

REVIEWS

SIR IAN RICHMOND: *Roman Archaeology and Art, essays and studies by Sir Ian Richmond*. Edited by Dr. P. Salway. Pp. 294, 9 plates, 11 figs. London: Faber and Faber, 1969. Cloth, 70s. £3.50.

These lectures and essays by the late Sir Ian Richmond have been edited by Dr. P. Salway from those which proved to be sufficiently complete for printing. Our thanks are due to those who have charge of the Richmond papers and to the editor and publisher for making the lectures available to a wider public. The Ford Lectures delivered in 1951 at Oxford and the J. H. Gray Lectures in 1952 at Cambridge provide a skilful summary of what could be known at that time but have in part been superseded by further work, notably on the dating of town walls and some pottery re-assessments, and need to be read with caution. Amid his multifarious tasks the author never found time to rewrite portions of his text and provide the necessary notes. Critics should remember that much of Richmond's writing or teaching gave many of them a springboard for further advances.

Four of the papers bear the dates and names of the congress or society to which they were delivered. In 1963, in briefing the members of the Museums Association on the eve of their visit to Hadrian's Wall, he contrasted it with the German, Danubian¹ and North African frontier-systems. Four of the remaining six studies interpret the sculptures and design of a series of important buildings in Rome and

¹ Attention can now be drawn to his stimulating lecture on the Adamklissi monument in *Papers of the British School at Rome XXXV* (1967) 29-39 with 6 plates.

Italy, from the *Ara Pacis Augustae* to the Marcus Aurelius reliefs incorporated chiefly on the Arch of Constantine. Readers will be foolish if they neglect these penetrating studies giving an interplay of metropolitan art and architecture.

The editor has correctly refrained from tampering with Richmond's texts but has not been bold enough in supplying footnotes and directing the reader to subsequent discussions of these problems. He did not follow the advice of Dr. J. C. Mann (see p. 281) who urged him not to print the Ford Lectures, but has done him the disservice of printing his brief notes designed only for the editor's guidance. The editor is unduly optimistic in thinking that the average reader can easily refer to the costly *Bibliography* of Bonser or obtain necessary references "by consulting standard works". He should have shouldered the testing task of supplying ample references, as he did for the sixth Ford Lecture or on papers (8) on the Aurelian panels or (10) on provincial palaces. For paper (3) on "Roman military engineering" a reference² should have been added to Richmond's *locus classicus* on the army. It is regrettable that most of the plates concentrate on Aosta and give the impression that they were taken with a poor lens or snapped without placing the camera on a tripod. The author was meticulous in these matters and leave could have been obtained to reproduce a telling selection of his excellent photographs.

A few themes may be picked out in what can be only a personal selection. On p. 76 Richmond shows that the Pennine caves were more than refuges and gave shelter from the weather to adjacent villagers. In the second Gray Lecture he analyses the different forms of village settlement and sees how they met the geological conditions. In the third lecture in a survey of the social centres and cults he produces an instructive kaleidoscope. Despite the short-

² *Papers of the British School at Rome* XIII, 1-40 "Trajan's army on Trajan's Column."

comings cited above, the book³ remains a notable contribution.

R. P. WRIGHT

J. C. Mann (ed.) *The Northern Frontier in Britain from Hadrian to Honorius: literary and epigraphic sources*, 41 pp., 8/-.

"The aim of this collection is to assemble, as fully as possible, the literary and epigraphic evidence which provides the essential chronological framework for the history of the northern frontier in Britain." If indeed this were all that this little book offered us it would still be of inestimable value.

However, no such collection is a simple assembling of data, useful though that assembling is. The attribution of a literary or epigraphic source to a reign or a period within a reign often requires the acceptance or rejection of a reading, a restoration, an attribution. Dr. Mann tells us that his texts, readings and translations are his own, judged according to their acceptability to a trained historian well skilled in epigraphy. In days when archaeologists increasingly have no such background and familiarity and take much necessarily on trust, Dr. Mann's cool appraisal of the validity of currently accepted interpretations is of particular value.

There is not enough space to attempt a study of all Dr. Mann's quiet rejections, but notice the effect on the Brigantian "revolt" of the 150s on the relating of Pausanias to the Lollius Urbicus campaign (extract 40), the placing of the building inscriptions of auxiliaries on the Antonine Wall well away from Iulius Verus (52-54) (with no apologies to the 1964 Horsley lecture), the return to the Haverfield reading of the supposed Mars Ultor stone from Corbridge (65) and, crowning blow, describing Britannia in 155 as merely

³ From texts which did not receive the author's final revision certain slips may be listed, due in part to misreadings by typists: (the correction is given in brackets) (p. 106) Otway (Oxford), (159) ordinate (ordinal), (174) Claire (Clare), (184) eighty (thirty) Roman miles, (195) *dolabrum* (*dolabra*), (195) A.D. 105 (106) (198, 281) Alconetar (Alcantara), (218) A.D. 71 (70), (224) A.D. 70 (69).

