Lecture Summaries

The Excavations of the Baroque palace and garden of the Earls of Mar at Alloa

Allyson Shepard Bailey*

Excavations were carried out by the Scottish Urban Archaeological Trust on the site of Alloa House between October 1989 and October 1990, under the auspices of the Alloa Tower Building Preservation Trust. The Trust was set up in 1988 to renovate Alloa Tower and improve the area around it, and as part of the initiative it was decided to excavate the remains of the 18th-century house with a view to consolidation and display.

The site has a great historical importance. The house was in large measure the work of the 6th Earl of Mar, perhaps the most famous representative of a family who were a great power in Scotland for many years. When Mar succeeded to the title in 1689, he inherited 'more debts than estate' but over the next 25 years he transformed Alloa and its industry. He also enlarged and improved his own estate, laying out elaborate gardens which were considered the finest in Scotland. He demolished some of the ancillary buildings which had grown up around the Tower, enlarging and adding to others to form a more coherent classical mansion. This work included many alterations to the Tower itself, changing the medieval fortress into an elegant adjunct to the house.

Mar's successful political career came to an end after the ill-fated Battle of Sheriffmuir. He spent the rest of his life in exile, where he continued to elaborate and change the plans of Alloa House. These drawings were of great help in planning the excavation strategy and in identifying the excavated features.

The House underwent considerable alterations in the late 18th century, as contemporary illustrations show. It was completely destroyed by fire in 1800.

The excavations revealed that most of the house was built directly on to the bedrock. The walls were extensively robbed, but enough has survived to allow a virtually complete reconstruction of the plan. The house consisted of three fairly distinct parts. The first was a relatively narrow range on the west side, abutting the Tower on the north end and running some 40 m south. Behind or east of the range was the central block, focused on the great waiting hall. Finally, two wings led off the main building, one from the north-east corner and one from the south-east. The south-east wing lay at an oblique angle to the rest of the building, and may be part of an earlier structure.

* Scottish Urban Archaeological Trust Ltd. 55 South Methven Street, Perth
Most of the remains corresponded quite closely to Mar’s plan of 1727, although there were exceptions. For example, abutting the front range on the west side was a low rectangular plinth with a step on the outer side flanked by two column bases. Two narrow wing walls ran off the north-west and the south-west corners, with a slightly wider wall abutting the south wing. This structure bears no resemblance to any of Mar’s designs for porches, nor to the porch shown on later illustrations, after the alterations.

Portions of the south-east wing were very well preserved, as several of the rooms had cellars. Their outlines follow Mar’s plan, but a number of features have been added or altered. Below the ‘waiting hall’ in the central block are the wine cellars, consisting of a north–south corridor with three vaulted rooms leading off it. Two of these rooms have brick bins for wine bottles, the third has stone benches for beer barrels. The cellars appear to have continued in use after the destruction of the house.

In addition to the building, two sets of drains were found. One began in the wine cellar beneath the central block, and ran through the court between the north-east and the south-east wings. The other ran between the front range and the south-east wing. It was comprised of a fine series of rock cut channels, still retaining a small portion of the original stone vaulted cover. There were relatively few finds, mostly of standard 18th-century types.

The consolidation and display of the site will be completed in Spring 1993. The renovated Tower should be open to the public in 1994 and will house most of the interpretive and display material on the site.

The Neolithic settlement of Eilean Domhnuill, Loch Olabhat, North Uist

Ian Armit*

The site of Eilean Domhnuill, Loch Olabhat, North Uist, is providing an insight into the Neolithic of the Western Isles and highlighting the diversity of Scottish regional traditions in this period. A series of excavations has been conducted on the site since 1986, funded by the National Museums of Scotland, the Russell Trust, the Munro Trust and the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland. These excavations have been part of the Loch Olabhat Research Project which has also included a wide-ranging programme of survey and excavation of sites of other periods.

Eilean Domhnuill is an islet in Loch Olabhat, a small, shallow loch in the bleak peatlands of the north-west corner of North Uist. Until the current programme of excavations it was regarded as one of the many island duns and brochs of the Hebridean Iron Age. An earlier sondage, by the local antiquary Erskine Beveridge, revealed nothing to allow him to distinguish the site from the many Iron Age sites he had examined in the area.

Initially the focus of the present excavations was on the neighbouring promontory of Eilean Olabhat, a later prehistoric/Early Historic settlement and industrial site. A trial trench was excavated on Eilean Domhnuill to confirm its presumed later prehistoric date, as background information for the excavations at Eilean Olabhat. The recovery of quantities of

* Centre for Field Archaeology, University of Edinburgh, Appleton Tower, Crichton Street, Edinburgh
decorated Neolithic pottery, however, was to change the direction of the entire research programme.

Eilean Domhnuill is a multi-phase, partially water-logged settlement of the Hebridean Neolithic. It is effectively a man-made islet or crannog. There is no evidence of any outcrop rock in the excavated areas and all of the excavated deposits are anthropogenic; mainly midden material and structural and occupation debris. Whether the islet was wholly man-made or originally founded on a consolidated outcrop, for much of its use (and certainly for all of the excavated phases) it was a wholly artificial environment, created and maintained by a Neolithic community.

Excavations have revealed 12 phases of occupation with every indication that substantial quantities of material remained unexcavated in the lower, waterlogged layers. A series of successive domestic structures has been recovered although these were poorly preserved as each structure was built from the debris of its predecessor. These structures were rectilinear or elongated oval in shape and generally defined by stone alignments. Most were slight and many may never have had coursed stone walls. Inside these structures was thick occupation debris, while redeposited domestic midden formed around the periphery of the islet. The combination of these deposits gradually built the islet up in a way analogous to a ‘tell’ settlement. Although few internal features were present, charred stakes did survive in the lower levels and wattlework hurdle fragments have been found both on land and in the underwater trench.

Divers, working off the side of the islet, have recovered evidence for undisturbed occupation deposits stratified well below the lowest levels excavated on land. In these early phases, the islet had been much larger than it appears now and the preservation of organic materials from these phases is extremely good.

Initially a timber causeway linked the islet to the shore. This gave access to an entrance facade of stone slabs, surmounted by a timber palisade. Over time the level of the loch rose and caused periodic rebuilding of the entrance and perimeter features. Periods of abandonment were also recorded, equating with periods of total flooding. The last structures to occupy the site, prior to its final drowning by the loch waters, were two substantial and conjoining rectilinear buildings with stone and earth walls. These were associated with a stone causeway which replaced the earlier timber version. The closest parallels for these structures are the Neolithic houses from Knap of Howar in Orkney. In both cases two conjoined rectilinear structures dominate a settlement with earlier occupation. The location of the two sites is very different however, and the Knap of Howar structures are somewhat larger, suggesting that similarities of form may well be superficial.

It is possible that the loch level rise which characterises the occupation of Eilean Domhnuill may have been caused by the inhabitants of the islet. Deforestation of the site catchment, for example, or over-exploitation of local soils for agriculture, may have increased the flow of water and sediment into the loch. It was the final drowning of the islet which preserved the Neolithic deposits from disturbance by later occupation. The walls around nearby Eilean Olabhat show that later prehistoric loch levels would have covered the Neolithic site. This long-term flooding has led to excellent preservation of organic materials in the lower levels of the site, giving a remarkable opportunity for environmental reconstruction.
The furnishing of the Palace of Holyroodhouse for the French Princes in 1796

Margaret Swain*

In 1796 Charles, Comte d’Artois, heir apparent to the Bourbon throne of France, was sent by the British Government to reside in the Palace of Holyroodhouse, once an Abbey, and still a debtor’s sanctuary, as a refuge against his creditors. The palace was, however, fully occupied by tenants of ‘grace and favour’ apartments. Only the Royal Suite on the first floor, neglected and forlorn since 1707, remained unoccupied. Until this could be put in order, the Comte d’Artois, his sons and suite, occupied the well-furnished rooms allotted to Lord Adam Gordon, Commander in Chief, North Britain.

The Government commissioned the fitting up of the Royal Suite to the Edinburgh firm of Young, Trotter & Hamilton, led by an enterprising young man, William Trotter, who was to become Lord Provost of Edinburgh, and a member of the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland. A prompt start was made. Repairs were made to chimneys and walls; tapestries were taken down, cleaned and repaired. Some were re-hung, others laid aside. Walls were hung with new paper, curtains of printed cotton were matched by bedhangings and chair covers, and good mahogany furniture was supplied, of the type being made for New Town houses.

The French Princes left Holyroodhouse finally in 1814. George IV visited Holyrood in 1822, when the firm of Trotter was again entrusted with the re-furnishing of the Royal Apartments. The earlier furniture was stored. The Comte d’Artois, now Charles X of France, abdicated in 1830 and returned to exile in Edinburgh. His old furniture, some damaged, was brought down from the attics. He stayed for only two years. In 1841 Queen Victoria visited Edinburgh but stayed at Dalkeith Palace. Only in 1851 did she take up residence in Holyroodhouse, when it was re-furnished, though it was not till 1860 that the Duke of Argyle and the Earl of Breadalbane were persuaded to relinquish their apartments to make room for the Queen’s growing family.

An account (Laing MS II 448/29) in the Library of the University of Edinburgh lists the furnishings supplied in 1796, and many of the items are described so exactly that it has been possible to identify pieces of furniture: bookcases, wardrobes, tables and chairs, supplied by Young, Trotter & Hamilton in 1796.

Disease in Scotland’s past: the evidence from the bones

Juliet Cross†

The history of a people is often seen only in terms of written or spoken records, artefacts and monuments. What is often forgotten is the story told by the skeletons themselves. The study of human skeletal material offers a great opportunity to assess the physical appearance, health status and lifestyle of past populations. This information can be used with collaborative evidence from archaeological or documentary sources to build a picture of the past.

* 8 South Gray Street, Edinburgh
† Skeletal Biology Unit, Division of Anatomy, School of Biomedical Sciences, Marischal College, Aberdeen.
The health status of a community provides an indication of the degree of success that it has had in adapting to its environment. However, an assessment of health status from skeletal material is limited as only those diseases or pathological conditions that directly affect the skeleton or dentition may be identified. Many of the diseases that would have had a significant effect on a population, eg influenza and gastro-enteritis, do not leave any diagnostic signs on bone or teeth. For this reason, the cause of death can rarely be determined.

Leprosy, tuberculosis and syphilis are examples of diseases that do leave characteristic signs on bone. Some of the cancers, eg leukaemia, may also be diagnosed. Other pathological conditions include fractures and osteo-arthritis. Congenital anomalies such as spina bifida occulta, an asymptomatic form of spina bifida, may be observed in both children and adults. A number of nutritional deficiencies leave life-long marks on the bones and teeth. For example, iron-deficiency anaemia in early childhood results in pitting of the orbits in the skull.

Finally, the dentition may also provide a record of the health status of an individual. Dental caries, root abscesses and tooth loss are obvious examples. A record of chronic gum disease, such as gingivitis or periodontitis, may be observed from the destruction and collapse of the bony tooth socket.

Scottish Place-Names: signposts to the past

W F H Nicolaisen*

Seventy-five years ago Professor W J Watson delivered his six Rhind Lectures on ‘The Celtic Place-Names of Scotland’, a turning point in the study of Scottish place-names, especially of the Celtic variety. It might have seemed appropriate to look critically at Watson’s November 1916 approach from a May 1991 perspective but there is so little in his lectures (which are mainly available to us in the expanded book version of 1926, The History of the Celtic Place-Names of Scotland) that needs drastic updating that there would be no real benefit to be derived from such an exercise. Watson is still an excellent guide in this complex field of research.

Instead, concentrating on some general principles and especially pursuing the important distinction between words and names, this presentation uses the underlying theme of ‘signposts’ pointing them to names such as Inverlochy, Melrose, Glenfinnan, Gairloch, Blair Atholl, Port Askaiag, Shieldaig, Ullapool, in order to introduce another metaphor, that of place names as ‘linguistic ruins’, and contrasts their undiminished functionality and knowable onomastic contents with their semantic opacity as words. It stresses that etymology is an attempt to restore the ‘ruinous’ linguistic state of names to the words they once were or are supposed to have been. Much exciting, often satisfying, sometimes frustrating, detective work goes into this process on many levels because it is one of the paradoxes of names that, while we use them quite satisfactorily we feel put out, even threatened, by their lexical meaninglessness. Names such as Aberdeen, Glasgow and Edinburgh therefore continue to be popularly reinterpreted in terms which scholars such as William Watson and Kenneth Jackson conclusively refuted years ago. However, the keenness with which name derivations are demanded and fought over and the way in which ignorance in these matters is regarded as

* State University of New York, at Binghamton, New York
failure can only lead to a better understanding of individual names unless etymology is seen to be the mere beginning and not the chief end of onomastic enquiry.

Much more attention has to be paid to the relationship of names to each other and to name usage. In this paper, the Gaelic and Norse names of the Isle of Arran are used as paradigms to show how their cumulative evidence can provide insights which even intensive analysis of individual names cannot offer. For these reasons, it is very important that spatial, temporal and socio-onomastic patterns be established, as long as it is realised that names are only ‘signposts’ to pasts that never were.

The Sources of the Early Medieval Animal Ornament of the British Isles

Carola Hicks*

The same animals could be used as symbols in both pagan and Christian art, although not necessarily with the same meaning. It was the deliberate policy of the first missionaries to the Anglo-Saxons to incorporate former cults into the rituals of the early church, and this included animal decoration. Early biblical commentators debated the allegorical role of animals. They also drew upon the classical texts which were to provide the ultimate sources for the medieval bestiary, which can be derived from the cumulative accretions to the writings of Aristotle, Pliny, Solinus, the Physiologus and Isidore of Seville. Although the bestiary was not fully developed until the 12th century, there are enough examples of animal subjects in Insular art to suggest that the moral lessons they taught were already well recognized through familiarity with illustrations of such texts.

Particular scenes and subjects which can be traced from Classical or even Oriental sources into Anglo-Saxon, Irish and Pictish art include Adam naming the animals, the deer hunt, the predatory bird, the centaur, the mermaid, the griffin, the dragon, and the lion. Such motifs are so well established in Insular, and subsequently Romanesque art that their exotic backgrounds or meanings are not immediately clear; they have become an essential part of Christian teaching, as symbols of good or evil.

* Newnham College, Cambridge
The Norse, the Northern Isles and the North Atlantic: connections and context
Christopher D Morris*

The island groups of Shetland and Orkney have formed part of a dynamic cultural unit at many periods of the past, not least in the Viking and Late Norse periods. At this time, some of the most important external connections were across the North Atlantic, both eastwards to the Norwegian ‘homelands’, and westwards to the other Norse settlements of the West: Faroe, Iceland, Greenland and North America. Increasingly, aspects of the material culture of these apparently peripheral areas are seeming to relate and interconnect.

