester stones. They occur as Ex(ternal) 2, and so on, but are inserted where their classification requires. Other pieces again which have been lost since 1900 are omitted from the catalogue, but they have departed with their numbers, so that e.g. 186 does not occur in the catalogue at all.

All this is very complicated. How much better to have treated this as (what indeed it is) a new definitive catalogue, give a sequential numeration, and cross-reference to the 1900 book, both under individual stones and, if necessary, in separate lists. Haverfield's

work was of course fundamental, but this judgement need not extend to his *numbers*. At least we might have been given page references below each plate.

Weathered and decayed Roman stones in quantity can be a depressing sight in a museum. With this book to guide and interpret the visitor will find the Museum full of life and interest. Here, however, we must consider briefly what there is for the wider field of students of Roman Britain. First there are the historical pieces, the lead pigs of A.D. 74 (196, 197), the lead pipe (199) of Agricola, a fine Purbeck Marble fragment of A.D. 79 dedicated to (Vespasian and) his sons (interesting, too, as evidence for the exploitation and diffusion of this rock); the slate inscription of Trajan to be linked with the rebuilding in stone, and 77 which postpones the rebuilding of the north wall a century to Constantius. Secondly, we have the interesting series of tombstones of soldiers of LEGIO II ADIUTRIX, stationed here from A.D. 79-86, and the much larger series of the Twentieth, together with those of civilians and others.

The reader will be impressed no less by the Romanity of all these stones than by their often crude artistic standard. The latter point is explained; these reliefs will have been often 'coated with gesso and painted': they are mere surviving 'ground work for a painted picture'. Browsing through this book the imagination will be brought to realize what it was to be a Roman Legionary.

S. S. FRERE

A SHORT GUIDE TO ROMAN YORK: foreword by SIR MORTIMER WHEELER. Pp. 40, figs. 6. Yorkshire Architectural and York Archaeological Society, 1956. Price 2s. 6d.

THE ROMAN ARMY. By GRAHAM WEBSTER. Pp. 52, Pl. VIII, figs. 3. Grosvenor Museum, Chester, 1956. Price 2s.

It is pleasant to find after reading *Roman York* with appreciation that it was written 'for the intelligent layman'. It is full of sober up-to-date information and contains a select bibliography, some useful diagrams and an annotated plan of the modern city with most of the names mentioned in the text marked on it. One may well wonder whether larger sales would not have been achieved by the inclusion (at a slightly higher price) of one or two good half tone plates of monuments or objects. Many of course prefer pictures to text, but even the student finds illustrations useful: the drawing provided (p. 17) of the Bootham Bar frieze is unworthy of the subject. This little booklet will be in demand by visitors and students alike. For the latter it affords a compendious summary of the historical outline combined with a description of the main finds in relation to their find-spots, and of cemeteries and roads. For the former an itinerary is included, though it may well be that only very single-minded visitors will be content to follow such directions as 'Leaving the Treasurer's House you may visit the Minster and see the base of another pillar in the crypt'. To the bibliography should now be added Mr. Ramm's article in *J.R.S.* XLVI with its new information on the origins of the Fortress.

In *The Roman Army* Graham Webster provides a very detailed and well illustrated survey of his subject for a very modest sum. With the growth of public interest in Roman Britain such a book has been needed; and this one does more than supply a popular account, for it gives the student a great deal of specialised information on lay-out and organisation seen against a British (or primarily Chester) background in a form not easily accessible elsewhere now that the basic studies of Parker and Cheesman are out of print: and it points the way to further reading in four pages of bibliography. Eight plates and three line drawings illustrate the text: mistakes are few. The tombstone on Plate Ic is at Bonn not Mainz; and it was surely Ostorius Scapula not Aulus Plautius who was responsible for the Fosse Limes (p. 7). The Chester Museum is to be congratulated on this publication and on the fine models of legionary buildings and equipment, some of which are here illustrated. Comparing this publication, produced by a local authority, with that on York, produced by the local society, the reader is left in no doubt where financial resources nowadays reside.

S. S. FRERE

OFFA'S DYKE : A FIELD SURVEY OF THE WESTERN FRONTIER-WORKS OF MERCIA IN THE SEVENTH AND EIGHTH CENTURIES A.D. By SIR CYRIL FOX, F.B.A., with a foreword by SIR FRANK STENTON, F.B.A. Published for the British Academy by Geoffrey Cumberlege, Oxford University Press. Price 63s.

There is something peculiarly fascinating about a travelling earthwork. On the one hand, there is the grandeur of the conception, a boundary stretching for miles across country, constructed with great labour, for a purpose transcending the humdrum domestic needs which have produced most of the material remains of previous occupants of these islands. On the other, there are the intriguing problems of why, when, how and who.