“supposedly subdued” (62)! Readers may also like to look in the dust-bin for not necessarily Hadrianic inscriptions (38) and find the Jarrow inscription, or find out how Dr. Mann copes with the two Ulpii Marcelli (84-86). There are riches here.

As far as presentation is concerned, Dr. Mann's printers have coped reasonably well with the problem of showing the various epigraphic conventions. A few errors have gone unnoticed: *adverus* for *adversus* (68); emporer's (123); DIGNATATUM for DIGNITATUM (heading IX). A more serious complaint remains. Dr. Mann has conceded that knowledge of Greek is rare even among undergraduates. Would he in a new edition recognise also that many earnest students of Roman Britain, especially those *extra muros*, lack Latin also, and incorporate translations of the literary sources and renderings of the sense of the inscriptions and coins? With this addition this booklet could become what it ought to be: an indispensable companion to anyone seriously interested in the problems of the northern frontier.

B. DOBSON

CHRISTIANITY IN BRITAIN, 300-700, edited by M. W. Barley and R. P. C. Hanson, pp. 221+xii. Plates 6; figs. 21. Leicester University Press, 1968, 50/- (£2.5).

This volume consists in substance of some of the papers presented to a Conference on Christianity in Roman and sub-Roman Britain at Nottingham in 1967. The contributors approach the topic with a variety of techniques—historical, archaeological, linguistic—and the result is a most important survey of early Christianity in Britain. Historical studies include those of A. H. M. Jones on the organisation of the western church and John Morris on the meagre literary evidence for Britain (complementing his contribution on “Dark Age Dates” in *Britain and Rome*). Archaeology brings in Raleigh Radford on the evidence for churches on the continent and Miss Toynbee on the way

in which pagan motifs could be made to serve Christian purposes, particularly in mosaic. Of the linguistic contributions that of F. Kerlouégan supports the attribution of the *de excidio Britanniae* to Gildas, while D. Greene, in passing, suggests that although British Latin may have sounded stilted and old-fashioned to a continental, this does not necessarily mean that the Latin of Roman Britain was merely a "school-learned" language. Greene remarks (p. 77) "We are not, in any case, entitled to set up the terms *archaic* and *colloquial* in opposition to one another; the speech of an Icelandic trawler-man may sound very archaic to his Norwegian counterpart, but it is none the less colloquial". It may be relevant to note that the most archaic of Romance speeches survives in the Logudorese dialect of south-central Sardinia. That this should be the case, so near to Italy, is surely at least partly due to the fact that Sardinia is an island. That Britain is an island must also have helped to insulate it from the spoken Latin of the continent, so that Britons may well have made use in everyday converse of a spoken Latin much more archaic than that of Gaul or Italy.

For the northern student, the chapters by Ronald Watson and Charles Thomas may hold a greater interest. The former writes on "Christianity in the Roman Army in Britain". In looking for evidence of Christianity in the military north, he is inclined to discount altogether the evidence of portable objects bearing Christian symbols, "any of which could be, and no doubt were, taken as loot" (p. 53). While this may be true of material found at Traprain or elsewhere north of Hadrian's Wall, it will hardly ever be true of sites on or south of the Wall. There is no good reason for regarding material found at places like Corbridge or Catterick as loot derived from elsewhere. We can accept rather more evidence for Christianity in the Wall area than Watson will allow. (For the material, cf. John Wall in *AA* xliii, 1965 and xliv, 1966.)

Charles Thomas writes on "The Evidence from North Britain", a fundamental study of the varied material from

the area between the Highlands and Brigantia, culminating in attractive suggestions on the territorial extent of sub-Roman dioceses in the area. The arguments for a late Roman bishopric of Carlisle (p. 95) can be supplemented. The Brougham milestone (*JRS* lv, 1965, 224, no. 11) indicates that there existed in the Eden Valley, by the late third century, a *civitas Carvetiorum*. Either (as Stevens suggested, *EHR* lii, 1937, 200) Carlisle was the urban centre (*oppidum*) of the *civitas*, with a territory stretching at least as far south as Brougham, or, if the urban centre was in the upper Eden Valley (e.g. at Brougham, or Kirkby Thore), then if the upper Eden could support a *civitas*, surely Carlisle with an urban area of 70 acres or more must also have achieved city status. Either way, given that only the most extraordinary circumstances could prevent a city from becoming the seat of a bishop, there will have been a bishop of Carlisle. But even if the arguments for Carlisle becoming a city be rejected, and no rank higher than that of *vicus* allowed to it, it must be noted that in frontier areas, if there were no cities, bishoprics were instead established at the most important centres of population. Carlisle would clearly fall into this category.