As argued in my Jarrow Lecture for 1989 (‘Church and Monastery in the Far North: An Archaeological Evaluation’), an evaluation of the evidence from certain key sites in the context of the Church in the Northern Isles suggests that an Early Christian and monastic model has become something of a straightjacket. One can take a somewhat sceptical view of some of the evidence presented in the past from St Ninian’s Isle, Papil, the Brough of Deerness and the Brough of Birsay. Instead, it is possible, taking into account the results of some recent archaeological work, to examine the evidence in terms of Norse Christianity. While there may be a limited range of archaeological examples, it is nevertheless possible to demonstrate a range and vitality that may be surprising to those accustomed to view the Scandinavian Viking contribution to European civilisation as negative and destructive.

The evidence from Orkney and Shetland fits easily into a wider Christian context of the North Atlantic. Despite some premature identifications of particular archaeological structures with specific historical references, and what may seem to be misguided attempts to ‘validate’ the archaeological material in terms of the evidence from another discipline, the complexity that is emerging, for instance in Birsay in Orkney and Brattahlíð on Greenland, raises interesting issues. Indeed in considering such a far-flung Norse settlement as Brattahlíð, it merely reinforces the point that no part of the known world of the day was considered to be beyond Christian gaze or missionary concern.

Even if some of the evidence that has been cited in the past in favour of the presence of pre-Norse monks or priests is equivocal, there can be no doubt that the Norse islands of the North Atlantic were very much part of the wider Christian community, and were also a Christian community in themselves. The small chapels of Orkney and Shetland are echoed by similar structures in the other island groups, and we need not assume that the apparently simple timber buildings with turf or stone cladding around the outside were ‘primitive’. We do well to remember that timber was in short supply in all these islands and had to be imported, thereby implying considerable resources being expended on securing this medium. The aspirations were considerable: grand buildings such as Kirkwall Cathedral, Kirkjubøur in the Faroes and the Bishop’s Cathedral and Palace in Greenland at Garðar demonstrate this clearly enough, as do furnishings such as roods and crucifixion plaques, determinedly attempting to keep in the mainstream of European developments.

Turning, more briefly, to aspects of settlement, again it is significant that whereas in the past the agenda has all too often been quasi-historical, the approach now is one where the archaeology is treated in its own terms first, leading later to a more meaningful interconnec-

* Department of Archaeology, University of Glasgow
tion and articulation of both the written and material ‘texts’. Exemplifying this approach is the Birsay Bay Project, concerned to look at individual sites in a wider geographical and chronological setting, and emphasizing their complex and presumably interactive archaeological histories. Similarly, at the other end of the North Atlantic region – Brattahlið – the same considerations of widening the archaeological agenda have arisen: apart from the re-evaluation of identifications of particular buildings, there has been a widening of the immediate geographical context of the site to include the adjacent valley of Qordlotoq. Equally, the more recent work at L’Anse Aux Meadows in Newfoundland has been less concerned with the quasi-historical issues of Vinland and more with chronology and context for the excavated site.

One of the areas in which the archaeological agenda has been dramatically widened in the North Atlantic region is that of environmental archaeology. Projects in and around Sandnes in the ‘Western Settlement’ of Greenland, palaeobotanical work near Brattahlið and in the Faroes, work on insects in Iceland and Greenland, large-scale environmental sampling projects at Birsay and Orphir in Orkney, Freswick in Caithness and Sandwick in Shetland all herald a new – and hopefully integrated – approach to the bioarchaeology of the North Atlantic. Similarly, important aspects of the exploitation of the natural resources (water-supply, steatite, timber) and the evident large-scale farming and hunting activities are now being worked upon.

Finally, both in relation to the Church and to Norse settlement in the North Atlantic region, questions inevitably arise about the contact and connections with Native peoples. Again the quasi-historical agenda has tended in the past to dominate, and it is time to examine the archaeological evidence for its own sake, before coming to wide-ranging generalizations. If there are traditions in the quasi-historical sources of hostility between Norse and Native, there are also archaeological indications of a far more complex picture. Buckquoy, Birsay and Pool in Orkney, and Ellesmere Island and L’Anse Aux Meadows across the other side of the North Atlantic have all produced material that requires a more measured consideration of the issues. The Norse archaeology of the North Atlantic from Norway via the Northern Isles to Newfoundland has certainly entered a new phase, and one which promises many exciting results in the near future. The picture may not be as simple as in the past, but it will have the merit of focusing upon the one category of information that is constantly expanding: that from archaeology.

New light on Neolithic rock carving: the petroglyphs at Greenland, Dunbartonshire

Euan W Mackie*

The cup-and-ring carved rock at Greenland, Auchentorlie (NS/434 746) is a scheduled site and now in a quarry. Its long term future being uncertain the author was asked in 1983 by the then Scottish Development Department (Ancient Monuments) to make a record of it. The work was carried out for three weeks in the summer of 1984 and involved completely de-turfing the outcrop, washing it and laying a 1 metre square grid over it; the carvings were

* Hunterian Museum, University of Glasgow
recorded (1) by direct tracing, (2) by photography, (3) on a 1:10 plan of the whole rock and (4) by making latex moulds (with fibreglass backing) of the main groups of carvings.

The carvings included cups, ovals, cups with single rings, cups with multiple rings and one possible spiral; they are not evenly distributed over the surface of the outcrop for two reasons, firstly because the original surface of the rock has been badly damaged and secondly because even on the remaining carved surfaces different motifs are concentrated in different areas. A metrological study by A Davis provided convincing support for the use of the 'megalithic inch' (2.07 cm) in laying out the rings but not for any sophisticated geometrical designs within them.

The outcrop, of metamorphosed sandstone among basalt formations, had been quarried in ancient times, presumably to obtain flat slabs for building; the contrast between the original, glaciated surface, mainly with worn carvings, and the fresh, flat quarried surfaces was very clear. The largest double disc symbol on the site is on one of these fresh surfaces and shows that the quarrying had taken place while cup-and-ring carving was a living tradition. Thus the dating of the quarrying was of prime importance.

What building activity in the late Neolithic or early Bronze Age – the usual date given to this tradition of rock carving – would require neat, flat quarried stone slabs? Short cist graves are the obvious answer but none are known nearby. The small two period hillfort Sheep Hill is however only 200 m to the south and was partially excavated by the writer in 1968–71. In its first, late Bronze Age phase it was a timber-framed dun which was eventually burned and vitrified; the later, larger enclosure was built with its debris and had stone revetted ramparts with rubble and earth cores. Pottery and clay moulds associated with the earlier dun suggest a date in the eighth or seventh centuries BC. Although only the boulder plinth of this wall remained, and its core was of basalt rubble, the sandstone from the carved outcrop would have been ideal material for the wall-faces, just as at Dun Lagaidh on Loch Broom.

Although the evidence is still circumstantial, the case for the phase II carvings at Greenland, including the large double disc, being dated to the late Bronze Age seems strong, and this may require some re-appraisal of the length of time this 'late Neolithic' or 'early Bronze Age' tradition continued to flourish. May the Pictish double disc symbol be related for example? If Sheep Hill is ever completely excavated it will be possible to test the hypothesis by looking for carved fragments in the debris.

On the Drawing Room from Hamilton Palace

Godfrey Evans*

This short paper celebrated the arrival and initial inspection of the Drawing Room from Scotland's largest and greatest 'powerhouse' which has been transferred by the Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, to the National Museums of Scotland for inclusion in the new Museum of Scotland.

The Drawing Room was the second in a sequence of parade rooms on the first floor of the west wing of Hamilton Palace, Hamilton in Lanarkshire, built by William, 3rd Duke of Hamilton, and his wife Anne between 1693 and 1701. William Morgan was responsible for the

* Department of European Metalwork & Sculpture, Royal Museum of Scotland
carvings and panelling and originally there were relief plaster ceilings by Thomas Aliburne or Albourn. The rooms were overhauled and redecorated by Alexander, 10th Duke of Hamilton, in the second quarter of the 19th century, when he was adding and fitting out the great Neoclassical north block.

Along with many other rooms, the Drawing Room was included in the clearance sales in November 1919, prior to the demolition of the Palace, and was subsequently bought by the newspaper proprietor William Randolph Hearst. In 1956 (five years after Hearst’s death) the Hearst Foundation gifted the room to the Metropolitan Museum. Realizing that they did not have the space to display the room, in October 1990 the Trustees of the Metropolitan Museum very kindly agreed to permanently transfer the room to NMS, and on 6 August 1991, 13 crates of woodwork and black marble arrived in Edinburgh inside a 40-foot ocean-going container.

The woodwork was laid out in the ground-floor exhibition gallery and Main Hall of the Chambers Street museum in November 1991 and it was discovered that we have most of the parts of the fireplace or south wall, the window or east wall and the west wall. Unfortunately, there is relatively little of the north wall. At the same time it became apparent that the room has been altered, probably for Hearst. Thirty-two parts of the impressive black marble fireplace were received and a further 15 parts have been discovered at the Metropolitan Museum. They should arrive in Edinburgh in September 1992 and will, hopefully, virtually complete the fireplace wall.

It is intended to reconstruct the Drawing Room in the new Museum of Scotland and use it as the setting for the two magnificent Napoleonic silver-gilt services acquired by the 10th Duke of Hamilton: the travelling service of Napoleon’s favourite sister, the Princess Pauline Borghese, and the Emperor’s own tea service of 1810. Together they should form an unforgettable spectacle, with the warm oak and lustrous black marble providing a perfect foil for the sparkling silver-gilt and fascinating small items. The display will also serve as a vivid and poignant reminder of the almost regal palace and collection that once existed on the outskirts of Hamilton.

Excavations at Skara Brae and Rinyo: research and redemption

Colin Richards*

Summary of paper presented at the V G Childe Centenary Conference, University of Queensland, Brisbane, Australia, September 1990, for which Mr Richards received a Young Fellow’s Bursary from the Society.

V G Childe is mainly remembered for his synthetic and theoretical archaeological works. Although he directed excavations at Skara Brae and Rinyo, this fieldwork has been relegated to minimal status in general discussions of his method and theory, particularly his changing views on culture and processes of evolution and change. In this paper it is argued that these views were influenced through a physical engagement with archaeological material to a far greater degree than has previously been acknowledged.

Childe excavated at Skara Brae on behalf of the Ministry of Works for three years from 1928. Complete excavation was hampered by the main objective of the work which was
conservation of the monument. A large proportion of the upper deposits were excavated, revealing a prehistoric settlement complex of unparalleled preservation. From the evidence observed in hut 7, the first building excavated, Childe eventually concluded that the occupants had left in great haste. This observation from the initial hut encountered, combined with the presence of an overlying layer of sterile sand, gave Childe the everlasting impression that he had uncovered a prehistoric ‘Pompeii’. This assumption was to have a profound effect on the social interpretation of the site as a whole.

Hut 7 is, in fact, unlike the other dwellings. For example, it is the only building to have formal human burials; the approach to it is demarcated by a series of threshold slabs and incised decorated stones, and the door-bar is controlled from outside the hut entrance. All these features suggest that the structure was of a special nature, perhaps being of ritual significance. Yet for Childe it was accepted as a dwelling typical of the settlement.

Childe proposed that the village was abandoned during a furious storm of hurricane strength and that the inhabitants had been forced to flee as the village was destroyed about them. This portrayal of the main abandonment of Skara Brae had the reflexive effect of dictating interpretation of material culture throughout the settlement. Hence, when commenting on the floor deposits of animal bones and rubbish, Childe was forced into making depreciatory judgements on the living standards and social condition of the inhabitants.

The view of hut 7 as a typical dwelling effectively eliminated any suggestion of variation between houses. The possibility of hut 8 being a working area was eventually rejected in favour of non-specialized communality, the village as a whole conforming to Childe’s view of Stone Age society as essentially self-sufficient and lacking any social organization other than kinship ties.

Although Skara Brae was recognized by Childe as being Neolithic in character, he settled on a Pictish date for the settlement on the basis of a correlation in the distribution of stone balls and Pictish symbol stones. This wayward date may have been influenced by Childe’s own experiences of a highly parochial Scotland, the implication being that Skara Brae represented an archaic isolated survival of an inward-looking culture. The correct late Neolithic date of Skara Brae became clear after ‘Grooved Ware’ was discovered by Stuart Piggott at Clacton, Essex. This chronological shift did nothing to alter Childe’s conception of Neolithic Orkney; the ‘Skara Brae culture’ now merely sat next to the ‘Megalithic culture’ apparently maintaining cultural isolation.

Over the winter of 1937-8, a second settlement of similar nature to Skara Brae was discovered at Rinyo, Rousay. Childe and Grant began excavations in the summer of 1938. Similarities in house architecture and pottery style established the presence of the ‘Skara Brae culture’. In their first report the authors remarked on the total absence of artefacts normally associated with the now contemporary, ‘Megalithic culture’ of the chambered tomb builders. These results sustained the belief in the existence of discrete cultural identities.

In 1944, Childe gave the Rhind lectures to the Society of Antiquaries of Scotland, subsequently published under the title of *Scotland before the Scots*. In the lecture he noted that the Megalithic culture compared favourably against the archaic Skara Brae culture. Although from their tools and products the two cultures were on a technologically similar level, the economy of the Megalithic culture was identified as being more progressive. Childe again used the supposed uniformities of house architecture at Skara Brae and Rinyo to suggest that the inhabitants were essentially egalitarian and organized on a clan basis. These assumptions led directly to the recognition of a state of ‘primitive communism’ since there appeared to be no ruling or exploited classes and no private property apart from personal items. By invoking
primitive communism, Childe effectively removed any mechanism for change, dooming the insular, archaic Skara Brae culture to an unchanging self-perpetuating future. In these ideas we are seeing not only the hand of Marx but also the corollary of Childe’s initial impressions of Skara Brae.

Childe and Grant returned to Rinyo in the summer of 1946. Beneath the floor of house G, in a build-up of midden material, both Grooved Ware and Unstan Ware were recovered. Little comment was provided in the published report to account for this cultural association which ran against Childe’s view of Neolithic Orkney.

In 1951 Childe undertook further excavations at the megalithic tomb of Quoyness, Sanday. Here again, items from both the Skara Brae and Megalithic cultures were clearly associated in contexts within the tomb. The presence of Grooved Ware within a megalithic tomb must have severely shaken Childe’s confidence in the cultural definition he had consistently placed on associated material ‘culture’. The inevitable conclusion in the Quoyness report was that the inhabitants of Skara Brae and Rinyo buried their dead kinsman or chiefs within megalithic tombs, an admittance that the two cultural groups in Neolithic Orkney were one and the same and that they may have had more social stratification than Childe had previously acknowledged.

In view of the unexpected results from the excavations at Rinyo and Quoyness we can provide an alternative view on Childe’s changing attitude to ‘culture’ and its identification, noticeable in the late 1940s and early 1950s. The dissatisfaction with cultural definition has tended to be seen as an intellectual move on the part of Childe, being attributed to contact with work being undertaken by anthropologists in America. Here we may link this change in attitude to his own observations in the field. In practice, the integrity of discrete assemblages of archaeological material, which he had consistently interpreted as representing distinct cultural groups, was lost. His ideas were undermined, so to speak, before his very eyes.

