

PROCEEDINGS
of the
Society of Antiquaries
of Scotland



Volume 125
(1995)

*

National Museums of Scotland
York Buildings
Queen Street · Edinburgh

EDITORIAL BOARD 1994-5

<i>Editor</i>	Humphrey Welfare, BA MPhil FSA FSA Scot MIFA
<i>Joint Editor for Volume 125</i>	Anna Ritchie, BA PhD FSA FSA Scot
<i>Editorial Board</i>	J N Graham Ritchie, MA MBA PhD FSA FSA Scot (<i>Convener</i>) Iain G Brown, MA PhD FSA FRSA FSA Scot George Dalglish, MA FSA Scot Doreen Grove, BA FSA Scot George Haggarty, FSA Scot Roderick McCullagh, BA Dip Arch Sci FSA Scot Ann MacSween, MA MA PhD FSA Scot AIFA Gordon S Maxwell MA FSA PSA Scot Athol L Murray, MA PhD LLB FRHistS FSA Scot Alan Saville, BA FSA FSA Scot MIFA
<i>Indexer</i>	Elizabeth Fowler, MA BLitt FSA Scot
<i>Editorial Consultant</i>	Duncan McAra, SBStJ Dip Pub FSA Scot

Where indicated, maps have been based upon Ordnance Survey mapping with the permission of The Controller of HMSO. © Crown Copyright 82871M

ISSN 0081-1564

Produced by Sutton Publishing Limited, Phoenix Mill, Thrupp, Stroud, Gloucestershire GL5 2BU
Printed in Great Britain by Butler and Tanner, Frome, Somerset

Table of Contents

Note: 'f' appended to page number indicates that part of the report is on microfiche in the envelope at the back of the volume.

Page

xi	EDITORIAL
xiii	OBITUARY Eric Birley
	ARTICLES AND REPORTS
1f	Historic Scotland's Backlog Project and the Projects Database Gordon J Barclay & Olwyn Owen
9	The excavation of a Neolithic and Iron Age settlement at Wardend of Durris, Aberdeenshire C J Russell-White
29	Excavation of a Neolithic enclosure and an Iron Age settlement at Douglasmuir, Angus Jill Kendrick
69	The excavation of Neolithic, Bronze Age and Early Historic features near Ratho, Edinburgh Andrea N Smith
139f	Carn Dubh, Moulin, Perthshire: survey and excavation of an archaeological landscape 1987–90 J S Rideout
197f	The excavation of a kerbed cairn at Beech Hill House, Coupar Angus, Perthshire Sylvia Stevenson
237	Two Orcadian cist burials: excavations at Midskaill, Egilsay, and Linga Fiold, Sandwick Hazel Moore & Graeme Wilson
253f	Excavation of a cairn at Cnip, Uig, Isle of Lewis Joanna Close-Brooks
279f	A cist burial adjacent to the Bronze Age cairn at Cnip, Uig, Isle of Lewis A J Dunwell, T Neighbour & T G Cowie
289	The excavation of three cairns at Stoneyburn Farm, Crawford, Lanarkshire, 1991 Iain Banks