Of all travelling earthworks in Britain, Offa's Dyke is the most magnificent, surpassing the cognate work of the great Roman Empire, Hadrian's Wall, in length, tenacity of purpose, engineering skill and tactical design. Like Hadrian's Wall, it bears to-day the name of its maker, an ascription amply justified by the present work. From the Severn to the Dee, Offa drew up his boundary line and incised it into the countryside, and this line to-day represents in essence the 'Boundary Line of Cymru'.

Sir Cyril Fox's survey of Offa's Dyke and allied works took place in eight successive summers from 1925 to 1932. The results of the survey were published annually in *Archaeologia Cambrensis*. The present volume is largely a reprint of the successive reports, fully annotated and, where necessary, rewritten to incorporate conclusions which only became apparent at later stages in the survey. A most valuable addition is Sir Frank Stenton's foreword setting out the historical background. In keeping so much of the original form, the account preserves, in the author's words, 'a quality of immediacy and freshness' derived from the write-up season by season. The publication of the whole in one volume by the British Academy, with invaluable supplementary sections, is a fitting culmination. It also places the end of the enterprise under the same personal auspices as its beginning. Dr. R. E. M. Wheeler, then Director of the National Museum of Wales, greeted the author when he took up his post as Keeper of Archaeology of the Museum with the news that the Council had already approved of sufficient leave of absence to enable him to undertake the fieldwork of the survey of the Dyke. Sir Mortimer Wheeler, as Secretary of the British Academy, has persuaded his present Council to provide for the definitive report. It is a magnificent volume, and the only fault that the present reviewer can find is the wholly irrelevant one that it is not of a convenient size to take in one's pocket while following the author's footsteps on the ground; it is a tribute both to the book and to the feeling of enthusiasm for the subject which it engenders that one would like to do so.

The report of this survey of a travelling earthwork is a model of methods of survey, of the presentation of results and of deductions from evidence of types of structure and their relations to topography and history. The Dyke is shown to be a unitary design, planned as a frontier and not a defensive work, yet by a man trained in military traditions, with a sound appreciation of tactical siting. From the major alignments the author deduces that it was a negotiated frontier; for instance, that where on the Kerry Mountain there is a deflection which gives no advantage of line to the Dyke, this is to be interpreted as the acceptance of the claim of the King of Powys to the land on the western slopes of the hill. A sharp kink on Rushock Hill in the general line, off that followed by the designer for tactical reasons, is interpreted that it was agreed that the boundary should pass through the highest point of the hill; the designer fulfilled the letter of the law, but allowed it to interfere as little as possible with the line he considered suitable. From the types of alignment within the grand design, the nature of the country traversed is deduced. Type III 'sensitive to the relief of the countryside' is sufficiently obvious, though not everyone would have phrased it so felicitously. But the distinction between Type I, straight between two mutually visible points, and Type II, sinuous, but no great divergence between the two sighting points, is of great interest. Fox shows that Type I occurs in cleared ground and Type II in ground which on other criteria can be deduced as forest, the distinction even being so exact as to show that often the south-facing slopes of valleys had been cleared while the north-facing slopes had not. From such interpretations and those of the type of earthwork he is able in many areas to work out a picture of the extent

of Anglian penetration and clearance, which conforms very well with other criteria of place-names, literary evidence such as Domesday Book, and physiographical facts. It is an enthralling narrative of brilliant development of field-survey to its logical conclusion.

Perhaps the most interesting section is that dealing with the Dyke in the Herefordshire Plain and Gloucestershire. The Dyke is here only found in a number of widely separated sections. Fox, with a rigid examination of any wishful thinking about possible hollows and banks, in the light of the principles governing the design of the Dyke which he had learnt from his earlier years of survey, is able to show that the Dyke is still complete as constructed. Heavy 'damp oakwood' forest made the Dyke unnecessary and even impossible for those areas where it is not found, and the course of Anglian penetration can be deduced from the areas where it is found. The numerous Iron Age hill-forts in the neighbourhood, though having no significance in connection with the Dyke, demonstrate the fact that the area was also a border zone between lowland and highland cultures in the period of the advance of the Iron Age Celts. In this connection the reviewer might add that it is worth noting that in the intervening period of some nine centuries the frontier had advanced some seven miles; in the Iron Age it can be shown that it lay between Sutton Walls and Credenhill, perhaps in the Lugg valley. In the 8th century Offa's Dyke was constructed three miles west of Credenhill. The southernmost end of the Dyke, along the precipitous scarp of the Wye Valley, is interpreted as further evidence of the establishment of the frontier by agreement. The Welsh were allowed to control both banks of the Wye up to the tidal limit, owing to their prescriptive right to the sea-borne track in this area.