Contemporary archaeology has finally reached a point where it can begin to accept that excavation is an act of interpretation and is therefore theoretical in nature. It was Childe’s engagement with archaeological evidence which challenged his assumptions and beliefs. His redemption comes in both the flexibility of thinking which allowed revision of the concept of archaeological cultures and the maintenance of such a problem in the Orcadian Neolithic. Megalithic tombs in Orkney can now be divided into two types of architecture, one, including Quoyness, was undoubtedly built and used by the same people who inhabited the villages of similar nature to Skara Brae and Rinyo. The second category remains distinct in terms of house and tomb architecture and material culture, particularly Unstan Ware; this is Childe’s ‘Megalithic culture’.
The Rhind Lectures 1990–91: a synopsis

The Revival of Medieval and Early Renaissance architecture in Scotland, 1745–1930

David M Walker*

LECTURE 1


It could be said that in Scotland the gothic tradition never quite died. The plate traceried windows of Dairsie Kirk (1621), the Y-traceried windows of Balcarres Chapel (1635), the interlaced tracery of Sir William Bruce’s church at Lauder (1673), of James Smith’s mausoleum at Durrisdeer as first built (1695) and of Michael Kirk, Gordonstoun (1705), carried the gothic tradition through the 17th century and into the 18th.

The gothic revival, or at least the castellated, revival in Scotland arose not so much from the embers of the 16th and 17th century gothic but rather – even though it would have happened in any event – from Sir John Vanbrugh’s four-year acquaintance with castellated architecture in its grandest and severest form at Vincennes and the Bastille, which found echoes in the castellated Vanbrugh family houses at Greenwich.

When the 3rd Duke of Argyll succeeded in 1744, his inheritance may have included a scheme for a castellated house similar in outline to the executed castle which Vanbrugh had prepared for the 2nd Duke, although it is now less certain that the inscription on the drawing can be trusted. Another scheme for the 2nd Duke, a Vauban-esque fort with Kentian detail by the engineer Dugald Campbell, provided the idea for the fosse of the executed castle, but the 3rd Duke’s choice of architect fell on Roger Morris who had finished Vanbrugh’s Eastbury, and it was the plan of that house which was adapted for Inveraray. Eastbury’s baroque elevations were redesigned in a gothic manner which derived from the tower James Gibbs had built for the Duke’s brother at Whitton, and from such houses as William Kent’s remodelling of Esher (1733) and perhaps even Batty Langley’s book, Gothic Architecture Improved of 1742. Inveraray was the first truly great gothic country house to be built completely anew, although not the first major gothic revival building, that honour being taken by Hawksmoor’s All Souls College, Oxford, of 1716–35.

The Duke’s executant architects at Inveraray were John and Robert Adam. The style, though not the plan, found echoes at the brothers’ unfinished Douglas Castle of 1757–61 and at

* Historic Scotland, 20 Brandon Street, Edinburgh
their collaborator James Nisbet's Twizell Castle, just across the border in 1771, the latter having the bold machicolated parapets which characterized Robert Adam's later castles.

Contemporary with Twizell was John Baxter and Abraham Roumieux's rebuilding of Gordon Castle, severe Gibbsian baroque with castellated parapets. Adam himself experimented with the fanciful gothic he had employed at Alnwick Castle in 1770-80 only briefly at the façade of Yester Chapel in Scotland, preferring for country house work an Italian inspired castellated which nevertheless has some Scottish references, particularly to James V's tower at Holyroodhouse and, perhaps, his own ruined castle at Dowhill. His earlier essays were, however, more tentative: Mellerstain (c 1770-8), a finely proportioned composition of severe rectangular masses with Tudor hoodmoulds; Wedderburn (1771-5), which has more classical references in its rusticated ground floor but in its bow and towers anticipates the bold geometry of the later castles; and Caldwell (1773), again classical with crenellations and pepperpots. Out of these grew the brilliant geometrical planning of Culzean (begun 1777), Dalquharran (1786), Seton (1789) and Airthrey (1791) in which the detailing, some quatrefoils at Culzean excepted, was severely neo-classical. Some gothic detailing appeared in late works which were probably more James than Robert, at St George's Chapel, Edinburgh, and Stobs Castle (1793). In similar vein were Alexander Stevens' Raehills (1786) the arcaded basement terrace of which anticipates that at Culzean, and Bridge of Dun (1787).

Rather similar in style, though not in plan, was the work of James Playfair at Kinnaird (remodelling, 1785) and Melville (1786) and of Alexander Laing at Darnaway (1802). Robert Adam's former assistants, John Paterson and Richard Crichton, adhered more closely to the style of their master, the former at Monzie (c 1795) Eglinton (1798) and probably Fasque (1809) and the latter at Rossie (c 1800) and probably Gelston (c 1805), most of them with adaptations of Adam plan forms. All these houses had classical interiors: only at Playfair's Farnell Church (1789) and Crichton's Craig Church (1799), both with plaster rib vaults, was significant gothic interior work attempted. All this was in marked contrast to English work of the same period, Horace Walpole's Strawberry Hill having attempted gothic interiors as early as 1753 while convincing neo-Perpendicular work had been achieved at Pomfret Castle, Arlington Street, London, and at Arbury as early as 1756 and 1765 respectively.

The Inveraray-inspired plan-type reappeared at Elliot's Taymouth (1806 onwards) and Newbyth (1817); at James Gillespie Graham's The Lee (1820) and in his original proposals for Duninald; and at William Burn's reconstruction of Saltoun (1818), all with elaborate neo-Gothic interior work. While Saltoun derived more directly from Sir Robert Smirke's Lowther and neo-classical Kinmont, what had brought the Inveraray model back into the consciousness of architects, nobility and gentry alike had been the new palace at Kew, designed by James Wyatt in 1802.

All of these had English Tudor gothic detail, Burn's Saltoun and Gillespie Graham's proposals for Duninald reflecting the increased repertoire of detail available in published form by the second decade of the 19th century. In 1802 the London architect George Saunders produced a precocious scheme for remodelling and largely rebuilding Scone Palace in the 17th century idiom in which it had been built, an exercise perhaps suggested by the tactful neo-Jacobean work which had been carried out in the modernization of many English Elizabethan and Jacobean houses. In the event the Earl of Mansfield paid off Saunders and employed William Atkinson, a pupil of James Wyatt, to transform the old palace into an up-to-date English Tudor gothic pile. It was his first large job on either side of the Border, and unlike its predecessor, it was asymmetrical, enabling the house to be much more logically planned with the principal and private apartments en suite in an L-plan arrangement, privacy
from callers and servants alike being particularly carefully considered. The interiors were modelled on his mentor’s Fonthill, albeit on a much smaller scale. Similarly indebted to Wyatt, on this occasion perhaps more to Sheffield Park, was his Rossie Priory (1807) with spirelets borrowed from Peterborough Cathedral. Almost parallel with these were Richard Crichton’s conversion from Adam castellated to Tudor gothic at Abercarny Abbey of c 1805, similarly asymmetrical but with rather more literate perpendicular detail, and the London architect James Sands’ partly executed schemes for remodelling Torrie House (1813).

John Nash’s picturesque castles on the Richard Payne Knight model found Scottish echoes in the London architect Robert Lugar’s Tullichewan (1808) and Balloch (1809) and in an important series of rather similar houses by James Gillespie Graham at Culdee (1809), Cambusnethan (1816), Kilmaron (c 1820), the executed design for Duninald (1823) and the much larger and more varied Duns (1818) which incorporated a substantial earlier house.

In church design the sophistication achieved at Farnell and Craig remained unique until the second decade of the new century. In the county parishes and even in the larger towns, ‘heritors’ gothic’ with timber Y-traceried and astragalled windows remained the norm. Some, like Forfar, combined gothic windows with Gibbsian spires but a few of the larger churches, such as John Paterson’s St Paul’s Perth (1806) attempted more interesting plan forms than the ubiquitous rectangle containing a U-plan gallery.

LECTURE 2


In the second decade of the 19th century, expectations of architectural scholarship greatly increased, a trend which can be directly linked to John Britton’s Architectural Antiquities published from 1805 onwards, a book which found a place in most country house libraries and enabled clients as well as architects to be better informed. Its plates gave ready access to gothic detail in a way that Francis Grose’s plates had not, and resulted in English gothic, and particularly Tudor gothic, rather than the native gothic which might have been directly observed, becoming as universal in Scotland as it was in England. James Gillespie Graham in Edinburgh and David Hamilton in Glasgow, hitherto still working in a post-Adam castellated idiom at Achnacarry (1802) and Airth (1807) respectively, both moved rapidly into Tudor gothic, Hamilton’s work at Crawford Priory (1809) being a notable landmark. But the future of Scottish architecture from 1810 onwards was to lie more in the hands of a group of bright young men newly returned from London. In Aberdeen John Smith was the first to come home in 1804, followed by Archibald Simpson from the offices of Robert Lugar and David Laing in 1813. In Edinburgh William Burn returned from Sir Robert Smirke’s in 1811 or 1812, followed by William Henry Playfair from Benjamin Dean Wyatt’s and, according to some accounts, Smirke’s in 1816.

The new trend was first apparent in church design. In 1813 a correct neo-perpendicular church was built at Collace, its external form being adapted from Britton’s plate of Bishop Skirlaugh’s chapel. Its probable authorship by James Gillespie Graham is not yet confirmed but it inaugurated a long series of churches designed by him on the same model. Essentially similar were David Hamilton’s St John’s Glasgow (1816) and Larbert (1817) and William
Stirling's Lecropt (1826). Similar again, but less sophisticated in detail with wood tracery, were the more ambitious of John Smith's churches in the north-east from 1821 onwards. Similarly indebted to Britton was Gillespie Graham's parish church at Alloa (1817) with a spire adapted from his plate of Louth, repeated on a much larger scale at Montrose in 1832. Gillespie Graham also set the pace for the most ambitious urban churches of the period with his St Andrew's Roman Catholic chapel in Glasgow (1814) which had a 'college chapel' front, aisled and clerestoried nave and plaster rib vaults. Even more ambitious were two Edinburgh churches built for Episcopal congregations: Archibald Elliot's St Paul's with its fine 'timber' (actually plaster) ceilings and William Burn's St John's with its elaborate plaster fan vaults (both 1816). As originally designed, the tower of St John's was modelled on that designed by Thomas Harrison for St Nicholas, Liverpool (1811), a discriminating choice as few would then be aware of the work of that Chester-based master. A single country church, Kincardine-in-Menteith (1816), by Richard Crichton, attempted the clerestoried nave and aisles formula at the same date but these churches were to remain unique in scale and seriousness of approach for many years.

Richard Crichton's successors, his nephews R & R Dickson, followed up his success at Abercairny with further work there which successfully reorganized its plan on more up-to-date lines, outclassing it with their brilliantly picturesque English Tudor Millearne (1826) which owed much to the client, J G Home-Drummond, but no major opportunity came their way again. James Gillespie Graham lost ground in the mid-1820s but regained position towards the end of the decade. London architects began to penetrate the Scottish market even more seriously than Atkinson had done. Sir Robert Smirke, in addition to his great neo-classical houses at Kinmount, Whittinghame and Newton Don, secured the commissions for the rather old-fashioned neo-Tudor Strathallan Castle (1817), the more up-to-date but very severe Cultoquhey (c 1819), and the triumphantly picturesque Kinfauns (1820) finely sited above the Tay, which adapted the style of his earlier centrally-planned Eastnor to a more up-to-date single aspect plan form with a corridor gallery, much as at the Dicksons' reorganization of Abercairny. His great palace at Erskine (1828), austerely symmetrical neo-Tudor externally, is remarkable for its Fonthill-like entrance hall and principal apartments, as splendid as those at Lowther and Eastnor a decade and a half earlier. All would have been put in the shade had Thomas Hopper's Dunkeld Palace, as large as a medieval abbey, gone ahead as planned but it was destined to remain in model form: the executed house (1828), which never got beyond first-floor level, was to have been a severely disciplined Tudor rectangle, distinctly old-fashioned by that date.

Much more influential than Smirke or Hopper were William Wilkins and Edward Blore, who set the style for Burn, the most influential architect of the period. Wilkins' archaeologically correct neo-Tudor houses at Dalmeny (1814) and Dunmore (1820), the former closely modelled on East Barsham in Norfolk, set the style for Burn's Blairquhan (1820), Carstairs (1822), and Garscube (1826); Edward Blore's pioneer Cotswold Tudor revival Corehouse (1824) set the style for Burn's Snaigow designed in the same year, Pitcairns (1827) and a whole series of 'cottage' houses. Stylistically Burn's houses diversified from Tudor to English neo-Jacobean at Dupplin (1828) St Fort (1829) and Kirkmichael (1832) and to a picturesque hybrid Scots-Tudor at Milton Lockhart and the reconstruction of Tyninghame (both 1829); and at Riccarton (1823), Brodie (1824), Lauriston (1827) and Kilconquhar (1831) by incorporating the old tower-houses as the dominant element of the composition, he inaugurated a particularly fashionable Scottish country house profile to achieve which many tower houses were built anew where none had previously existed. To what extent the Scottish features in Burn's houses were influenced by his friend Sir
Walter Scott's Abbotsford – where he was professionally assisted first by Blore and then by Atkinson – rather than his writings is difficult now to say: he did not actually visit Scott there until 1831 though he must have been aware of it earlier.

Burn's Auchmacoy (1831) and his unexecuted designs for Robert Gordon's College, Aberdeen, introduced his Tudor Jacobean style and house planning to the north-east where it was enthusiastically embraced by John Smith at Fintray (1829), Skene (1832), Old Balmoral (1834), Menie (1836), Banchory (1839), the huge Forglén (1840) and finally the rebuilt Balmoral (1852).

Stylistically Balmoral was at least 20 years behind the times, perpetuating the idiom of Milton Lockhart and Tyningham. Burn himself had moved on. His refitting of James Smith's Drumlanrig from 1829 onwards left the exterior and the principal interiors much as he found them, enriched only by geometrically ribbed Jacobean ceilings, when first Atkinson and then Charles Barry had planned to transform it, the latter as a French château. He was markedly less respectful of Smith's subsequent Dutch Palladianism at Dalkeith House for which in 1831 he produced two schemes for transforming it into a Jacobean prodigy house, neither of which got beyond the outstandingly fine model made by George Meikle Kemp. Madras College, St Andrews (1832), a fine quadrangle with miniature Wollaton towers, illustrates what it would have been like on a much smaller scale.