- 345 Middle Bronze Age dirks and rapiers from Scotland: some finds old and new
Brendan O'Connor & Trevor Cowie
- 369 Excavation at Lintshie Gutter Unenclosed Platform Settlement, Crawford, Lanarkshire, 1991
John Terry
- 429f The Iron Age in Shetland: excavations at five sites threatened by coastal erosion
Stephen P Carter, Roderick P J McCullagh & Ann MacSween
- 483f Excavations of an enclosure system at Rough Castle, Falkirk
Ian D Máté
- 499 Westerton: a Roman watchtower on the Gask frontier
W S Hanson & J G P Friell
- 521f Excavations at Inveravon on the Antonine Wall, 1991
Andrew Dunwell & Ian Ralston
- 577 The Antonine frontier in Callendar Park, Falkirk: its form and structural sequence
G B Bailey
- 601 Some excavations on the line of the Antonine Wall 1985–93
L J F Keppie, G B Bailey, A J Dunwell, J H McBrien & K Speller
- 673 Some possible dating evidence for a souterrain near Alyth, Perthshire
Alan Small & J D Bateson
- 677 The ogham-inscribed spindle whorl from Buckquoy: evidence for the Irish language in pre-Viking Orkney?
Katherine Forsyth
- 697f Excavations at Sueno's Stone, Forres, Moray
R P J McCullagh
- 719f A Viking Age cemetery at Cnip, Uig, Isle of Lewis
A J Dunwell, T G Cowie, M F Bruce, T Neighbour & A R Rees
- 753 A traveller's end? – an associated group of Early Historic artefacts from Carronbridge, Dumfries & Galloway
Olwyn Owen & Richard Welander
- 771 A hoard of Hiberno-Viking arm-rings, probably from Scotland
James Graham-Campbell & John Sheehan
- 779f The excavation of a cemetery and putative chapel site at Newhall Point, Balblair, Ross & Cromarty, 1985
David Reed

793	Jedburgh Abbey church: the Romanesque fabric Malcolm Thurlby
813	Towards an architectural history of Kilwinning Abbey J Philip McAleer
881	Archaeological excavations at Cockpen medieval parish church, Midlothian, 1993 Jerry O’Sullivan
901	Lion hunt: a royal tomb-effigy at Arbroath Abbey G S Gimson
917	Four excavations in Perth, 1979–84 David Bowler, Adrian Cox & Catherine Smith
1001	Medieval features and finds from Balfarg/Balbirnie, Fife C J Russell-White
1023	Excavations at the former Lauder Technical College, Dunfermline John Lewis
1045f	Abbey, market and cemetery: topographical notes on Coupar Angus in Perthshire, with a description of archaeological excavations on glebe land by the parish church Jerry O’Sullivan
1069	Craignethan: the castle of the Bastard of Arran Charles McKean
1091	Excavations on Dundee Law, 1993 Stephen T Driscoll
1109	Excavations at Balgonie Castle, Markinch, Fife R S Will & T N Dixon
1119	Excavations at Hillslap Tower, Roxburghshire, 1983–4 John Cannel & John Lewis
1131	Tobacco pipemakers in 17th-century Stirling Dennis B Gallagher & John Harrison
1143	Preserving the Bishop’s Castle, Glasgow, 1688–1741 Athol L Murray
1163	The Piper to the Laird of Grant Hugh Cheape
1175	The Marchmont or St Ronan’s Arrow John Burnett & George R Dalglish

1187	A medal of the Newtongrange Lothian Cricket Club, 1887 John Burnett
1193	LECTURE SUMMARIES
1201	MEETINGS OF THE SOCIETY, 1994–5
1213	INSTRUCTIONS FOR CONTRIBUTORS
1215	INDEX

Society of Antiquaries of Scotland Council 1994–95

President

Gordon S Maxwell, MA FSA

Vice-Presidents

Charles J Burnett, KStJ DA AMA FSA

Ross Herald of Arms

Barbara E Crawford, MA PhD FSA

Naomi E A Tarrant, BA AMA

Treasurer

Alan Saville, BA FSA MIFA

Editor

Humphrey Welfare, BA MPhil FSA MIFA

Councillors

George Dalglish, MA

Professor Michael Lynch, MA PhD FRHistS

Ann MacSween, MA MA PhD AIFA

Peter Yeoman, MA MIFA

Nicholas Dixon, MA PhD

Doreen Grove, BA

Colin C Richards, BA PhD

Neil G Taverner, BDS

Valerie E Dean

John S Dent, BA MPhil FSA MIFA

Jane M S Durham, MBE

Michael D King, MA AMA

Ex Officio

Chairman of North East Section
Publications Convener

Elizabeth Curtis, MA
J N Graham Ritchie, MA MBA PhD FSA

Research Convener
Finance & Administration Convener
Heritage Convener
Representative to the Ancient
Monuments Board of Scotland
Representative of the
National Museums of Scotland