This book is not one which can be reviewed easily or quickly. This is not because, as the author modestly suggests, it is 'tedious to read'. It is because if one attempts to skip or skim one misses the details of meticulous survey and interpretation which are so fascinating and so vital. The whole undertaking can best be summarised in the author's words: 'No finer experience can fall to the lot of the field archaeologist than thus to expose the fundamental technique of a monumental work of thought and ingenuity, hidden from man's minds for a thousand years'. This admirable volume enables the reader to share the experience with the author.

K. M. KENYON

CAERNARVONSHIRE, VOLUME I, EAST; THE CANTREF OF ARLECHWEDD AND THE COMMOTE OF CREUDDYN. A SURVEY AND INVENTORY BY THE ROYAL COMMISSION ON ANCIENT AND HISTORICAL MONUMENTS IN WALES AND MONMOUTHSHIRE. Pp. lxxviii and 215, 14 maps, 100 plates, and numerous figures and plans, 1956. Her Majesty's Stationery Office. Price 65s.

The present volume is the first of three which will cover the county of Caernarvon. It is expected that the publication of the series will be completed by 1960, and it is stated in the introductory note that all detailed discussion of the archaeological and historical settings and of the typology of the various structures described will be relegated to the third volume. Thus in all but a few matters it is an inventory pure and simple.

By far the greater part of the area dealt with lies above the 1,000 foot contour. It is a land with few natural advantages and at all periods before the 19th century much of its population has been confined to the lower slopes of the Carnedd Llewelyn massif fronting the sea and the west side of the lower Conway valley. Some river valleys like those of the Llugwy and the Ogwen also have their modest quota, but before the beginning of the quarrying industry and tourist traffic the pattern of human life in relation to the land changed little in four thousand years.

In prehistoric times by far the most important subject dealt with is the Graig Lwyd group of stone axe factories grouped round Penmaen-mawr where the intrusion of several igneous masses of Silurian age into the Ordovician shales of the area have produced a fine-textured, pale, bluish-grey rock. Its easy flaking properties combined with its hardness and durability were early recognised and led to its exploitation by late Neolithic

people of the Peterborough and Grooved Ware tradition. A trade resulted which produced a distribution of axes made of this material from North Wales by way of the Severn Valley to Wessex and the Channel coast. A full account of the industry in its local setting and of its area of influence in Britain is one of the most valuable features of this volume.

The other prehistoric features of the area are described as they appear and discussion has been postponed. It is sufficiently obvious that the various megalithic structures belonging to the Neolithic-Bronze Age transition are conditioned in their distribution by the centres of the Graig Lwyd industry; and the cairns and tumuli, most of which probably belong to the Bronze Age, call for no particular comment. The remains of round huts, both singly and in groups, occur in large numbers on the northern margin of the area overlooking the sea, but nothing definite is known of their age except that, if experience in other parts of the county is any guide, some of them were probably occupied as late as the Roman period. There are several notable hill-forts of the Iron Age, and one, Pen-y-Gaer, exhibits the rare feature of a defence by *chevaux de frise*.

The only important Roman features in a very poor area are the forts at Caerhun and Bryn-y-Gefeiliu, and the survival of monuments referable to the Dark Ages is almost confined to the group of inscribed stones at Penmachno. The distribution of the long huts which are probably referable to the whole period between the Dark Ages and early modern times is very similar to that of the round huts of prehistory, except that there is a greater degree of inland penetration up all the lesser river valleys.

The second major feature of the volume is the full description of the castle and walled town of Conway erected by Edward I between 1283 and 1288 to consolidate the conquest of North Wales. All later architecture, whether church or secular, is essentially that of a backward region and calls for little comment here.

The volume is provided with a wealth of excellent plates, but the numerous plans which illustrate the inventory, though adequate, are often spoiled by inelegant lettering and indifferent draughtsmanship.

It also lacks the relevant section of the 1 inch Ordnance Survey map showing the physical features and modern topography of the area. Various distribution maps in the text and end-paper line maps showing cantrefs, commotes, and parishes require this to give them more point, and the general reader would gain much by its presence.

C. W. PHILLIPS.

THE COUNTY OF ROXBURGH. ROYAL COMMISSION ON THE ANCIENT MONUMENTS OF SCOTLAND.
Her Majesty's Stationery Office. 2 vols., Pp. xxxi + 506, Pls. CVIII. 1956.
Price £5 5s. 0d.