In 1834 Burn broke into the English market with the commission to complete Anthony Salvin's Harlaxton, Lincolnshire. It introduced him to a range of neo-Jacobean detailing far beyond what he could glean from Britton’s *Architectural Antiquities*. His work there consisted of lodges, garden buildings and interior work but his greatly increased vocabulary was reflected in his sophisticated neo-Jacobean Falkland and Whitehill (both 1839), Stoke Rochford (1841) and Revesby (1844) both in Lincolnshire and with much more sophisticated interior work, some of it German baroque, than anything attempted previously. Similar strides were made in his Scots revival houses from his addition to Castle Menzies (1836–40) onwards, culminating in highly sophisticated Scots Jacobean houses such as Preston, West Lothian (1840). In 1844 he moved his practice to London where he became not William Burn architect, but William Burn Esq, leaving his pupil and partner David Bryce in charge of the Edinburgh office. In London he came across the English architect-antiquary, Robert William Billings, and financed that most influential of all Scottish architectural books, *The Baronial and Ecclesiastical Antiquities of Scotland*.

Although Burn attempted to introduce the 16th-century Scottish idiom to England at the vast Franco-Scottish scheme for Fonthill, the chief beneficiary of Billings' labours was to be Bryce. The formal end of the partnership was in 1850, but even before that date Burn's outstandingly fine Poltalloch (1849) had been designed from his London office. His last Scottish houses, Buchanan (1852: a reduced plate-glass version of the Fonthill design), Balintore (1859) and Polmaise (1863) were all in the Scots 16th century idiom.

Burn's success was, however, founded on his expertise in house planning rather than mastery of period styles. His skill in the disposition of masses enabled him to produce carefully planned enfilades of principal and private apartments, the latter usually forming an identifiable private wing, with an ever-increasing emphasis on privacy from callers and servants, skilfully developing a house plan concept first seen in Scotland at Mellerstain.

Although Gillespie Graham's career as country house architect had been eclipsed by Burn’s in the early 1820s, he nevertheless produced some domestic work of extraordinary quality. From 1829 he built, evidently with some help from A W N Pugin, the great symmetrical-fronted Jacobean palace of Murthly which sadly remained unfinished. In 1838 he recast the surviving William Adam wing at Taymouth, building the Banner Hall to link it with
the main block which was greatly enriched by superb woodwork and painted decoration, again with the help of Pugin and the London decorator J G Crace, the final ensemble being the most magnificent suite of gothic apartments in the United Kingdom. Pugin was similarly involved in the unexecuted scheme of 1836 for the restoration of Holyrood Abbey, the design of Victoria Hall (latterly Tolbooth St John's) on Edinburgh's Castle Hill in 1841, and the remodelling of Brodick Castle in 1844, although the executed interior work does not correspond with the surviving drawings. Its style was echoed in his last major work, Ayton Castle (1851).

William Henry Playfair similarly received far fewer commissions than Burn, but all were of great quality. The biaxial planning of the great Elizabethan palace he built at Brownlow, Lurgan, Northern Ireland (1833), excelled anything then built by Burn in picturesque quality if not convenience, while the skilful Scots Jacobean of his remodelling of Grange and Prestongrange (both 1830) and his new-build Stonefield (1836), far excelled anything then built by Burn in terms of mastery of detail.

Playfair's most ambitious works were, however, the neo-Jacobean remodelling and enlargement of William Adam's Floors (1837) in a Heriot's Hospital inspired idiom with, rather surprisingly, Tudor hoodmoulds at the windows. Wholly English Elizabethan were his schemes for Donaldson's Hospital, the greatest Scottish building project of the age. The first scheme, a gigantic H-plan with cloistral arcaded screens closing the courts, drew inspiration from Rickman's St John's College buildings at Cambridge. Echoes of it appeared in David Rhind's Daniel Stewart's College (1848) and at Archibald Simpson's Marischal College, Aberdeen (1837), where the screen proposal was quickly discarded. The plan form of the latter derived more from Wilkins' Grecian University College London. Playfair's final quadrangular scheme for Donaldson's, many times revised, was the result of a limited competition on which C R Cockerell appears to have advised.

Other architects to show particular skill in the neo-Jacobean idiom were David Hamilton at Dunlop (1831); Burn's ex-assistant George Smith at the great tenemental terrace of Melbourne Place, Edinburgh (1840) and John Baird – with the assistance of Alexander Thomson – in the abortive schemes for the new University of Glasgow at Woodlands Hill (1846). In the same idiom but strongly tinged with continental influence was the reconstruction and enlargement of Dunrobin, where the Duke of Sutherland and the contractor-architect William Leslie rearranged Sir Charles Barry's original scheme to fit the site in consultation with him from 1845 onwards. Inspired at least in part by Scott's novel Ivanhoe, and perhaps more directly by Hopper's Gosford in Northern Ireland and Penrhyn in Wales, were Charles Barry's unexecuted schemes for remodelling Drummond, David Hamilton's Lennox (1837) and R & R Dickson's small but brilliantly picturesque addition to Dunimarle (1840).

Neo-Norman also figures in some church designs of the period, most notably at James Gillespie Graham's Parish Church at Erroll (1831) and Chapel of St Anthony the Eremite at Murthly (1846), Thomas Hamilton's large parish church at Alyth (1839), John Henderson's North Church at Stirling (1841) and David Cousin's St Thomas's Church of England and St Cuthbert's Free Church in Edinburgh (both 1843). William Burn also adopted it in a simple form at Morton Church (1839) and a number of smaller country churches, but by the late 1830s he had come to prefer Early English, most notably at West Church, Dalkeith (1840), and Langholm (1842), venturing into mid-Decorated with late 15th-century Scottish arcades in his remarkable rebuilding of St Mary's Parish Church, Dundee (1844), which drew upon his experiences in reconstructing St Giles, Edinburgh, in 1829. The early Decorated style favoured by the Tractarian movement made a pioneer appearance at Thomas Rickman's St David's Ramshorn, Glasgow (1824), but elsewhere the neo-perpendicular style introduced to
Scotland by Gillespie Graham, Elliot and Burn in the second decade of the century remained the norm for better-class church design throughout the country, the most common type being the single-span rectangle masked by a ‘nave and aisles’ front in which the ‘aisles’ demarcated the gallery stairs. It served for all the presbyterian denominations, Catholics and Episcopalians alike, with differences only in the disposition of the gallery and furnishing. Georgian neo-perpendicular church design culminated in James Brown’s ‘United Presbyterian Cathedral’, the Westminster gothic Renfield Street Church in Glasgow of 1849.

LECTURE 3


Although the revival of Scottish 16th- and early 17th-century motifs as the style commonly known as Scottish baronial was so largely his creation, Sir Walter Scott did not live to see it develop much beyond Burn’s Scots-Tudor. His own 200-foot monument, the result of a competition eventually won by Burn’s self-taught assistant, George Meikle Kemp, was still gothic with a profile which, as Thomas Hamilton unkindly pointed out having drawn on it himself at his unexecuted Knox Church project on Edinburgh’s Castle Hill in 1829, derived at least partly from Antwerp. It also seems to be, to some extent, of German Romantic origin, the top of its spire as first designed being closely related to a much smaller monument by Schinkel in Berlin. Although its lower details were Scottish Gothic from Melrose Abbey, its importance as an expression of Scott’s contribution to Scotland’s national identity was more symbolic. Nothing like it, least of all to a literary figure, had ever been built before.

In the 220-foot Wallace Monument at Stirling built by a committee of nationalists to the designs of the Glasgow architect J T Rochead in 1859, Scottishness was much more unequivocally expressed. Its immensely robust crown spire was the first really serious attempt at the revival of the late Scots gothic forms not found elsewhere in Europe.

Bold though the Scots baronial detailing of the remainder of the building was, there was nothing new about it. Scots baronial was already well established as the national style of the Scottish landed gentry, the Scottish equivalent of the gothic, Tudor and Jacobean favoured south of the Border. Robert William Billings himself designed the great castle at Wemyss Bay (1853 and 1874) and the reconstruction of the castle at Dalziel, but his strange hard-edged geometric version of Scots baronial had far less influence than his finely-drawn steel engravings. The premier exponent of the style was Burn’s partner David Bryce. Once Burn was in London from 1844, Bryce quickly developed his own characteristic style while retaining, in an updated form, Burn’s well-tried plan-types. At Inchdairnie (1845) many of the elements of his mature style were already evident, the garden front having his characteristic canted bays corbelled to the square. Rather smaller but skilfully composed and progressively bolder in composition were Stronvar (1850), Kimmerghame (1851) and Hartrigge (1854), the last adopting features from that favourite Bryce model, Maybole Castle. In his largest houses the dominant element was invariably a tower house built anew which contained the main entrance, Maybole being the model used at The Glen (1855), Fothringham (1859) and New Gala (1872). The round tower at Castle Fraser was another Bryce favourite, providing the entrance tower at Birkhill (1855), the giant Ballikinrain (1864) and Castlemilk (1863), while Newark provided that at Broadstone (1869), and Fyvie those at Craigends (1859) and Blair
Castle (1870). Pinkie was another favourite, appearing at Eaglesham (1859) as was Winton at Portmore (1850) and Halleaths (1866). Except at Blair, where a conscious effort was made to recover the former silhouette of the castle, never was there any intention of recapturing the character of ancient work so completely that the visitor might be deceived, as there was with many of Devey’s houses south of the Border. Except in a few houses which incorporated older work and were harled to match, notably Keiss (1862), Cullen (1858) and the giant Cortachy (1872) Bryce took the straightforward approach of building unmistakably 19th-century plan forms in equally unmistakable 19th-century masonry.

Bryce also has an important place in UK architectural history as one of the pioneers of the introduction of the French château manner, a development which was doubtless held to be historically justified by the Auld Alliance. From 1854 he reconstructed Playfair’s Kinnaird as a vast symmetrical French château with high pavilion roofs which also appeared at Eastburgh, Herts, built anew in 1858, and in his reconstructions of Georgian houses at Belladrum (1858), Inverardoch (1859) and Meikleour (1869), the last alas much simplified from what was originally intended. Fettes College, Edinburgh (1864–70) was his supreme achievement in that manner, outclassing even the premier French master of the genre, the Angevin architect René Hodé. The entrance tower was adapted from the Fyvie model but the other elements were drawn mainly from Blois. Bryce did not, however, attempt early French Renaissance interiors, those at Kinnaird being neo-Jacobean, essentially similar in character to those of his baronial houses.

Bryce was similarly an accomplished master of neo-Jacobean, Scots at his remodelling of Panmure in 1852, and English in the huge Langton, a very sophisticated house built anew from 1862, which challenged Salvin and Devey at their very best.

The Franco-Scottish style of Fettes, adapted in a much less expensive form by Bryce himself for the new Edinburgh Royal Infirmary (1870), immediately attracted a substantial following, notably his pupils Charles G H Kinnear of Peddie & Kinnear and James Campbell Walker. Kinnear adopted it at the Morgan Hospital, Dundee, and at Aberdeen Municipal Buildings (both 1866); Walker at the town halls at Dunfermline (1875) and Hawick (1883). Another skilful exponent of the Franco-Scottish was James Maitland Wardrop, a pupil of Thomas Brown, who may perhaps have spent some time at Bryce’s. He reconstructed Callendar Park in a François Ier based manner between 1869 and 1877, and built Stirling Courthouse anew in the idiom in 1874, omitting the Fettes-type tower originally intended.

Like Bryce, these architects were primarily exponents of the Scottish baronial manner. Walker built the colossal Blair Drummond, modelling it to some degree on Burn’s unbuilt Fonthill design. Kinnear built many houses in the Bryce manner, the best being the rather similar houses at Kinnetles (1864) and Glenmayne (1869) and a complete Edinburgh street, Cockburn Street (1859), which set the style for David Cousin and John Lessels’ Improvement Act architecture in St Mary’s Street. Bryce himself built in the baronial idiom at St Giles’ Street in the Old Town in 1872. He extended its use to suburban terraces at Marchmont where only a fragment of his scheme was realised although the spirit of it was continued by lesser hands. Of Bryce’s followers much the most important was Wardrop. His first really large house was Lochinch (1861), still very much in Bryce’s manner but with some individual French touches of its own, as befitted a house built for a French noblewoman. At the equally large Stitchill (1866) he generally followed the Fonthill/Buchanan model but with some skilful borrowings from Barry’s Dunrobin, his simpler, slightly understated, style being every bit as successful as Bryce at his best. Most remarkable of all was his massive enlargement of the early
16th-century tower house at Nunraw (1868), its immensely solid walls and small fenestration being convincingly late medieval in form to a degree never previously attempted; and although less consciously neo-medieval, his Beaufort built in the early 1880s has a massive grandeur which can make some of Bryce's houses look too cut up and overdesigned. Another particularly thoughtful design by Wardrop was Kinnordy (1879) where he adopted the early 17th-century domestic style of Pinkie, towers and angle turrets being entirely omitted. By 1882 when he and his son Hew Montgomerie Wardrop were offering sketch designs for remodelling The Hirsel they had moved away from the baronial idiom and 'Queen Anne' was one of the options. Rowand Anderson, who absorbed their practice, learned much from the Wardrops at his own Allermuir (1880) and Glencoe (1895).

John Lessels, a much older man than Wardrop or Kinnear, was another Burn pupil who excelled in the idiom at Salisbury Green House (1866), much more delicately detailed than the slightly later St Leonard's Hall (1869) nearby. He in turn was the early master of David MacGibbon, later of MacGibbon and Ross fame, who, after a spell with Burn in London, was commissioned to give the National Bank of Scotland a suitably nationalistic architectural identity in the fine Scots baronial banks at Alloa, Falkirk and Forfar (all 1861–2), a lead followed by Charles Kinnear in a large number of branch offices for the Bank of Scotland and the Royal Bank of Scotland.

Two Perth pupils of Burn and Bryce, Andrew Heiton II and David Smart, established the Bryce idiom in the east of Scotland. Heiton's early Dunalastair (1852), although strictly symmetrical, otherwise followed Bryce's style closely but his later houses show a similar asymmetry to Bryce's as at Orchill (1868) and Bonskeid (1881). Some of his later houses show other influences, such as that of Peddie & Kinnear's Kinmonth at Kinbrae, Newport (1872), or German castles as at Ravenscraig, West Ferry (1874) and Druidsmere (1887). His reputation extended far beyond Perthshire, his best surviving houses being at Giffen at Ayrshire (1869) and Vogrie, Midlothian (1875). Smart's work, as at Balhousie (1864) and Erigmore, Birnam (1862), is indistinguishable from Bryce's.

The Glasgow, Aberdeen and Inverness architects had rather more of an identity of their own. The baronial Campbell warehouse on Ingram Street, Glasgow was by Billings himself (1854) but Rochead quickly followed his lead in the lively City of Glasgow Bank buildings he built on Trongate. Charles Wilson, normally a classical designer, excelled at Lochton (1852) and St Helens, Dundee (1850), and James Smith at the enormous Overtoun, Dumbarton (1860), which has lavish Italian interior work by J Moyr Smith. The premier Glasgow exponents of the Scots baronial country house were, however, Campbell Douglas at Hartfield, Cove (1859), and Greystane near Dundee (1870) and John Burnet Senior who designed the formidable Auchendennan (1867), Arden (1866) and Kilmahew (c 1870), all of which show a markedly different personality from Bryce's.