Thomas (pp. 105-8) is inclined to accept much of the Bedan tradition of conversion of many of the southern Picts by Ninian. But how far did the tradition derive from the desire of Nechtan IV to show that Christianity among his people really had a "Roman" as opposed to a "Celtic" origin? Thomas notes the comparative absence of "Class I" symbol stones in the area between Forth and Tay, and the spread of "long-cist" burials north of the Forth, and suggests that this was because the area "was already, in some degree, Christianized". Could the explanation not be that this area only came under Pictish control at a late date, perhaps only after Nechtsmere?

John Morris (p. 64) has some cautionary words on the native sources, particularly the genealogies. It is worth asking whether we are bound to continue to accept the

claim of the kings of Gwynedd to be descended from the ruling house of the Votadini. According to Morris, "the purpose of genealogies is to connect living persons with persons at least believed to have been mighty in the past". What better connection could the ruling house of Gwynedd concoct than one with "Gwyr y Gogledd", the great northern heroes of the British resistance to English advance?

These remarks indicate a little of the range of stimulus provoked by this volume. It will be fundamental for all future work in the field of early British Christianity.

J. C. MANN

NORTHUMBERLAND: NATIONAL PARK GUIDE NO. 7. Edited by John Philipson, M.A., F.S.A. Pp. viii+130. Plates XXVI, figs. 12. H.M.S.O., 1969. 7s. 6d.

This, the latest National Park Guide, keeps up the high standard that we now expect. The Northumberland National Park stretches from the Roman Wall to the foothills of The Cheviot overlooking the valley of the River Till. It thus comprises the upper valleys of the North Tyne, Rede, Coquet, Aln and Breamish and the typical Northumberland Moors that divide these valleys. The area is both historical and beautiful. The geological history commences 300 million years ago when the volcanoes that formed The Cheviot erupted. For long ages after this the sandstones, shales, limestones and coals that are the foundation of the land of Northumbria was laid down in a vast delta by a river draining a large land mass across the north Atlantic. After a further vast period of time when Arctic conditions with glaciers prevailed, the melting ice allowed the spread of vegetation and the advent of animal life from the south. Man's arrival on the scene was not until the 5th millenium B.C. All this is clearly and concisely described in a series of chapters by experts.

Then follow the prehistory and history in the area be-

fore, during and after the Romans. "In the Northumberland National Park the name of Rome stands for the Roman Wall." Sections on The Early English, The Park in the Middle Ages, The Border Ballads, Castles, Towers and Pe'e-houses bring the story down to the present day. Specialist accounts on Farming, Outdoor Activities (which include Field Sports, Fell Walking and Rock Climbing) and a typical unspoilt dales village, Elsdon, which is both historical and geographical, complete the guide, a masterpiece of its kind.

W. PERCY HEDLEY

THE PICTURE OF NEWCASTLE UPON TYNE. Large Crown 8vo, i-iv, 1-200 and folding map. E. & W. Books, London 1969. £2.25.

BIRDOSWALD FORT ON HADRIAN'S WALL: history and short guide. Peter Howard. Cameo Books, 6s. 0d.

The first of these is a reprint of the 1807 edition of a history and guide to Newcastle published by D. Akenhead. This contemporary description of Newcastle at the beginning of the 19th century is particularly useful where it touches on trade and is fullest in description of the coal trade. It is exceedingly well reproduced by E. & W. Books Ltd. on first class paper with a strong binding in buckram blocked with gold. There is a map, engraved by Lambert, of the coal district showing wagon ways including the subterranean tunnel from Kenton to the Tyne. Prestwick Carr had not then been drained and is shown as a lake.

The short guide to Birdoswald Fort gives a history of the fort followed by a description of the remains. There are 58 pages and it is generously illustrated with photographs and plans. It is remarkable at the price. It is published by Cameo Books, of 6 Ryndleside, Oakes, Huddersfield, and is on sale at the farm at Birdoswald and in the Newcastle Museum of Antiquities.

J. PHILIPSON