'An outstanding feature of the present Inventory', write the Commissioners, 'is the large number of monuments that are recorded for the first time'. These are mainly early inhabited sites, of which the group of Early Iron Age palisaded structures is the most notable, and forts. In detecting and establishing this new material air photography has played a large part, and this volume may be taken as a striking demonstration of its possibilities. Certainly a wide range of new data has been made available. The best known and most striking monuments remain, however, the three abbeys, Kelso, Jedburgh, and Melrose, all of them foundations of David I, and two of them still, in their extant parts, largely 12th century work. Of the best preserved, Jedburgh, the Inventory provides a detailed account illustrated with a large selection of photographs. Kelso presents a more difficult problem, for the east end is built over, and only the western tower and transepts remain. For knowledge of its plan, an unusual one in Scotland (with western and eastern transepts with central and western towers), we still have to rely on a document of 1517 in the Vatican Archives, printed by Theiner in the *Vetera Monumenta Hibernorum et Scotorum*, of which a long extract is given here in translation. The Inventory discounts the similarities of the west front to that of Ely and suggests that 'Kelso is the earlier structure of the two' and that its 'prototype is probably to be sought in Rhenish Romanesque work'. The descriptive nature of the Inventory's task leaves these as

tantalisingly unsupported statements, but the analysis provided opens up new possibilities of stylistic comparison and of tracing the connections of the giant order in the choir arcade at Jedburgh and the highly ornamented west end of Kelso. No such full and careful account of these two ruins has previously been made.

For Melrose some use has been made of Dr. James Curle's earlier researches, but the photographing of the ruins has been carried out in great detail, and the reproductions of the bosses and remarkable nave figure sculpture are the best hitherto available of these exceedingly rare pieces of Scottish medieval figure carving. Melrose had a history of constant destruction in Anglo-Scottish warfare, but part of it was preserved in post-Reformation times as a parish church, and in 1810, when the church was transferred, already the romantic spell was some protection to the ruins: the *Lay of the Last Minstrel* had appeared in 1805, and many were anxious to 'view fair Melrose aright'.

The Commissioners have at their discretion included in this volume several buildings subsequent to 1707. One of these is naturally Abbotsford, of which a plan and several photographs are provided, though, in accordance with the tradition of the Inventories, more space is given to the earlier and inscribed stones which Scott incorporated in the structure than to Blore's design and its gradual development in the two building stages of 1818 and 1824. Playfair's remodelling of Floors Castle (1838-49), one of the most elaborate of Jacobean revival buildings, is also included. The growing interest in 19th century architecture and the passage of time thus receive some recognition. The production of the volumes maintains the high level set by previous Inventories.

T. S. R. BOASE

INVENTORY OF BRITISH COIN HOARDS, A.D. 600-1500. By J. D. A. THOMPSON,
Spink for the British Numismatic Society. Price 35s.

Analysis of hoards plays an important part in North European numismatics, dogged as it has been by ignorance—avaricious ignorance or just crass ignorance, such as recently threw Anglo-Saxon pennies on the fire as dirty 'milk-tickets'! In Mediterranean, and particularly Graeco-Roman numismatics, the discipline could be inestimably more rewarding, but the local ignorance and greed are even worse. Mr. Thompson here describes some 400 hoards, mostly published previously, anywhere from the *Numismatic Chronicle* to 18th century local newspapers, and nearly always inadequately, even by the better standards of the day of their discovery. Mr. Thompson cloaks them all in decent uniform.

Besides the Inventory proper, there is a long introduction and a valuable series of plates depicting not coins but objects associated with them, mainly jewellery and pottery or metal containers. Again most are already somewhere in print. But who would look in a numismatic periodical for those precious absolutely datable medieval pots? Let him remember that they are in this book, many drawn in section by the able hands of Mr. Warhurst and Miss Meikle. Had they all been preserved or drawn there could have been at least twice as many. Metalwork, much of it *hacksilber*, cut up for scrap and perhaps old when buried, is of less stratigraphic value to the field archaeologist, but since the goldsmith's craft reflects current fashions in other arts better than the potter's, again these precisely dated pieces are invaluable.

It was not the plates alone, fine as they are, that won the book a substantial subsidy from the C.B.A. The same use of statistical and distributive analysis qualifies the numismatist both as an archaeologist—that is a student of artifacts—and as a documentary historian. Since the subject is that branch of numismatics that most impinges on other studies, it was well chosen as the first of a projected series of B.N.S. monographs. Yet, though doubly backed by quasi-official bodies, the book was in no sense commissioned. It represents years of patient compilation by Mr. Thompson, untrammelled by over-pressing routine duties or the inexorable time-limit of a thesis. Without such sponsors it could perhaps never have been published at all, yet one may justly ask whether it quite reaches the exigent standards this sponsorship should imply—

whether, even after such a leisurely growth, it is quite finished. Unwillingly one must answer, No.

New hoards, of course, may appear at any moment. This is incalculable. But during the last few years Mr. Dolley and others have been reconstructing many hoards discovered long ago, yet still recognisable by old catalogue entries and by the peculiar common patina that each hoard acquires. These would have been worth waiting for. Even apart from these Mr. Thompson has missed a few hoards, the most surprising, which includes jewellery as well as 15th-century groats, being in the very Ashmolean Museum where he works, only not in the coin room. Nor are his references, full as they are, without minor faults—venial, but irritating, and worth the little extra time to avoid. On the other hand, he has amended and rationalised innumerable obsolete descriptions.