In the north-east Thomas Mackenzie benefited from a close association with Billings when he was sketching in the area, reflected in his skilful restorations at Cawdor and Ballindalloch. He died early in 1854, leaving the field to his partner James Matthews, a much more hard-edged designer, a typical example of whose work can be seen at Ardo (1877). Matthews' partner in Inverness, William Lawrie, was a better designer. His Aigas (1877) is closer to the Kinnear model, if less robust in the detailing. In sheer scale, however, it was outclassed by Alexander Ross's colossal Ardross (1880) and in sheer eccentricity, if nothing else, by John Rhind's Ardverikie (1873).
LECTURE 4

HIGH VICTORIAN GOTHIC, 1845–90

The progression of the gothic revival from the neo-perpendicular churches, country houses and collegiate buildings of the reigns of George IV and William IV to correct Early Decorated and Early English forms drawn from the wide range of published material, including A W N Pugin's own designs for modern churches, was at first primarily a markedly upper-class Episcopal Church movement. Secular clients continued to prefer Renaissance, neo-classical and baronial models. But although many congregations, particularly United Presbyterian ones, continued to prefer classical models as being without Episcopal or Catholic connotations, the Early Decorated style of the Tractarian movement was gradually adopted by presbyterian denominations and towards the end of the century, episcopal church planning had a considerable influence on presbyterian church design.

Tractarian gothic was a development more associated with a new generation of architects rather than with established figures. David Bryce could be a skilful designer in gothic as may be seen at his reconstruction of St Nicholas, Dalkeith (1851), and at his Flemish gothic Royal Exchange at Dundee (1855). So could his partner Burn, as can be seen at the Episcopal Chapel of St Mary, also at Dalkeith, built 1844–54. But the Scottish leader of the movement, as against the major London architects invited across the Border, was John Henderson, a pupil of Thomas Hamilton. The contrast between the hybrid spire he added to the parish church at Arbroath in 1839 to his pure English Early Decorated St Mary’s Episcopal Church (1847) in the same town is marked indeed. Henderson was, however, rarely entrusted with really large churches despite his obvious success at Trinity College, Glenalmond (begun 1843), where he built a great Oxford college in the Perthshire countryside, the completion of which fell to George Gilbert Scott.

Scott was not the first major Tractarian architect to cross the Border. That distinction belongs to William Butterfield who made his début rather earlier with a minor work, St John’s School, Jedburgh (1844), before going on to design the Cathedral of the Isles on Cumbrae and St Ninian’s Episcopal Cathedral at Perth, both begun in 1849 and financed by the Hon G F Boyle, later the Earl of Glasgow. Benjamin Ferrey was the next to make an appearance at Holy Cross, Melrose, in 1846. Scott made his first serious appearance at Dundee six years later with the tall-spired church (later Cathedral) of St Paul, the continental hall church nave and aisleless apse of which has echoes of his Nicholaikirche scheme for Hamburg. His ex-assistants, William Hay and Henry Edward Coe, secured further commissions in the same years. Hay designed the very original saddleback towered church of St John at Longside, and Coe three remarkable buildings at Dundee: the giant Tudor collegiate Infirmary (1852); the 15th century English manorial Farington Hall (1853); and the episcopal church of St Mary Magdalene, not large but notable for its adoption of the so-called Gerona plan, in which the nave encompassed the width of the chancel and its aisles, a plan form which was to be particularly significant in Scottish church design later.

The Roman Catholic Church was a major builder of Pugin-inspired churches in much the same vein but had no equivalent to John Henderson. Nearly all its major commissions went across the Border. A W N Pugin never built the cathedral planned for Edinburgh but – illicitly – he did design the Catholic Apostolic Church in Glasgow (1852). His son Edward built St Mary’s, Leith (1852), and the much finer church at Glenfinnan (1873); Joseph Hansom St David’s, Dalkeith (1853), and St Mary’s, Lochee, Dundee (1865), the latter a very original
design with an octagonal tower chancel like his St Wilfrid's at Ripon; William Wardell the Immaculate Conception, Kelso (1857) and the much more ambitious Our Lady and St Andrew's, Galashiels (1856); and George Goldie St Mary's, Lanark (1856, largely rebuilt since), Our Lady of the Garioch and St John's, Fetternean (1859), and the unfinished St Mungo's, Townhead, Glasgow (1866), and St Mary's, Greenock (1862). Deeply sensitive of his honour as a church designer, the Rt Rev James Kyle, Bishop of the Northern District, rose to the challenge at the twin-spired St Peter's, Buckie (1857), a dramatic change from his basic Georgian gothic chapels of a few years earlier.

Rather surprisingly, the newly-established Free Church, which had initially rushed up very cheap gothic and Italianate churches to standard plans, proved an important patron of Tractarian architecture, at least so far as external appearances were concerned. In the 1850s the wealthier congregations began to replace them with edifices which would be a visible challenge to the Established Church. The architects particularly favoured were John, James Murdoch and William Hardie Hay, Borderers who had settled in Liverpool. Their South Church, Stirling (1851), had tall arcades and a clerestory but more usually their churches are wide single-span structures with laminated timber trusses which externally look as if they might have a nave and aisles under an overall roof. They excelled in the design of spires, ranging from the orthodox but excellently profiled Well Park, Greenock (1853), to the very original Buccleuch and Greyfriars Church, Edinburgh (1856) and former St Columba's, Brechin (1855). The last of these also shows a very orginal use of materials being built of polygonally squared 'land stones' and roofed with very large slates. Equally innovative was their small Anglo-Saxon Church at Tarfside (1859) which was built of herringbone masonry.

J T Emmet was another English architect who built for presbyterian congregations. His churches, Bath Street Independent Church (1849), Glasgow, Wilton Church, Hawick (1861), since enlarged, and Sandyford Church, Glasgow (1854), were all directly inspired by Pugin inside and out, but their influence at the time was slight.

By the 1860s some congregations of the Free and United Presbyterian church had acquired stronger tastes in their desire to express their triumph over the Established Church. These were met by Frederick Thomas Pilkington, the son of a Stamford Methodist architect Thomas Pilkington who had moved his practice to Scotland in 1853. Frederick studied first at Edinburgh University and then after three years of designing quite innovative houses such as Broomhill, Burntisland (1858) and Inchglas, Crieff (1859), toured the continent and recommenced practice in 1861, exhibiting ideal preaching church designs in a Ruskin-inspired Franco-Italian gothic with strongly textured stonework tinged with polychromy. Astonishingly he found congregations, which only a decade or two earlier had been scared to have even a bell, adventurous enough to finance these gargantuan buildings with fantastic roof structures and unfamiliar plan forms, truncated diamonds at Trinity, Irvine (1861), Penicuik South (1862) and St John's, Kelso (1865) and apple-shaped at Barclay, Edinburgh (1862). All of these were characterized by the big-scaled naturalistic carving of the Oxford Museum school, much of it sculpted by a Mr Pearce. Pilkington's domestic architecture was equally uncompromising as at Woodslee (1862), the vast Glassingal (1864), Stoneyhill (1868), and the fine Romanesque Hydropathic at Moffat (1876).

In Glasgow the key figures were John Honeyman who had returned from Burn's office in London in 1856, J J Stevenson who returned from Scott's in the late 1850s and William Leiper who had returned from the London practices of J L Pearson and William White. Each had a different solution to the problem of preaching church design. At St Mark's, Greenbank, Greenock (1861) and at the tall-spired Lansdowne Church, Glasgow (1862), Honeyman
adopted wide naves with passage aisles screened off by panelling. At Charlotte Street, Glasgow, and his tall-spired Park Church at Helensburgh (both 1862) he adopted the Puginian triple-aisled plan of Emmet’s Sandyford, little different from his own Anglican St Silas, Glasgow (1863), but, as originally fitted out, all with central pulpits. In these churches perhaps he foresaw how the liturgy of the Church of Scotland would change. Stevenson’s Italian Gothic Kelvinside Church (1862) represented a more typical solution to the problem, little different in principle from Renfield, with slim cast-iron columned arcades bearing galleries at mid shaft.

Rather similar internally was James Salmon’s elaborately polychrome interior at Anderston, Glasgow (1864), in which his son William Forrest, who was, like Stevenson, an assistant of G G Scott, probably had a hand. Both churches reflected the influence of G E Street rather than Scott. Leiper’s Dowanhill Church, Glasgow (1865), reflected his stay at Pearson’s in its fine Northamptonshire spire, but the problem of providing a large preaching space for a United Presbyterian congregation was overcome by adopting the wide hammerbeam roof of E W Godwin’s Northampton Town Hall.

By the early 1870s such solutions had ceased to satisfy the more aesthetically-minded congregations. At Camphill, Glasgow (1875), another UP church, memorable for its great Normandy gothic spire reminiscent of Pearson’s at St Augustine’s, Kilburn, London, Leiper sacrificed the single-span uninterrupted vision of Dowanhill to the insertion of good masonry arcades with galleries in the aisles. At Anderston Free (1876) and Belhaven UP (1877), Glasgow, James Sellars went further and sacrificed the gallery to a clerestory. For those who still preferred an unbroken preaching space the Sante Chapelle in Paris provided a model at Sellars’ Hillhead Established Church (1875) and Robert Baldie’s long-destroyed Kelvinside UP Church (1879) both in west-end Glasgow.

Wide preaching churches were not, however, peculiar to Presbyterian congregations. G G Scott had provided a broad nave and an apse on the Italian friars’ church model at Leith in 1861. So had the Rev Frederick George Lee and Alexander Ellis, it is said with the assistance of a scheme by G E Street, at their polychrome Italian gothic St Mary’s Episcopal Church, Aberdeen, in 1862. Scott’s executant architect at St James had been his ex-assistant Robert Rowand Anderson who largely succeeded to the Scottish episcopal church building connections of John Henderson when he died in 1862, notably at the James Brooks-like All Saints, Brougham Place, Edinburgh (1865) and St Andrew’s Church, St Andrews (1866), both with orthodox Tractarian plans. But at the giant Catholic Apostolic Church, Edinburgh (begun 1873), he adopted the friars’ church plan of a broad nave embracing the width of the chancel and its aisles, which, in a more developed form, provided the answer when the Scoto-Catholic minister of Govan, the Rev John Macleod, sought a solution to the problem of getting beauty into presbyterian worship with a preaching church in which the communion table was set up in the chancel in the same central position as an episcopal altar. Govan (1883) provided the model for J J Burnet’s equally fine Barony Church, Glasgow (1886), and Anderson’s own St Paul’s at Greenock (1890). The plan type quickly spread to the Free Church at Hippolyte Blanc’s St Luke’s, West Ferry (1884) and Perth Middle Church (1887). Within a few years the influence of Macleod’s movement, and of the Aberdeen, soon to become the Scottish, Ecclesiological Society, resulted in the building of many more presbyterian churches on the same model with an increasing tendency to Scots medieval forms.

Despite his undisputed standing as the premier Episcopal church designer in Scotland, Anderson was not among those invited to compete for the greatest Scottish church building project of the age, St Mary’s Cathedral in Edinburgh in which the Scottish architects competing against Scott, Burges and Street in 1872 were the architects to the Walker estate.
which financed it, John Lessels and Peddie & Kinnear. The Inverness architect Alexander Ross, author of the twin-towered Cathedral of St Andrew at Inverness (1866), was also invited, submitting a design largely by his London collaborator, George Freeth Roper. The assessor, Ewan Christian, recommended Street, but the chosen design, perhaps wisely, was that of Scott. The second great church building commission of the age, the Coats Memorial Church at Paisley, also eluded both Anderson and Burnet. Anderson was not among those selected to compete and the assessor, James Sellars, awarded the Commission to Blanc in 1885. As at St Mary's the deciding factor was clearly a cathedral-like image with a great central tower. Where Anderson and Burnet had solved the problem of the wide preaching church nave straightforwardly, Blanc solved it by architectural sleight of hand, in taking his oblong crossing to a square crown tower at roof level.

Anderson's supreme gothic triumphs were to be secular. Gothic had not been much adopted for secular architecture in Scotland except by English architects, notably Sir G G Scott at the Albert Institute, Dundee (1865) a fragment of his unbuilt Hamburg Rathaus project, and the University of Glasgow (1864–70) where a London-Oxford establishment caucus in the university's Removal Committee had passed over the local profession, partly in the interests of speed of construction. It is a much better building than it is generally given credit for which a very remarkable use of structural ironwork in the Bute Hall, Museum and former Library and the staircases associated with them. Although Scott persuaded his clients that it was Scottish 13th-century gothic – and there are echoes of Glasgow Cathedral chapter house – the origins of the tower and some of its other features are really Flemish. Gothic country houses were similarly rare and by English architects, most notably Matthew Habershon's Duncrub (1870) and George Edmund Street's great Romanesque library and chapel at Dunfermline which was built throughout the 1870s. Anderson apart, by far the best Scottish exponent of secular gothic was Leiper, notably at the Burges/Godwin-like Dumbarton Town Hall (1865) and the fine mansion of The Elms, Arbroath (1869). Still more indebted to Burges was John Burnet Senior's Glasgow Stock Exchange, the French gothic elevations of which drew heavily on Burges's competition designs for the Strand Law Courts in London which he was able to study by courtesy of his younger brother William, architectural clerk to the competition. It was part of a minor vogue for gothic public buildings in the 1870s. William Lawrie's Town Hall at Inverness (1878) was a much smaller building in similar vein, Andrew Heiton's Municipal Buildings at Perth (1877) followed Alfred Waterhouse's gothic model in a rather dryer monochrome form. Waterhouse's romanesque provided the inspiration for John Macleod's Christian Institute, Glasgow (1878), which in its final vast towered form was the work of Clarke & Bell and R A Bryden as late as 1895–8.

At the great palace of Mount Stuart (1878–86) for that extraordinary patron the 3rd Marquess of Bute, and at the combined Scottish National Portrait Gallery and National Museum in Edinburgh (1884–9) financed by John Ritchie Findlay, Sir Rowand Anderson put all these in the shade. There was very nearly a third major building in the group, the Caledonian Railway Offices in Gordon Street, Glasgow (1877), but an early Renaissance design was eventually preferred. That Anderson should have returned to his study tour of early gothic houses in France and Italy for inspiration after his success with the early North Italian Renaissance Medical School at Edinburgh University is surprising, and may well have been the Marquess of Bute's preference rather than his own. He had Burges's work for the Marquess at Cardiff to live up to and he rose to the occasion magnificently, the details of Mount Stuart being refined over a period of some 20 years and culminating in the chapel (1897–1902) with its Spanish gothic lantern.
The Portrait Gallery and National Museum was not so expensive a building as Mount Stuart. The square central halls have a certain similarity but in the Edinburgh building the vaults were omitted, historical murals being provided by William Hole from 1895 onwards. But the overall form of the building, especially as originally planned with circular conical-roofed corner towers – angle spires were substituted to avoid complications of room shape – was more adventurous and the sculptural treatment, achieved over a long period by the premier Scottish sculptors, altogether richer. Its anglicized Doge’s Palace-like elevations with blind top floor and the general arrangement may owe something to Russel Sturgis's Fine Art Institute in Boston, USA, but Anderson’s treatment is altogether more accomplished with a central entrance bay inspired by Italian gothic tombs. Taken together, Mount Stuart and the Findlay Building marked the supreme achievement of the mainstream ‘early decorated’ school of Gothic revival design in Scotland.