Alan Saville, BA FSA MIFA
Humphrey M Holmes, CA
Fionna M Ashmore, BA
W David H Sellar, BA LLB FRHistS

David V Clarke, BA PhD FSA

Director

Fionna M Ashmore, BA

Patron and Honorary Fellows of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland, 1994–95

Patron

HM THE QUEEN

Honorary Fellows

HRH THE DUKE OF ROTHESAY
EMERITUS PROFESSOR LESLIE ALCOCK, OBE MA FSA FRHistS
PROFESSOR BERTIL ALMGREN
DR ROBERT GEOFFREY WILLIAM ANDERSON, BSc MA DPhil FRSC
PROFESSOR ERIC BIRLEY, MBE MA DPhil DLitt FBA FSA
MISS MARION CAMPBELL OF KILBERRY, FSA
RONALD GORDON CANT, MA DLitt FRHistS
(ARKITEKT) HAKON CHRISTIE
DR J-B COLBERT DE BEAULIEU
HOWARD COLVIN, CVP CBE FBA FSA
PROFESSOR ALEXANDER FENTON, CBE MA BA DLitt FRSE FSA
PROFESSOR PIERRE-ROLAND GIOT
MISS AUDREY SHORE HENSHALL, OBE MA FSA
DR ARNE HOFF
DR KRISTIAN KRISTIANSEN
PROFESSOR S J DE LAET
PROFESSOR STUART PIGGOTT, CBE BLitt DLittHum FSA FBA
DR ANTONIE PLĂMĂDEALĂ
PROFESSOR DR HANS SCHÖNBERGER
PROFESSOR AXEL STEENSBERG
DR WILLIAM E TAYLOR
PROFESSOR BRUCE TRIGGER, PhD DSc DLitt FRSC
PROFESSOR J D VAN DER WAALS
PROFESSOR DR W GROENMAN-VAN WAATERINGE

Editorial

These *Proceedings* have been published continuously since 1851 but there has never been an annual volume of such a size as this one. The circumstances are, however, commensurately unusual. Over half of the articles published here stem from the backlog of reports that had built up from the projects financed by Historic Scotland, and by its predecessors, over the last two decades. The introductory paper by Gordon Barclay and Olwyn Owen provides the background to this publicly-funded activity, the results of which should be widely known. In the face of this tidal wave of newly accessible archaeological information, the Publications Committee and the Council of the Society felt that we had a duty to respond, by providing the means to disseminate the results of this excavation and research.

The work financed by Historic Scotland, some of which is published here, covers much of the breadth of the Society's own sphere of interest which was set out, in 1780, in Law 1: 'the study of the antiquities and history of Scotland, more especially by means of archaeological research'. It was an inevitable consequence of this broad canvas that the *Proceedings* should come to be regarded as the national archaeological journal of Scotland. Now, in the 1990s, the Publications Committee hopes that Fellows will agree that the majority of the papers that appear in the *Proceedings* are of national importance – difficult though it is to define such a concept in practical terms – but we are confident that all of the articles that we publish are of national interest. This does not mean that each and every article on a Scottish archaeological subject should be submitted to the *Proceedings*. Regional journals provide the place for topics of regional interest and they are a key factor in the maintenance of a healthy spectrum of archaeological publishing; we wish to see these journals thrive in Scotland, as elsewhere.

Our Fellows are by no means confined to Scotland but are scattered throughout Europe and North America, and across the wider world. (The societies with which we exchange our publications extend this range even farther.) In consequence, the vision of the Publications Committee has been to continue to provide a national journal for Scotland, but also to see the *Proceedings* as a journal with an international role, presenting the particular contribution of Scotland within the archaeology and history of Europe. In pursuit of this, papers that offer an overview of the state of knowledge, on any theme within the Society's sphere, are particularly welcome. Indeed, an element of synthesis and an appreciation of context should be present in any paper accepted for publication. The series of commissioned Review Articles that has appeared in recent volumes has played a major role in advancing our understanding in this way; it is our hope that these wide-ranging syntheses can be reinstated among the contents of each volume once the backlog of reports has been cleared.