The scope of the book allows for certain radical improvements which might shape a later edition. The area covered is unexceptionable. Throughout the period Britain (together with Ireland and Man, which are included, though the title might not imply it) used, or at least aimed at, a uniform standard, Scotland gradually dropping out towards the end. At no period are foreign coins at all numerous in the hoards, except deliberate imitations of English pence. At several periods English coins are very numerous in Scandinavian and German hoards; Britain was in fact a source of silver.

The period covered is much more questionable. Coins have their own eras. Undoubtedly the early 7th century is one, for then (*pace* a few enthusiasts) a money economy was just reasserting itself in Britain after a gap of at least 150 years. But the British numismatic Middle Ages ended with Henry VIII's debasement in the 1540's. 1500 represents nothing except a miscalculation by Dionysius Exiguus. Likewise it is as misleading to end the 'Edwardian' period of coinage in 1377 as to end the 'Decorated' in architecture in that year. Both should end earlier.

Perhaps the most fundamental criticism concerns the classification of hoards. This is of course touched on in the introduction, but finds little place in the inventory. Hoards are of three types:—(a) Hoards proper, buried in the area of currency with intent to recover. These tell us what was used and where. (b) Loot, deposited by raiders, Vikings for instance, at their faring's end or intercepted on the way. It tells us of their movements, but it is unsafe to regard the coins as of more than bullion value in the place of deposit. (c) Grave-deposits, ornaments or offerings, reflecting a practice obsolescent in our period and, with the exception of Sutton Hoo, generally small and not necessarily fresh. These last are very irregularly represented in the book. Possibly they should not have appeared at all. One or two of the so-called hoards read like collections of casual finds. In any case, particularly in the Saxon period, classification is essential and the first distribution-map is nearly valueless without it.

Let this not deter archaeologists from making the maximum use of a valuable instrument, nor those familiar with the coins from the vicarious excitement of contemplating a miscellaneous deposit.

S. E. RIGOLD.

CORPUS VITREARUM MEDII AEVI (SCHWEIZ, BAND 1). DIE GLASMALEREIEN DER SCHWEIZ VOM 12. BIS ZUM BEGINN DES 14. JAHRHUNDERTS. By ELLEN BEER. Pp. 140, figs. 43, Pls. 113 (9 in colour). Basle, Birkhäuser, 1956. Price 50 Swiss Fr.

We may hail the publication of the first volume of the *Corpus Vitrearum Medii Aevi* as a momentous event in our sphere of learning. As the title shows, the treasure of European stained glass will at last be open to all students in the form of an illustrated inventory conducted on uniform lines. This great enterprise was launched in 1949 by three well known scholars, Professor Hans Hahnloser, the present Rector of the University of Bern, Professor Marcel Aubert (Paris) and Professor Johnny Roosval (Stockholm), within the frame of the International Committee of the History of Art, under the patronage of the International Academical Union and with the support of Unesco. A national committee has been formed in each country concerned. The medieval windows of England

will be published under the direction of Professor Francis Wormald. A French and a German volume are already in the press.

It was but natural that the *Corpus* should make its first appearance in Switzerland under the signature of a young and distinguished pupil of Professor Hahnloser. Dr. Ellen Beer has already given us a dissertation on the rose window of Lausanne cathedral,¹ in which the illuminating idea is put forward that such round openings served the purpose of introducing into the province of art the 'schemes of ideas' (*Begriffsschemata*) dear to scholastic philosophers and divines. Indeed, the diagrammatic illustrations of certain medieval treatises do evince quite a striking correspondence with gothic rose windows. Her book forms so to speak the groundwork of the present volume, for the rose of Lausanne is by far the most important monument of glass painting in Switzerland prior to the 14th century, which will provide material for the second instalment.

Dr. Beer very aptly reconstructs the rose in its original state as a *Mirror of the World* with representations of the Year, Night and Day, the Sun and Moon, the Four Elements with the corresponding 'Arts of Divining',² the Four Rivers of Paradise, the Four Seasons, the Twelve Months and their Signs, the monsters which live in the most remote parts of the earth, and the Eight Winds.