LECTURE 5

NEW TRENDS: CONTINENTAL EARLY RENAISSANCE, INFLUENCES FROM THE USA, FREESTYLE LATE GOTHIC AND THE ARTS & CRAFTS MOVEMENT, 1875–1929

Until the mid-1870s the development of the revival of medieval and Early Renaissance architecture had not been particularly complicated. There had been gothic, mainly English but with occasional experiments with French and Italian in the 1860s; neo-Norman in the 1830s, ’40s and ’50s and less frequently later; Scottish Baronial with occasional ventures into the French château manner from which it was thought to originate; and Jacobean, both English and Scottish.

Towards the end of the century there was a much wider search of the continent for new and unfamiliar motifs. It was a United Kingdom development which reflected the increasing familiarity of the well-to-do with western and southern Europe. Different styles were integrated and sometimes even contrasted in the same building. The first portent of it had perhaps been Charles Wilson’s Free Church College, Glasgow, of 1859–61. Well within the classic tradition and indeed inspired by the Italian cinquecento work of the Munich and Berlin classicists, it nevertheless had a soaring tower which was secular Italian medieval in outline: Schinkel had done something of the sort at the Zittau Rathaus, but it still foreshadowed the ‘bargello gothic’ which made occasional appearances, particularly in the industrial work of W F MacGibbon some 30 years later. Also markedly Germanic in origin and indeed directly associated with Prince Albert’s own tastes in architecture and design was the Royal Scottish Museum, Edinburgh (1861). The disciplined North Italian early Renaissance façade Captain Francis Fowke had designed to screen the Crystal Palace-inspired South Kensington exhibition halls within was unusual at the time in having touches of polychromy at its red sandstone colonnettes. The Edinburgh Office of Works apparently did not like it. Robert Matheson made several attempts to redesign it in an orthodox High Renaissance manner but the will of South Kensington prevailed.

The Royal Scottish Museum had little impact on Scottish architecture at the time but when, in 1874, the University of Edinburgh held a limited competition for a new Medical School and a graduation hall Rowand Anderson’s choice of style was North Italian early Renaissance albeit of a very different kind from Fowke’s, only partly symmetrical and with a far more generous
proportion of wall to openings. The immediate inspiration was again probably German: Anderson had travelled across Europe from Paris to Berlin, Leipzig and Aachen. But unlike Fowke, who systematized the style to answer the iron frames within, Anderson showed far more direct observation of original North Italian architecture; S Zaccaria at Venice for the entrance bay, San Marco at Venice for the unbuilt campanile, the Palazzo Fava at Bologna for the consoles of the corbelled arcade in the court. It was an extremely accomplished performance, outside and in. Nothing quite like it had been built in Britain before.

As set out in the fourth lecture, Anderson’s original plans for the Caledonian Railway’s buildings at Glasgow’s Central Station had been Mount Stuart gothic. By February 1878 they had been redesigned in an eclectic early Renaissance manner with early Italian second-floor windows, northern European-looking mullioned and transomed upper windows, tall Low Countries/Scandinavian gables and a very Scandinavian tower, all skilfully welded together into a unified design.

These developments in Anderson’s style relate interestingly to assistants and partners. The Medical School found an echo in St Aloysius College on Glasgow’s Garnethill (1883), designed by Archibald MacPherson, his assistant from 1873 to 1876. In Anderson’s partnership with George Washington Browne, formed in 1881, the Edinburgh, Glasgow and London schools at last merged. Browne had originally been a pupil of Salmon’s, then a trusted assistant of Campbell Douglas and Sellars in 1873–5 before making the predictable transfer to the office of J J Stevenson, Douglas’s former partner, where he learned the so-called ‘Queen Anne’ manner. Thereafter he made a still more advantageous transfer to W Eden Nesfield’s after a continental study tour in 1878. He must have arrived at Anderson’s just a little too late to have had made influence on the design of the Central Station as a whole though no doubt he spent much time refining the details. It was very much the sort of design he would have made himself as can be seen from the superb Flemish Renaissance tearoom he built for Miss Cranston in Glasgow’s Buchanan Street in 1896, and from the many early Renaissance Royal and British Linen Bank offices he built during his later partnership with J M Dick Peddie. Browne excelled particularly in the François Ier manner as can be seen at the Central Library, Edinburgh (1887–90), which drew heavily on such sources as Moret, the Hôtel d’Ecoville at Caen and Saint Germain-en-Laye, and the former British Linen Bank on Edinburgh’s George Street (1905). In time, Browne’s old master, Sellars, came to be influenced by Anderson and Browne as can be seen at his last work, Anderson’s College of Medicine, Glasgow (1888), which has some echoes of Anderson’s Medical School.

An important architect trained in the Anderson & Browne office was A G Sydney Mitchell, who secured the patronage of John Ritchie Findlay and the great mental institutions through his father, Sir Arthur Mitchell. In 1883 he built Findlay’s handsome early Renaissance house at 3 Rothesay Terrace, Edinburgh, together with the brilliantly picturesque Scots 17th-century fantasy of Well Court. Its Earl’s Palace type orielts were repeated at his reconstruction of Glenkindie House. His were some of the greatest commissions of the age: great castles and country houses such as Duntreath (1890), Sauchieburn (1891) and the towering Wagnerian fantasy of Glenborrodale (1898). His best work was the colossal early Renaissance Craig House and its chatelets (1889), all superbly set on the hillside at Craiglockhart, a luxurious hydropathic for the well-to-do deranged.

In 1883 Rowand Anderson & Browne merged their practice with that of Hew Montgomerie Wardrop who had been left on his own at the age of 26 by the deaths of his father James Maitland Wardrop and his partner Charles Reid. It was a meeting of like minds: the younger Wardrop was now working in a London-inspired ‘Queen Anne’ manner very much akin to Browne’s as can be seen at his reconstruction of Ballochmyle in 1886–8. He was also an early arts and craftsman in the
George Devey tradition as can be seen in his immensely tactful additions to the ancient Place of Tilliefour (1884) where Robert Lorimer was his site architect.

Lorimer found Wardrop more sympathetic than Anderson and did not stay after Wardrop's early death in 1888. Thereafter he worked in London with G F Bodley from whom he learned much in both the ecclesiastical and domestic fields: he met Norman Shaw; and he worked in the office of that great arts and craftsman, James Marjoribanks Maclaren, another architect from the Salmon and Sellars stables, who built the brilliant new wing at the Old High School of Stirling (1887), Aberfeldy Town Hall (1889), the farmhouse at Glenlyon and the hotel and half-Dorset half-Scottish thatched cottages at Fortingall (1889–91), the Glenlyon and Aberfeldy buildings showing an awareness of the work of the American architect H H Richardson. Through this select London circle he became aware of, and acquired contacts with the likes of Philip Webb (who had built an important Arts & Crafts house at Arisaig in 1863), C R Ashbee and W R Lethaby. All of this was strongly reflected in Lorimer's architecture after he returned to Edinburgh. His early harled houses, the cottages at Colinton and larger houses such as the Grange, North Berwick (1893), were developments from Maclaren's Glenlyon buildings. Brackenburgh Cumberland (1901), and Bunkershill, North Berwick (1904), showed his careful study of such Shaw houses as Dawpool and Adcote. It was, however, in his own peculiarly refined Arts & Crafts Scots baronial houses at Rowallan (1902), Ardkinglas (1906) and, finally, the brilliantly deceptive fantasy of Formakin (1908), all with a carefully studied use of materials developed from his early restoration of Earlshall (1892), that Lorimer particularly excelled. Apart from W R Lethaby's Melsetter (1898) his work was matched only by that of John Kinross and Lorimer's friend Francis Deas. Kinross was much more self-taught, apparently never having been in a really good office. The Peel (1904) and the houses in Edinburgh's Mortonhall Road, where he lived himself (1899), challenged comparison with the very best that Lorimer could do. Deas, another pupil of Anderson, excelled at Braehead, St Boswells (1905), and Fyndynate (1909). None of the other architects of the time had the same mastery of materials even although Browne and Peddie showed an equal mastery of design, notably at Browne's Johnsburn, Balerno (c 1900), and Peddie's Jacobean Westerdunes, North Berwick (1909), which challenges comparison with Lorimer's Bunkershill nearby. In his later years Sydney Mitchell came to work in an Arts & Crafts style worthy of comparison with Lorimer's, notably at his own house The Pleasaunce, Gullane (1902).

Another architect who was early into Arts & Crafts architecture was the much less well-known W L Carruthers of Inverness who had been lucky enough to find a place in the office of Sir Ernest George, an architect very nearly as able as Shaw with a skill in the use of materials which matched that of Devey. His own house Lethington (1892) was an early masterpiece of the genre as were his smaller but still better 22-26 Crown Drive (1895), both in Inverness. His later work never quite matched his early promise.

No architect practising in the west of Scotland found his way to offices quite as good as those, and the style of Shaw and his friends had to be learned more from published sources and visits to the south. The first important followers of Shaw's domestic architecture were established figures such as Sellars whose Keil (c 1880) reflected Cragside, T L Watson whose Red Hall, later Homelands on Glasgow's Great Western Road (1885) drew motifs from several of his half-timbered houses, and Leiper whose Clarendon, Helensburgh (1891), recalled Adcote.

As a domestic architect Leiper was much the most important of these. His François Ier Cairndhu, Helensburgh (1871), anticipated Browne's use of the style by a decade and a half. Like his baronial Colearn, Auchterarder (1869), and his larger and brilliantly managed
Kinlochmoidart (1884) it had aesthetic movement interior work with stained glass by Daniel Cottier, and superb Anglo-Japanese tilework by W B Simpson & Sons. Leiper's later work in the same vein such as the Red Tower, Helensburgh (1898), had rather more orthodox neo-Jacobean interiors. Most of his later houses are stylish Arts & Crafts with half-timber and strong roof shapes and chimneys which may owe something to American publications of the time as at Endrick Lodge, Stirling (1900), Morar Lodge, Helensburgh (1902), and Uplands, Bridge of Allan (1907).

Contemporary American domestic design had made occasional appearances in Scotland from the 1880s onwards. William Kidner, who had worked in Shanghai and perhaps also in the United States, designed two rather surprising American brownstone mansions near Elgin, the long and low Lesmurdie (1881) and the towered Haugh (1882). These remained isolated examples of the genre. Much more significant were American half-timbered houses designed by John Murray Robertson, a former assistant of Heiton's, at Dundee, notably The Cottage, Lochee (1880) and The Bughties, Broughty Ferry (1884), both of which showed markedly the influence of H H Richardson in the details.

American influence was also marked at times in the work of the architects who had studied at the Ecole des Beaux Arts, particularly that of John James Burnet. His Corrienessan, Loch Ard (1886), although half-timbered, was an American shingle-style verandah house on plan as well as on elevation, and had he won the competition his Clyde Yacht Club at Hunter's Quay would have been a much larger essay in the same vein: an orthodox Norman Shaw school design by T L Watson was preferred. In a different vein his reconstruction of Edinbarnet in 1889 sported an American Romanesque porch.

Burnet's major domestic work was, however, in his own particular brand of 'Scots Renaissance', a 17th-century baroque worked up in matching in a splendid billiard room and porte-cochère to Burn's neo-Jacobean Auchterarder House in 1886. Thereafter it reappeared in the large baronial Baronald (1890), a house full of original ideas, and in several public buildings notably the Public Baths at Alloa (1895) and his partner John A Campbell's Ewing Gilmour Institute at Alexandria (1888). Garmoyle, Dumbarton (1890), was a smaller, simpler Baronald with Arts & Crafts raked-joint masonry, and, like the Ewing Gilmour Institute, had its roof swept low down, American shingle-style fashion, at the back. Burnet's final major country house was Fairnalie (1904) a suaver and bolder harled version of Baronald with a superb formal garden. Alexander Nisbet Paterson, an ex-assistant of Burnet's who followed him to the Beaux Arts, designed some fine houses in a quieter version of the same vein, notably his own The Croft, Helensburgh. Another ex-assistant of Burnet's who attended the Beaux Arts was Stewart Henbest Capper whose continental travels were reflected in the brilliantly picturesque fantasy of Edinburgh's Ramsay Garden (1892) designed under the inspiration of Patrick Geddes, and continued after Capper's departure by Sydney Mitchell who succeeded no less brilliantly in the same vein. Yet another architect associated with Burnet's office was H E Clifford who built many Arts & Crafts houses which were much admired by Hermann Muthesius, most notably Stoneleigh, Kelvinside (1901), and Shennanton (c 1908).

Burnet also had a considerable influence on later 19th-century church design. It was a period of great liturgically-designed memorial churches. The design of Burnet's Barony Church was in varying degrees reflected in several, perhaps most notably T G Abercrombie's Clark Memorial Church, Largs (1892), with which he was assisted by Burnet's ex-assistant William Kerr. In the big roofed low-walled churches with sturdy towers and mixed late Gothic and Romanesque motifs Burnet designed at St Molio's, Shiskine (1886), Dundas, Grangemouth
Burnet introduced a markedly Scottish character contrasted with English Tudor half-timbered porches. Correspondence at Grangemouth reveals that Burnet favoured the type because they were inexpensive to construct leaving funds available for high quality detail. Other Glasgow architects, notably W G Rowan and H E Clifford, followed his lead at St Margaret's, Tollcross, and St Michael's, Carnyn, respectively (both 1902). The type soon spread elsewhere, a particularly good example being Thoms & Wilkie's Free Church at Edzell (1900).

The revival of the more characteristic late Scots gothic forms came surprisingly late, despite the excellent illustrations provided by Billings. Only Bryce had adopted it with his experience of Edinburgh's Trinity College Church in mind and not very successfully. Surprisingly the first major late Scots gothic building, the crown-towered St Leonard's-in-the-Fields at Perth (1885) was designed from London by J J Stevenson, who later designed the Stevenson Memorial, Glasgow (1898), and the Peter Memorial Church, Stirling (1901), in the same vein. Thereafter the late Scots gothic manner was taken up enthusiastically by a number of architects, most notably by Sydney Mitchell at his reconstruction of the Parish Church at Chirnside (1906), Lorimer's pupil Ramsay Traquair at the Christian Science Church, Inverleith, Edinburgh (1910); and Reginald Fairlie at Our Lady & St Meddan's, Troon (1911), all with oblong towers; and, most ambitiously of all, by the Aberdeen architect Alexander Marshall Mackenzie at the cathedral-like Lowson Memorial Church, Forfar (1912), with its central St Monans spire and Duffus-like manse. Although the overall effect was perhaps English rather than Scottish, late Scots gothic detail is also evident in two outstandingly fine episcopal churches by the London-based architect John Ninian Comper, who had Aberdonian origins at St Margaret's, Braemar (1898), and St Mary's, Kirriemuir (1904).