The Society is indebted to Historic Scotland for its substantial financial support for the production of this volume, and to the members of its staff (particularly Gordon Barclay, Olwyn Owen, and Patrick Ashmore) who have pursued so assiduously the goal of ensuring that the results of their grant-aided excavations and research could be brought to the point of publication. The editorial work required by the Society to see this volume through the press has demanded far more input than the Editor could cope with alone; much of the effort was put in by Anna Ritchie. Her professional care and diligence in this task have ensured its successful outcome.

Humphrey Welfare

Obituary

Eric Birley

Eric Birley was born at Eccles in Lancashire on 12 January 1906 and was educated at Clifton College and at Brasenose College, Oxford. Here he fell under the spell of R G Collingwood and, as an undergraduate, went to excavate on Hadrian's Wall in 1927. Eric's first dig was at Birdoswald and it was there in 1928 that he learnt that he had obtained a first in Greats. Following graduation he spent a brief period working for the Society of Antiquaries of London, observing construction work in the City of London, before returning north to take up the post of Director of the Durham University Excavation Committee. In 1932 he was elected a Fellow of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland, demonstrating his commitment to Scottish archaeology by compounding for life. In 1980 Eric Birley was elected an Honorary Fellow of the Society.

In 1929 Birley was part of the team excavating at Birdoswald during which two inscriptions were discovered. These two stones (*RIB* 1909 and 1912) led to a re-dating of the Wall periods. Although Simpson was the director of the 1929 excavation, it was Birley who brought the significance of these inscriptions to public attention. His elucidation of the four Wall periods has formed the basis of all subsequent work on the chronology of Hadrian's Wall.

Eric Birley's definition of the Wall periods led to an immediate rejoinder from Sir George Macdonald. Macdonald, then aged 68 and a figure of immense authority, took the 24-year-old to task, chiding him on the accuracy of his scholarship and differing on the interpretation of the evidence relating to the governorship of Julius Verus (AD 155–8). The Hadrian's Wall periods enunciated by Birley in 1930 led the chronology of that frontier out of synchronicity with that proposed by Scottish archaeologists for the Antonine Wall, and that difference was to remain for over 40 years.

The first clash took place in what was to become Birley's home territory, the pages of *Archaeologia Aeliana*, the journal of the Society of Antiquaries of Newcastle upon Tyne, of which Macdonald was an Honorary Fellow. The next was on neutral ground: the *Journal of Roman Studies*. In *The Roman Wall in Scotland*, the second edition of which was published in 1934, Macdonald refined his position on the end of the first occupation of Scotland, placing it about AD 104–6, in the reign of Trajan. Davies Pryce and Eric Birley, using the evidence of samian ware, argued for a date before the end of the first century. In 1937 Macdonald returned to the fray, citing the literary evidence to support his preference for a Trajanic date. The following year, Davies Pryce and Birley brought literary sources, coins, pottery, and the evidence of the structures, to support their view. They failed to persuade Macdonald, as was demonstrated by the final paper in the series which appeared in the *Journal of Roman Studies* in 1939.

In the meantime, Birley and Macdonald had taken up the cudgels about another problem, the date of the end of occupation at the fort at Birrens. The ostensible starting point was Macdonald's discussion of Birrens and the Antonine Itinerary in *The Roman Wall in Scotland*; this had led Birley to start excavating at Birrens in 1936, but I suspect that there was a deeper reason. Since 1930, Birley had extended his views about the Wall periods to other sites, including Corbridge; now he wished to test them on an outpost fort. At Birrens, Birley proved, to his own satisfaction,

that the occupation continued into the third century. Macdonald, reviewing the 1895 excavations as well as those by Birley, preferred an earlier abandonment.