Such an iconography goes back to Antiquity and some of the figures at Lausanne (*Luna* for instance) still bear the stamp of Greco-Roman art. It is obvious that the Carolingian manuscripts, of which Dr. Beer has made a special study, were laid under contribution. Yet the rose of Lausanne is no lagging pastiche: closely related to the windows of Laon, Braine, and Soissons, it distinctly belongs to a school which prospered in northern France during the first third of the 13th century. It was almost certainly painted by Master Peter of Arras, whose name has survived in Chapter records.³

The scope of the work also includes the well-known romanesque *Virgin and Child* from Flums, which underwent a perfectly useless and deplorable 'restoration' when it was assigned to the Swiss National Museum at Zurich;⁴ a *Head of Christ* in the same museum, new by a good half but which the author nevertheless succeeds in linking with the art of Strasbourg, like the unassuming subjects and ornament in the tracery lights of the cloister at Wettingen about which Dr. Beer rightly says 'their importance is chiefly of an historical kind';⁵ and the plain glazing and beautiful fragments of grisailles in Sion cathedral and the pitiable panels from Nendaz (Haut-Valais) now in the Historical Museum at Basle and the Town Hall at Solothurn. I have always thought that the faces had been repainted; if they are genuine, they must be ascribed to a Savoyard dauber.

The windows of the Commandery church of Munchenbuchsee were made at the beginning of the 14th century by two men; 'a local painter working in close connection with Wettingen', and a young master established at Zurich or Constance, who practised the new art flourishing at Strasbourg 'under French and English influences'. Those

¹ *Die Rose der Kathedrale von Lausanne und der kosmologische Bilderkreis des Mittelalters*, Bern, 1952.

² *Aerimancia, Pyromancia, Geomancia and Hydromancia*, of which only the first two have escaped destruction.

³ In 1231 St. Bonifatius of Brussels became bishop of Lausanne after teaching philosophy in Paris and at Cologne. It is very tempting to set him down for the inspirer of such a characteristic window. The only objection seems to be the short lapse of time between his election and the fire of 1235 which must have exhausted the means of the fabric for some years, and also the sharp conflict into which his zeal for reform immediately brought him with the Chapter.

⁴ In Dr. Beer's opinion, it was painted in the last years of the 12th century, probably at Constance.

⁵ Two small panels of the end of the 13th century in the castle of La Sarraz (Vaud) seem to have escaped Dr. Beer's notice. They represent the *Flagellation of Our Lord* and the donor, "H(enric)us d(omi)n(u)s d'Estavaie" (Estavayer-au-lac). The style distinctly points to Strasbourg, whose area accordingly extended to French speaking districts in the (future) Swiss confederation.

windows are indeed important and interesting in many respects. They bring the sum of reproduced panels up to seventy at the outside.¹

If one considers that each volume of the *Corpus* of the other countries will have to deal with *several hundreds of panels*, it will be readily understood that Dr. Beer holds up a model to her foreign colleagues which they will be unable to follow, much to their regret.

Her learned and extensive analyses of iconography and style will have to be replaced by brief statements, without the support of the wealth of comparative illustrations that we have in the present case.

Plates and letterpress alike do high credit to the Swiss publisher, who has successfully solved the difficult problem of colour reproduction.

JEAN LAFOND

KING'S COLLEGE CHAPEL, ABERDEEN: ITS FITTINGS, ORNAMENTS, AND CEREMONIAL IN THE SIXTEENTH CENTURY. By F. C. EELES. Oliver and Boyd, 1956. Price 30s.

The Chapel of King's College in the University of Aberdeen was erected between 1500 and 1505 and is still in use. It is, as the late Dr. Eeles has said in the introduction to this book, one of the outstanding examples of medieval architecture and art in Scotland: not only that, it is the only college chapel in Britain which retains its original Gothic screens and choir stalls.

Documentary sources of information, all too scarce in Scotland, have happily survived to increase its interest. An Inventory of 1542 briefly describes its many movable possessions, such as vessels, vestments, bells, books, and a great iron clock with its iron mallet for striking the hours. Two foundation charters contain directions for ceremonial and liturgy and much other information about collegiate establishments and what could be expected of them in discipline and duty in the 16th century. The translation and exposition of these documents is the main purpose of this book.

At the invitation of the University Court, Dr. Eeles has made an ecclesiastical study of the Chapel and translated the Inventory anew. He gives a learned commentary on it and suggests it may have begun with Boëce, who died in 1536. The Latin text, his translation, and commentary, can conveniently be read together. The two foundation charters, of 1494/5 and 1529, are published with full translations (for the first time) by Dr. Gordon Donaldson, with a commentary on their liturgical rules by Dr. Eeles. To complete the history there is an account of the Aberdeen Breviary, a list of enriched sacrament houses, a complete photographic record of the stalls and misericords (in commendable detail) a selection of carefully made rubbings of old graffiti on this woodwork, and a folding plan of the building. A memoir of Dr. Eeles by his secretary gives a long and useless bibliography. It would be fitting to rewrite this.