Scottish also in origin were the Romanesque churches of Peter MacGregor Chalmers, a pupil of John Honeyman, though not all of them received the St Rule and Brechin towers intended for them. Complete examples can be seen at St Ninian's, Prestwick (1908), St Leonard's, Dunfermline (c 1900), and Kirn (1906). Some of his later churches show marked continental influence, Italian at St Anne's, Corstorphine, and German at St Margaret's, Newlands (1912).

Sydney Mitchell's cathedral-like Crichton Memorial Church at Crichton Royal Hospital, Dumfries (1890), the greatest ecclesiastical commission of the era, was unaffected by the new sense of Scottish identity in church design, as indeed were most of his churches which tended to follow Rowand Anderson's late gothic models, most notably at Belford Church (1888) and Candlish Church (1900), Edinburgh. As with his domestic work some are strong in concept but indifferent in execution reflecting his over-large practice. Some of his late churches, Port Ellen (1898) and the remarkable Chalmers Memorial, Cockenzie (1904), reflect Scandinavian influence.

The last years of the century were of great complexity. In Glasgow German early Renaissance made an appearance in Baird and Thomson's tall commercial blocks notably the Liverpool, London & Globe Building (1899) on St Vincent Street and Connals' on West George Street (1898), echoes in some degree of William Hamilton Beattie's Jenners store, Edinburgh (1893) where the individual details were as much Oxford early Renaissance as German. Charles Rennie Mackintosh's designs for the Art Gallery at Kelvingrove, alas unsuccessful, mixed a wide variety of motifs drawn from his tour of Italy and combined them with more modern elements, while his Queen's Cross Church, Glasgow (1897), is one of the best examples of the increasing freedom to be seen in late gothic church design towards the end of the century, another being Salmon, Son & Gillespie's Lloyd Morris Memorial Church,
Glasgow (1902). They were also responsible for Rowantreehill, Kilmacolm (1898), Forrest Salmon's own house, which is one of the more spectacular Scottish examples of English half-timber. Their other houses, together with Mackintosh's own Windyhill (1900), Kilmacolm and The Hill House, Helensburgh (1902), have English and Scottish vernacular origins but form a separate subject. Much more consciously historical was Gillespie's free Scots Renaissance Municipal Buildings (1907), tragically unfinished, which was designed to evoke the regal splendour of Stirling in early Renaissance times. Although much good work was done after the First World War, including Lorimer's Scottish National War Memorial at Edinburgh Castle, it marked the end of an era.
Meetings of the Society, 1990–91

Monday 10 December 1990, at 6.00 pm, Dr Anna Ritchie, BA, PhD, FSA, President, in the Chair.
A ballot having been taken, the following were elected Fellows:

Milton Clemens Armstrong, BS, MBA, 165 Aston Place, Kingsport, TN 37660, U S A.
Mrs Phoebe Armstrong, 4 Oakland Road, West Monkseaton, Whitley Bay, Northumberland.
Robert Barr, Jr, 5559 Masters Boulevard, Bay Hill, Orlando, FL 32819, U S A.
Professor A R L Bell, PhD, FCMRS, FA-AA, OBK, Department of English, California State University, Long Beach, CA 90840, U S A.
Lt Col Edward F Brodie, BS, CPA, 2601 South Braeswood #701, Houston, Texas 77025, U S A.
Robert Donald Ross Brydon, 6 Raeburn Street, Edinburgh.
Ms Vivian Annette Carruthers, BA, AMA, 80(1F2) Comely Bank Avenue, Edinburgh.
Andrew Conoboy, 11 Kellie Place, Alloa.
Lt Cdr David Currie, RN(Retd), Nile Villa, 4 Meldrum Road, Kirkcaldy, Fife.
Mrs Margaret Mathieson Daniels, Scalpay, Glenbarr, by Tarbert, Argyll.
Timothy Charles Darvill, BA, PhD, FSA, MIFA, The Hermitage, 40 Wimbourne Road, Bournemouth, Dorset BH3 7AD
James Ervin Davidson PO Box 2456, Batesville, AR 72503, U S A.
Mrs Kathleen Elphinstone, BEd, Glenkiln, 1 Bain Drive, Mintlaw, Peterhead, Aberdeenshire.
James E Fargo, Rannoch Wood, 7506 Willowbrook Road, Fairfax Station, Virginia 22039, U S A.
Miss Marianne Thejls Fischer, 56 Montpelier Park, Edinburgh.
Archie L Foley, MA, DipEd, 21 Joppa Road, Edinburgh.
Ronald Douglas Fortune, 9800 Bolsa Avenue, #26, Westminster, CA 92683, U S A.
Robert E Harrison, 9790 New Glasgow Road, Scottsville, KY 42164, U S A.
John W Henderson, UE, BA, 43-7AV, Box 944, Englehart, Ontario, Canada POJ 1HO.
Mrs Alice Louise Henry, 1158 Rockstone Lane, New Brighton, MN 55112, U S A.
Dr Deborah Janet Howard, BA, MA, PhD, FSA, Department of Architecture, University of Edinburgh, 20 Chambers Street, Edinburgh.
Jeremy Huggett, BA, AIFA, Department of Archaeology, University of Glasgow, Glasgow.
David William Hutchison, RR3 Coneseon, Coneseon, Ontario, Canada, KOK 1PO.
Arthur Roy Handasyde Kellas, CMG, MA, Inverockle, Acharney, Acharacle, Argyll.
Donald G Livingston, PhD, 28 Harwich Road, Morristown, New Jersey 07960, U S A.
Alexander Banner Lyrley, BSc, JD, The Banner House, Banner Elk, N Carolina 28604, U S A.
Dennis Bell, McGill, PO Box #1091, Hickory, North Carolina 28603, U S A.
John Patrick McGourty, MA, 144 Hamilton Road, Motherwell, Strathclyde.
Euan Stewart Mclver, BA, 6 Westbank Loan, Seaview Gate, Edinburgh.
Peter Samuel McKeague, MA, 3F6, 4 Sciennes House Place, Edinburgh.
Robert McKie, 36 Trinity Gardens, London.
Robert E McLaughlin, BS, MS, PhD, 8701 Kingsridge Drive, Knoxville, TN 37923, U S A.
Andrew Simpson Mclean, 15 Mountcastle Bank, Edinburgh.
The following Communication was read:

Monday 14 January 1991, at 6.15 pm, Dr Anna Ritchie, BA, PhD, FSA, President, in the Chair. The President welcomed Fellows and guests to the temporary lecture accommodation, to be used whilst the Museum Lecture Theatre is being refurbished.

The following Communication was read:
‘The excavation of a neolithic settlement at Loch Olabhat, North Uist’, by Ian Armit, MA, PhD, MIFA.

Monday 11 February 1991, at 6.15 pm, Dr Anna Ritchie, BA, PhD, FSA, President, in the Chair. The following Communication was read:
‘The furnishing of the Palace of Holyroodhouse for the French Princes in 1796’, by Margaret Swain, MA, MBE.

Monday 11 March 1991, at 6.15 pm, Dr Anna Ritchie, BA, PhD, FSA, President, in the Chair. A ballot having been taken, the following were elected Fellows:

MRS JANET ARMSTRONG, 4 The Wynd, Canonbie, Dumfriesshire.
WILLIAM ARMSTRONG, 4 The Wynd, Canonbie, Dumfriesshire.
MISS MOIRA BISLAND, TFL, 8 East London Street, Edinburgh.
NORMAN BINNIE, 74 Marina Road, Boghall, Bathgate, West Lothian.
MRS DAPHNE BROOKE, BA, Craignair, Auchencraig, by Castle Douglas.
DR JOHN ROBERT FYFE BURT, MB, Ch B, 2 Craigluscar Court, Dunfermline, Fife.
WILLIAM SAMUEL CAUDILL, Scottish Heritage Center, St Andrews Presbyterian College, Laurinburg, North Carolina 28352-5598, U S A.
DEREK CHRISTIE, 68 Stenhouse Gardens, Edinburgh.
HARRY CRISP, MA, Longbank Farm, Alnwick, Northumberland.
DR OLAF DAVID CUTHBERT, MB, BS, MD, Vishabreck, Evie, Orkney.
MISS JEAN MARGARET EADIE, BSc, PhD, 101 St Ronan's Drive, Peterculter, Aberdeen.
MRS SANDRA FORDYCE, 1/5 Rocheid Park, East Fettes Avenue, Edinburgh.
CHARLES V FOSTER, 13 Holburn Street, Aberdeen.
DAVID L GARRISON JR, 3731 Olympia Drive, Houston, Texas 77019, U S A.
MISS CATRIONA DAWN GIBSON, 2FR, 100 Polwarth Gardens, Merchiston, Edinburgh.
MRS VALERIE GILLIES, MA M Litt, 67 Braid Avenue, Edinburgh.
MRS FRANCES SHEENA LINZEE GORDON OF CLUNY, Cluny Castle, Sauchen, Inverurie, Aberdeenshire.
THOMAS ELDER GRAY, 5 Clerwood Park, Edinburgh.
MAJOR GEORGE DAVIDSON GREENLY jr, CCM, 6554 W. Durham Ferry Road, Tracy, California, 95376, U S A.
ROBIN GUY HANLEY, BA, PhD, ‘Creagh Ghlas’, 15a Shaw Street, Hilton of Cadboll, near Tain, Ross & Cromarty.
JOHN HEREFORD HOWARD, 620 Diablo Drive, Claremont, CA 91711, U S A.
ROBERT LYDALL JOHNSTON, LIB, NP, Low Fullwoodhead, Gateside, Beith, Ayrshire.
ALEXANDER KERR, DA, Dip TP, B Arch, MRiba, MRTPI, ARIAS, 22 Napier Road, Edinburgh.
MICHAEL DAVID KING, BA, MA, MA, Flat 10, 14 North William Street, Perth.
MISS NOREANNA FIONA LAING, MA, 22 Learmouth Grove, Comley Bank, Edinburgh.
MRS VERONICA McGEEHAM LIRITZIS, MA, D Phil, 19 Elizabeth Walk, Dumfries.
DR ANGUS JOHN MacDONALD, BSc, PhD, 6 Ashgrove, Musselburgh, East Lothian.
DR PATRICK CLARE MacDONALD, BSc, PhD, 6 Ashgrove, Musselburgh, East Lothian.
JOHN JOSEPH McKILLOP, 22 Clydesdale Avenue, Netherton, Wishaw, Lanarkshire.
DONALD ANGUS MacKAY, BSc, MIFA, Royal Commission on the Historical Monuments of England, Line Building, Haymarket Lane, The University, Newcastle-upon-Tyne.
WILLIAM H McMILLIN, 25412 Pistache Court, Murrieta CA, 92362, U S A.
SAMUEL PYEATT MENEFEE, BA, B Litt, JD, LLM, FRAI, FAAA, FRSAI, PO Box 5291, Charlottesville Virginia 22905, U S A.
MISS HAZEL JANE PALMER, B Eng, (3/2) 36 Mount Stuart Street, Shawlands, Glasgow.
COL CHARLES JAMES FRASER RUSSELL, DA, FRSA, FBim, 5 Dixon Terrace, Pitlochry, Perthshire.
MISS NANCY JENNIFER RUSSELL, Cowan House, Pollock Halls of Residence, 18 Holyrood Park Road, Edinburgh.
LT CRAIG ROBERTS SCOTT, PO Box 2547, Kensington, Maryland 20891, U S A.
HOWARD E SHAW, BSc, 1101 North F Street, Lompoc, CA 93436, U S A.
DOUGLAS W SHERRATT, 2913 Tweed Court, Boise, Idaho 83702, U S A.
MISS ELIZABETH MARY BREBNER TOUGH, MA, 33 Collieston Road, Bridge of Don, Aberdeen.
MRS MARJORIE WATT, MA, Garthfield, Allenfield, Ayr.
DR PIERRE VALETTE, 6 Avenue du Mont Aigoual, 30120 Le Vigan, France.
CLAUDIO ZAZZATTA, 2 Morrishall Road, Calderwood, East Kilbride.

The following Communication was read:
‘The Production of stone axes in Northern Britain: recent excavations at Killin, Perthshire’, by Mark Edmonds, BA, PhD, FSA Scot.

Monday 8 April 1991, at 6.15 pm, Dr Anna Ritchie, BA, PhD, FSA, President, in the Chair.
This being an open lecture, advertised to the public as part of the Third Edinburgh International Science Festival, the President welcomed all the guests to the meeting.
The following Communication was read:
‘Disease in Scotland’s past: the evidence from the bones’, by Juliet Cross, BSc, PhD, FSA Scot.
Monday 13 May 1991, at 6.15 pm, Dr Anna Ritchie, BA, PhD, FSA, President, in the Chair.
This being the annual Public Lecture, the President welcomed all guests to the meeting.
The following Communication was read:
‘Scottish place names: signposts to the past’, by W F H Nicolaisen, PhD, MLitt, Distinguished Professor
of English and Folklore at the State University of New York at Binghampton.

Monday 10 June 1991, at 6.15 pm, Dr Anna Ritchie, BA, PhD, FSA, President, in the Chair.
This being the occasion of the first joint meeting with the Friends of the National Museums of
Scotland, the President welcomed all present to the meeting, and Sir Mark Russell, President of the
Friends, expressed the hope that such ventures would continue.
The following Communication was read:
‘The Sources of early medieval animal ornament of the British Isles’, by Dr Carola Hicks.

Monday 14 October 1991, at 6.00 pm, Dr Anna Ritchie, BA, PhD, FSA, President, in the Chair.
The following Communication was read:
‘The Norse, the Northern Isles, and the North Atlantic: connections and context;’, by Professor C D
Morris, BA, FSA, FSA Scot, MIFA.

Monday 11 November 1991, at 6.00 pm, Dr Anna Ritchie, BA, PhD, FSA, President, in the Chair.
This being a joint meeting held with the Prehistoric Society, the President welcomed all present.
The following Communication was read:
‘New light on Neolithic rock carving: the petroglyphs at Greenland, Dumbartonshire’, by Euan W
MacKie, BA, PhD, FSA, FSA Scot.

ANNIVERSARY MEETING

Minutes of the Anniversary Meeting held in the Lecture Theatre, Royal Museum of Scotland, on
Saturday 30 November 1991, at 4.00 pm, Dr Anna Ritchie, BA, PhD, FSA, President, in the Chair.
The scrutineers for the ballot for office-bearers, Mr R Callander and Mr J Davidson, were
appointed and the ballot was closed.

ANNUAL REPORT

The Secretary read the following Annual Report:

Membership

The Fellowship of the Society now stands at 2721. In the past year 126 Fellows have taken up
election, or been reinstated, and 98 names have been removed from the Roll, due to resignation, death,
or lapse of subscription. In December the Society elected one new Honorary Fellow, Professor Dr W
Groenman-van Waateringe of the University of Amsterdam. We are sorry to record the death of another
of our Honorary Fellows, King Olav V of Norway, in January. There are, at present, 21 Honorary
Fellows.