The final score might be rendered one win each, and a draw. All these discussions were about problems which are equally relevant today. It is only with the publication of Hobley's assessment of the coin evidence that we can see that the present evidence suggests a date of about AD 87 for the abandonment of Agricola's conquests, closer to Birley's preferred date than to Macdonald's. On Birrens, Professor Robertson's excavations have supported Macdonald's view. It would be a brave person who believed that the chronology of the second century had been finally determined.

The disputations between Birley and Macdonald ended with the outbreak of war, and with Macdonald's death in 1940. During the 1930s Birley excavated at several sites on or beside Hadrian's Wall, including Vindolanda (he placed the fort in the care of the Office of Works in 1939), the civil settlement at Housesteads, and a number of turrets and milecastles, as well as examining the structure of the Wall itself. After Birrens he excavated at Carzield in 1939 with Ian Richmond. The two also began to re-examine Corbridge, commencing in 1936 a series of excavations which continued (later under John Gillam) until 1973. The reports on these excavations were published regularly in the pages of the local journals and Birley's views were disseminated to a wider audience through his guide-books to Housesteads, Corbridge, and Chesters.

While undertaking a busy excavating programme, Birley was also developing other interests: pottery, epigraphy and the Roman army. The latter two were combined in a paper published in our *Proceedings* in 1936: 'Marcus Cocceius Firmus: an epigraphic study'. He also developed his foreign contacts, visiting the Continent regularly. It was appropriate therefore that he had to be summoned home from Berlin in 1939, ostensibly by a telegram from his wife, but in reality from the War Office.

Birley spent his war service in Military Intelligence. His duties were to examine the careers and promotions of German army officers and to determine and monitor the strength, distribution and movements of the German army. He was head of Military Intelligence Research and ended the War as Chief of the German Military Document Section, with the rank of Lieutenant-Colonel. In an article in the *Evening Standard* (24 November 1995) Milton Shulman recorded that 'Eric Birley was pre-eminent among those who gave our commanders the information needed to defeat Hitler'. After victory, Birley was able to check his figures against the evidence of captured German documents. These demonstrated that his estimate (made in 1940) was correct, even though this was because one division had been destroyed and another, unknown to him, had been formed.

An archaeologist when he left for war in 1939, Birley returned, fortified by his wartime experience, as a brilliant analyst and interpreter of the Roman army and of Roman military affairs. Virtually his only excavation thereafter was the annual training excavation at Corbridge. Birley left the direction of the excavation to his colleagues, concentrating on the finds, samian continuing to be his primary interest.

Birley had been appointed to a lectureship at Armstrong College, then part of the Newcastle division of Durham University, moving to Durham in 1935; he was appointed Reader in Archaeology and Roman Frontier Studies in 1943. There, in 1947, he became Vice-Master of Hatfield College, succeeding as Master in 1949. Hatfield was in dire straits, but Birley turned the situation round, effectively becoming the second founder of the college. He served as Master until 1956 when Durham awarded him a personal chair in Roman-British Archaeology.

It was during his pre-War visits to Germany that Birley had conceived the idea of a meeting of scholars interested in Roman frontiers: the Congress of Roman Frontier Studies. The outbreak

of War was to postpone its inauguration until 1949, when it was held in Newcastle upon Tyne. Sixteen meetings of the Congress have now been held, including the XIIth at Stirling in 1979. The gatherings have met Birley's aims of bringing together scholars to inform their colleagues and to discuss matters of common interest.