STEWART CRUDEN

¹ Under these conditions, the author could have bestowed more attention and space upon the *Life of St. John the Baptist* which was removed from the rose of Lausanne by the restorer. Only three medallions have been reproduced and studied. It must be confessed that the others are in a bad state of preservation. Yet it would have been worth while to show the medallion representing the *Sanctuary of the Temple*, with the seven-branched candlestick, for one of the cherubim is a wonderful Byzantine figure. As regards the two heads which led Rahn to think of *Saint Peter and St. John at*

the Sepulchre, they are mere stop-gaps, but excellent specimens of 13th-century painting. A reproduction would have conclusively shown that nothing remains at Lausanne of a "*Passionszyklus*".

The rather naïve opinion (about the hair garment of the Baptist) ascribed to me on p. 59 obviously derives from a hasty reading of the *Congrès archéologique de France*, Lausanne 1953, p. 131. On the other hand, the Clermont-Ferrand glass which I alluded to (p. 131) are 12th-century panels inserted in the windows of St. Anne's chapel.

ENGLISH ART 1625-1714 (THE OXFORD HISTORY OF ENGLISH ART, VOL. VIII). By MARGARET WHINNEY and OLIVER MILLAR. Pp. 391, Pls. XCVII, figs. 10. Oxford: Clarendon Press. Price 50s.

This book is distinguished from the others in the series so far published by being a work of collaboration, and if something has been lost in unity of approach there was perhaps no choice before the Editor, for the studies of architectural history and of 17th-century portraiture have both become so highly specialised in the course of this century. Apart from this loss the results of collaboration are in themselves interesting, rather than important, as showing differences of personal approach and experience, and the book is well balanced in the amount of space allotted to the different arts. The sections on sculpture especially, are something new; here is a real attempt to discuss this question chronologically and with as much fullness as it deserves, although perhaps a little more might have been said about the great tombs of the end of the period, such as those at Wanstead, Badminton and Durisdeer, which represent the culmination of the Baroque tomb in England.

The architectural part is, as members of the Royal Archaeological Institute can readily believe, especially distinguished for its lucidity and balance, for no scholar has the intricate problems of this subject more completely at her finger ends than Dr. Whinney. Indeed, the possible criticisms of this part of the book are rather in the nature of enjoyable points for discussion. One of these is that too much space is given to Archbishop Laud and all that, whereas Clare College, Cambridge, and the Fellows' Building of Christ's College, are hardly mentioned, but this can easily be explained by reference to the general title of the series. Of the detail points about which it would be pleasant to argue at length, one is the statement that the long low proportions of the Queen's House at Greenwich represent an English and medieval tradition modifying the Italian sources of the design. This was first said by Professor Wittkower, and it is true if we think of English buildings of the 18th century and the villas of Palladio and Scamozzi. But as Professor Wittkower says in the same place, the Queen's House derives in plan from the Medici Villa at Poggio a Caiano, and if the motif of the Villa Molini (used for the Park front of Queen's House) was to be adapted to the Poggio a Caiano plan it had to take on a longer and lower proportion. The long fronts of English Italianate houses are an interesting development; Wilton (especially if Mr. Colvin is right), John Webb's Durham House in the 17th century, and Wanstead and Wentworth Woodhouse in the 18th century are outstanding examples, but Professor Wittkower's remark is one of these generalisations which need a lot of working out. There may well be many factors, social and economic, as well as architectural, which go to explain the long fronted English country house which can hardly be summed up as medieval tradition. Some of them appear to be present in France also. This is really rather a fussy little point. Another is the treatment of Vanbrugh and especially Castle Howard. There may well be a relation between the Castle Howard design and the engraving of the Palace at Mannheim in the *Grand Marot*, which would be a good and likely source for Vanbrugh to use, but the differences seem almost more interesting than the resemblances. The newly-discovered drawings relating to the beginnings of the Castle Howard design hardly seem to have been digested yet either here or in Mr. Whistler's recent book. Indeed, the treatment of both Castle Howard and Blenheim seems rather disappointing.

The treatment of painting is more uneven than Dr. Whinney's contribution. When the author's enthusiasm for a painter or his sense of adventure and discovery is aroused, it is very good and very well written, as in the sections dealing with Van Dyck and Cooper; and the chapter on the odds and ends of landscape, etc., has great charm. On the whole it is difficult to think how the authors could have done the book better.

Of the details of make-up, one can only say that the illustrations are good and on the whole well-chosen, except that the examples of Nicholas Stone's work do him a grave injustice. There should have been more and better text-figures in the architectural part.

G. F. WEBB

JAMES WYATT. By ANTHONY DALE. Pp. 228, Pls. 67, figs. 3. Blackwell, 1956. Price 30s.

Few architects could have been more swayed by fashionable opinion than James Wyatt. His architectural style having changed from the classicism of Chambers to the neo-classicism of the Adams and to the Gothic of Strawberry Hill, he practised at the end of his life a manner which was approaching pure Gothic. It was in the latter style that he displayed real inventiveness, and by so doing laid the foundation for the academic approach to medieval architecture of Pugin and his followers. Although he was not alone in copying the type of decoration invented by the Adams, Wyatt must have been their chief rival, and it is understandable that he would be accused of plagiarism. One cannot ignore these sides of his character when considering what part he took in the treatment of Lichfield, Salisbury, Hereford, and Durham Cathedrals. On Wyatt's shoulders must rest the responsibility for the disastrous alterations to these cathedrals; if he had made any outspoken protest at the suggestions of the cathedral authorities he might have been exonerated. As it was, he condoned them and made equally unsympathetic and ignorant proposals and continued to ignore objections by antiquaries.

Mr. Dale's biography leaves one depressed at Wyatt's conduct, both professionally and in his home. Although he reached the zenith of his profession while still a young man, due to the success of the Pantheon, inefficiency prevented him benefiting from his many commissions; he was as exasperating to his patrons as he was to his family. Although this biography portrays him, broadly speaking, as an unattractive character, it nevertheless shows that he was a considerable designer. He had a particular ability to conceive the correct decorative treatment for large spaces and compartments. The hall at Heveningham, for example, shows a virility not found in Robert Adam's work, and the circular staircase at Devonshire House (since demolished) was one of the great architectural achievements of the early 19th century. These aspects of Wyatt's life are well brought out in Mr. Dale's book. Credit must be given to the author for being able to mingle, without disturbing the sequence of the biography, various events in Wyatt's life, such as the controversy over his election to the Society of Antiquaries, with the factual account of his architectural works. The most regrettable omission in this book is a bibliography, including a list of sources where illustrations to the buildings mentioned in the text could be found. Without such a reference, a total of under seventy plates is quite inadequate to illustrate the whole of Wyatt's output. It was wrong to include two portraits of Wyatt and yet have no illustration of the interior of Fonthill. One cannot believe that the balustrade and handrail to the staircase at Stoke Poges Park (plates 5 and 28), which appear to be comparatively modern, are in fact by Wyatt. In addition there are some editorial mistakes: in two cases the orientation of buildings is incorrectly described, and a plate is wrongly referred to in the text. It is also curious that only two plans were printed. The value of this book is, however, considerable as it presents a clear and readable account of Wyatt's life and work. From it one can begin to assess his stature as an architect, and it is unfortunate that the two greatest of his works, on which one might have passed judgment, are no more. If the Pantheon and Fonthill still existed it is possible that Wyatt would be numbered as one of the most imaginative of English architects.

DENYS SPITTLE

THE DRAINING OF THE FENS. By H. C. DARBY, Professor of Geography in the University of London. Pp. 314; Pls. XXXI, 36 maps and diagrams. 2nd edition. Cambridge University Press. Price 35s.

The appearance of a second edition of this standard work calls for little more than a tribute to its permanent value. In its first sixteen years the book has worn remarkably well and little has been changed.

For the archaeologist the interest of its story centres in the long drawn out conflict between navigation and agriculture, a conflict in which agriculture gradually came out on

top. In the Middle Ages, and substantially up to the end of the Tudor period, navigation was primary. Thereafter, first under the Stuarts, and later with the aid of the windmill and then the steam engine, drainage—previously sporadic—was concerted; and commerce, pushed further and further down stream, was reduced almost to vanishing point. Peat shrinkage, for a long time unrecognised, by lowering the fen level precipitated more and more drastic action (it also increased the agricultural potential by making clay subsoils more accessible), until today the fen-dweller who wants to see a ship must go to the Wash to see it. Yet in 1824 the *Cambridge Chronicle* records the inauguration of a paddle steamer service between Cambridge and Lynn. So swift has been the pace of change within the last few generations.

Field work endorses many of Professor Darby's findings. A study of their sites suggests that many religious foundations prior to the dissolution engaged in water-borne trade. The 17th century accounts of Pembroke College encourage the suspicion that this may have been true of at least one house of study, perhaps from its inception. The interest taken by London merchants in fen-side developments seems to be confirmed by the arms and emblems of the Drapers' Company which appear on the 15th-century west door of Over church. Substantial remains at Isleham Hall, Parsonage Farm Burwell, Swaffham Commercial End, and doubtless elsewhere, are conclusive evidence for the wholesaling activities of the secular magnates of post-Reformation times.

The progressive encroachment on village fishing and fowling, and their virtual extinction in the mass enclosures of the early 19th century, are a side-effect to which Professor Darby does full justice. The lay-out of a village like Burwell seems to reflect the extent of these activities. They are epitomised in the medieval fowler (*c.* 1400) with his cloak, stilts and dog who adorns one of the north side stalls at Balsham church.

PETER EDEN