Although he operated on a European stage, the archaeology of northern England always claimed much of his attention. He served the Cumberland and Westmorland Society as its Editor for 10 years (1948–57), and during the 1959 Pilgrimage of Hadrian's Wall was President of both the Society of Antiquaries of Newcastle upon Tyne (1957–9) and the Cumberland and Westmorland Antiquarian and Archaeological Society (1957–60). His handbook for the Pilgrimage, delayed owing to problems in the print industry, was to be enlarged into *Research on Hadrian's Wall* (Kendal, 1961). From 1959 to 1963 he was President of the Architectural and Archaeological Society of Durham and Northumberland.



Birley contributed regularly to journals on both sides of the Anglo-Scottish border. Many of these papers were concerned with wider issues, and collections were reprinted in *Roman Britain and the Roman Army* (Kendal, 1953) and *The Roman Army: Collected Papers, 1929–86* (Amsterdam 1988). His interest in Birrens led him to write reports for the Royal Archaeological Institute's summer meeting in Dumfries in 1939 and, more significantly, several papers in the *Transactions of the Dumfriesshire and Galloway Natural History and Antiquarian Society* after 1945. Birley's appreciation of the information that could be gleaned from antiquarian accounts was reflected in his articles on Thomas Pennant and on Sir John Clerk of Penicuik.

A natural teacher, he never taught a first degree in archaeology, but students from History, Classics and general courses all came to do his Roman Britain special subject, which included Roman Provincial Administration. Some stayed on to do research and Birley directed his students to carefully chosen problems. Many aspects of Hadrian's Wall were investigated. Provinces and areas were studied in depth. Particular attention was paid to the Roman army and its officers. Artefacts were not forgotten: Birley encouraged research on samian, coarse ware, mortaria and amphorae. Amateurs were also encouraged and were brought into the department. Colleagues from other disciplines were swept up, particularly at Corbridge. Scholars came from abroad to work in Durham or were encouraged by correspondence. As a result, many came to regard themselves as Birley students. His library, files, and time were freely available to everyone and many a research project started with the gift of a Birley archive. He accomplished more through his pupils than he could possibly have done alone. Eric Birley inspired a strong sense of loyalty and comradeship in his students; this is demonstrated by the number of joint papers which they have written, a remarkable achievement in a discipline which has experienced its own share of argument. Birley students went into universities and colleges, and into the state sector. The latter included Kenneth Steer, lately Secretary of RCAHMS, Iain MacIvor, formerly Chief Inspector of Ancient Monuments, and the present writer.

Eric Birley retired in 1971, but he continued his research, publishing up to 1993. In 1970 he had accepted the post of Chairman of the Vindolanda Trustees and his support for the work at both Vindolanda and Carvoran continued unabated. He also regularly attended meetings of the Congress of Roman Frontier Studies, of which he had been appointed Honorary Life President in 1974.

Appointed MBE in 1943, he was awarded the Polonia Restituta in 1944 and the Légion d'honneur in 1947. He was elected FSA in 1931 and FBA in 1969; he was an Honorary Fellow of this Society, and of Brasenose College; a Vice President of the Society for the Promotion of Roman Studies and of the Yorkshire Architectural and Archaeological Society; a Member of the German Archaeological Institute, and an Honorary Member of Gesellschaft Pro Vindonissa. He was made an honorary Dr Phil at Freiburg University in 1970; honorary DLitt at Leicester in 1971, and Dr, *honoris causa*, at Heidelberg in 1986. His original views of Roman Britain were often at odds with mainstream thought and it is perhaps not surprising that his stature as a scholar was more widely recognised on the Continent than in Britain. In many ways, as an epigraphist-archaeologist, he better fitted the continental pattern of research. Eric Birley had wide interests, but his reputation rests most securely on his work on the Roman army; with his students he created a body of research that is a worthy successor to that of the great Alfred von Domaszewski.

In October 1995 Eric Birley died at Carvoran, also the home of his elder son Robin, and his ashes were buried in the garden at Chesterholm. Birley had married Margaret (Peggy) Goodlet in 1934. He is survived by his wife and their two sons, Robin, Director of the Vindolanda Trust, and Anthony, Professor of Ancient History at Düsseldorf.