Meetings

The Society has held a full programme of activities through the year. General meetings were held
monthly from October to June. In the second half of the session these took place in the University, in the
lecture theatre of the David Hume Tower, as the Museum lecture theatre was out of use. We are pleased
to be back, once more, in the Museum, and look forward to returning to the newly refurbished lecture
theatre. In accordance with custom, the session included a Public Lecture and this was a great success, as
was an open lecture held during the Science Festival. In order to strengthen our links with fellow
Societies, one lecture was held jointly with the Prehistoric Society and another with the Friends of the
National Museums of Scotland.

In addition to the monthly lectures, the Rhind Lectures took place in November, when Dr David
Walker delivered a series of papers on The revival of medieval and early renaissance architecture in
Scotland, 1745–1930. This was a very popular Rhind series, and attracted a large audience from all over
Britain. There was also a very successful conference in May on Scottish Pottery from 1700 to the Present.
In June we were able to enjoy the good weather of early summer for a combined excursion and acquisitions meeting to Shambellie House and other sites in New Abbey, Dumfriesshire. One Buchan Lecture took place, in October, when Mr John Barber spoke in Kirkwall, Orkney.

The North-East Section

The Section held eight meetings with essentially the same programme as in Edinburgh. Following the Annual General Meeting in Aberdeen Art Gallery, the President of the Society spoke on The Jarlshof Graffiti: was the artist a Pict or a Viking? The lectures were well attended, and membership of the Section stands at 253. Summer excursions were organized to Balbegno Castle and Benholm Mill, Grandholm Estate, some stone circles on Deeside, and the Marine Labs at Torry Research Station.

The committee for 1990-91 was: Judith Stones (chairman), Juliet Cross (vice-chairman), Neil Curtis (secretary), John Cruse (treasurer), with Judith Cripps, Betty Dransart, Alexandra Shepherd, Graham Steele, Bob Watt, and Clare Yarrington. At the AGM in May, Mrs Alexandra Shepherd was elected chairman, and Frank Donnelly and Anne Johnston were elected as committee members.

Research

The Society received several applications for research grants, and we were able to assist a range of projects:

Survey: gravestone survey in lowland Scotland (Mrs E Willsher, St Andrews);

Excavation:
- the southern Hebrides Mesolithic Project (Dr S Mithen, University of Cambridge);
- The Early Christian site at Whithorn, Dumfries & Galloway (Mr P Hill, Whithorn Trust);
- possible Early Christian levels at Tarbat Old Church, Easter Ross (Ms G Harden, Glen Urquhart);

Post-excavation: the South Nesting Palaeolandscape Project, a study of burnt mounds on Shetland (Dr T P O'Connor and Mr S J Dockerill);

Documentary analysis:
- research on Duncan Mackenzie and his contribution to the study of the archaeology of Crete (Dr N Momigliano, University of Oxford);
- work on the deserted post-medieval settlements of Sutherland (Dr M Bangor-Jones, Dundee).

There were no applications for Young Fellows Bursaries to attend conferences, but 1991 was a year for the Chalmers-Jervise Prize, and this was awarded to Dr Ian Smith for his essay on Sprouton, Roxburghshire, an early Anglian centre of the eastern Tweed basin.

Publications

Volume 119 of the Proceedings was published in January 1991, and this is a fine addition to the series. Volume 120 has been subject to some delay, but we hope that it will be published soon. The Editor and his Assistant Editors must be thanked for the work that they put into the production of the individual volumes to ensure a series of which we can be proud. In an effort to improve the production schedule for the Proceedings, the decision was taken to employ professional help in copy-editing, rather than continue to rely entirely on the goodwill and spare-time of the Editor and the Assistant Editors. The latter, Mrs Fionna Ashmore, and Mr George Dalgleish, have kindly stepped down in order to make way for a copy-editor, and we are most grateful to them for all their hard work on the Society's behalf over the years.

No Monographs were published in 1991, but one volume is nearing completion, and several further volumes are in the pipeline. Mrs Shepherd, editor, and Mr Campbell, administrator, must be thanked for their work, which enables the Society to maintain a flourishing series. All previous monographs are selling well, though we still have good stocks of each and a new leaflet about the series has recently been circulated to Fellows.

Two issues of the Newsletter were produced to keep Fellows up to date with the affairs of the Society. The date of the Spring issue is to be changed to February.

In July, we were pleased to see the publication of a recent series of Rhind Lectures, when Edinburgh University Press published The Ancient Slavs by Dr Martin Gojda of the Archaeological Institute in Prague.
The Work of the Society

Society activities continue to flourish. In addition to the regular affairs of the Fellowship, the Society has maintained an active position in the wider field of heritage management. Throughout the year, we have been consulted on many issues by a variety of bodies, and our own representatives have worked hard to provide an input to other bodies. The Society is now a member of the Scottish Wildlife and Countryside Link, and this provides much information on the activities of voluntary bodies working in related fields, as well as helping to ensure the place of the archaeological and historical heritage in wider conservation matters.

Society work such as this draws on a broad range of skills, and members of the Heritage Committee work particularly hard to assist the Secretary in these wider matters. Membership of any Society committee is no sinecure, however, and all those who play a part in the complex affairs of the Society must be thanked.

Perhaps the most exciting development for the Society during the year has been the progress of plans for the new Museum of Scotland. This is something for which the Society has waited long, and it is a particular pleasure to be able to report that the National Museums of Scotland are now well underway with the development of this project. The winners of the architectural competition for the design of a building to house the new museum have been announced, and individual museum departments are already considering the exhibitions that will be on display. During the summer, the museum mounted an excavation on the Chambers Street site where the new museum will be built.

The new building will also provide facilities for the Library, which is to move from Queen Street. In recognition of the long and close relationship between the Society and the Museum, an appeal for funds to assist the development of facilities for the new Library and Information Centre was launched in September. As a part of the Appeal, Fellows and their guests, attended an informal and entertaining evening in October to assist our efforts. We are grateful to all those who donated objects, time and money, and who did so much to make this appeal a success.

Administration

This year has seen a major change to the Office, when Mrs Meldrum retired from her work with the Society at the end of October. Mrs Meldrum has had a long association with the Society, including twelve years as Assistant Treasurer, and the Society has benefited greatly from her expertise over the years. Mrs Meldrum's successor is Mrs Maureen McLeod who will doubtless become a familiar face to Fellows over the coming years.

One other administrative change has taken place, namely the amalgamation of the three ballots for new Fellows into an annual ballot, to take place at the Anniversary Meeting. This should ease the office workload considerably, and allow Mailings to Fellows to be spread more evenly through the year, with the January Newsletter put forward to February. We hope that this might be more satisfactory to Fellows than the long gap without any communication which previously took place between January and September. The election of Councillors and other Officers will take place in November at the Anniversary Meeting, as before, and new Fellows elected in November will be entitled to the volume of the Proceedings published for the year of their election.

Meanwhile, the Office work is considerably eased by the voluntary help provided by Fellows. If you think you could spare one morning two or three times a year then please consider putting your name down on our volunteer list. Thanks for voluntary work are due in particular to Mr H Tilling for checking Fellows' post codes, and to the band of envelope fillers: Miss M E Doull; Mr R Callander; Lady Elliot; Mr H G Ford; Miss M F Froude; Mrs A Gray; Mrs S Grossmith; Mr K Hay; Miss M R Hilton; Mrs B J Murray; Mrs A Macaulay; Mr & Dr R W Munro; Mr J P Shepherd; Miss J Sym; and Mrs M N Weston. Thanks are also due to the various members of the Museum staff who help with bookings, with projection, and with our other arrangements.

The Treasurer read the following Treasurer's Report:

As predicted in the last financial report, the relatively healthy surplus for the years 1988–9 and 1989–90 has not been maintained, and in 1990–91 the accounts show a surplus reduced to £1125 with the prospect of a deficit in the present financial year. Although income from Fellows' subscriptions has continued to rise, there has been a slight decrease in the income from other sources and, with the general
drop in interest rates, the Society will no longer benefit to the same extent as in previous years from cash held at the bank. The investment income from stocks and shares has also shown a small drop which may be expected to continue into the current financial year. On the other hand, the Society’s capital, on which it will rely in the long term for its financial stability, has grown.

The Society’s expenditure continues to rise, partly because of inflation but also as a result of the increase in the number of the Society’s activities and its enhanced role in Scottish archaeology. The salary bill has shown a modest increase which hardly reflects the extra burdens that we are placing on the staff, both paid and honorary. It is becoming more difficult to run the Society on voluntary lines and, in future, it will be necessary to devote more of our resources to pay for the services that are essential for the smooth running of what is now Britain’s largest archaeological and antiquarian society.

It is five years since the last rise in the subscription and in that period the Society has worked hard to contain expenditure while, at the same time, increasing services. If, however, the present level of activities is to be sustained and the long-term financial health of the Society secured, it will be necessary to raise the Society’s subscription income, and revised subscription rates of £25 for Fellows, £20 for retired Fellows, and £10 for family Fellows are proposed for the subscription year beginning July 1992. The additional income will be used to ease pressure on the staff, to further the publication aims of the Society, to underpin research through meetings, conferences and grants to scholars, and, in the longer term, to bolster the Society’s investments. The latter is an important consideration as, unlike other large antiquarian societies, such as the Society of Antiquaries of London or Newcastle, we have not benefited to the same degree from substantial legacies in this century, and consequently we still rely heavily on subscriptions for our income. It is in our long-term interest to build up the Society’s capital reserves through subscriptions and legacies.

The Treasurer closed with a personal note of thanks to Mrs Meldrum for all that she had done for the Society, and for being a great source of support and advice to him.

Both Reports were accepted unanimously.

The Subscription Rise

The President drew attention to the rise in subscriptions, proposed in the Treasurer’s Report, and this was approved unanimously by the meeting.

The Ballots

The ballot for Council resulted in the election of Dr Richard Fawcett as Vice-President, and Mr R Maurice Carmichael, Mrs Jane Murray, Mr Trevor Cowie, and Professor Christopher D Morris as new Councillors.

Council for 1991–92 comprises:

**PRESIDENT:** Anna Ritchie, BA, PhD, FSA  
**VICE PRESIDENTS:** Athol L Murray, MA, PhD, LLB, FRHistS  
Lionel J Masters, BA, FSA  
Richard Fawcett, BA, PhD, FSA

**COUNCILLORS:** Iain G Brown, MA, PhD, FSA, FRSA  
Ian Morrison, MA, PhD  
Carol Swanson, MA, MSc, PhD, MRTPI  
Naomi E A Tarrant, BA, AMA  
Lesley Macinnes, MA, PhD, FSA  
Professor Gordon R Nicoll, CEng, FRSE  
Alison Sheridan, MA, PhD  
Humphrey G Welfare, BA, MLitt, FSA, MIFA  
R Maurice Carmichael  
Trevor G Cowie, MA  
Professor Christopher D Morris, BA, FSA, MIFA  
Jane Murray, BA

**SECRETARY:** Caroline R Wickham-Jones, MA, FSA, MIFA  
**TREASURER:** Jack B Stevenson, BA, FSA, MIFA
EX OFFICIO:

Publications Convener
Research Convener
Finance & Administration Convener
Chairman of North-East Section
Representative, Trustees of the National Museums of Scotland

Barbara E Crawford, MA PhD
John C Barrett, BSc, FSA
Humphrey M Holmes, CA
Alexandra Shepherd, MA
Ronald D Cramond, MA, MBIM

ASSESSORS:

Director,
Keeper of Archaeology,
Keeper, History and Applied Arts,
Representative,
Representative to the Ancient Monuments Board

Robert G W Anderson, BSc, MA, DPhil, FRSC
David V Clarke, BA, PhD, FSA
Dale Idiens, BA
James Hogarth, MA
W David H Sellar, BA, LLB, FRHistS

* In view of the recent resignation of the Editor, an Editorial Board has been appointed in order that the production of the Proceedings may continue, but the election of a new Editor is deferred until the next Anniversary Meeting in 1992.

The Fellows Ballot resulted in the election of two Honorary Fellows:

Dr Robert Geoffrey William Anderson, BSc, MA, DPhil, FRSC
National Museums of Scotland, Chambers Street, Edinburgh;

Dr Kristian Kristiansen
The National Forest and Nature Agency,
Slotsmarket 13, Horsholm,
DK-2970, Denmark;

and the following were elected Fellows:

JOHN COPE ABBOTT, 118 Wilson Road, Bedford, MA 1730–1323, U S A.
ERIC MICHAELAINLEY, MA, MSc. 12 Woodridge Way, Northwood, Middlesex.
MRS JEAN McLACHLAN AITKEN, MA, Brae O’Kilmahew, Cardross, Dumbarton.
DR ANWAR JAMIL AKHTAR, BSc, MB, ChB, FRCPE, 5 West Savile Road, Edinburgh.
DON ALDRIDGE, BSc, Drumbeth, Duchess Street, Stanley, Perth.
MRS MARGARET E ALEXANDER, MA, 10 Milverton Avenue, Bearsden, Glasgow.
W MRS ETHEL ANDERSON, Arranmore, 3 Stanley Avenue, Ardressan, Ayrshire.
JAMES NEAL ANDERSON, 1947 Kensington High St, Libburn, Georgia 30247, U S A.
ALAN BEATTIE ARMSTRONG, 35 Kippielaw Medway, Dalkeith, Midlothian.
GENE FARROW ARMSTRONG, 402 Lewis Street, Dallas, North Carolina 28034, U S A.
ROBERT S ARMSTRONG, 102 Yorkshire Drive, Pittsburgh, Pa 15238, U S A.
MRS HAZEL LYNNE ARNOTT, BA, East Redford House, 133 Redford Road, Edinburgh.
LESLEY AUSTIN, Manse Cottage, Kirkoswald, Maybole, Ayrshire.
JOHN H BALLANTYNE, CA, 6 Mansfield Place, Edinburgh.
DR PATRICK JOHN BARDEN, PhD, BVSc, FRCVS, Birrfield, Rumbling Brig, Kinross.
STEWARD PATRICK FRANK BEGG, MA, Top Flat Left, 36 Hillside Crescent, Edinburgh.
MRS SUSAN BELL, Culter House, Coulter, Biggar, Lanarkshire.
JOE CONNALL BELL, 2288 Casa Grande, Pasadena, CA 91104, U S A.
MRS ISABELLA GOLD BLACK, MA, 7 Boswell Court, Millbrae Road, Langside, Glasgow.
NORMAN D BLAIR, BSEE, 42 Essex Drive, Mendham, NJ 07945, U S A.
WILLIAM GORDON BLAIR, BA, 7d Kempock Place, Gourock, Renfrewshire.
MISS ANNE BOWMAN, BA, PIFA, Maritime Archaeologist, Department of Archaeology, University of Durham, 46 Saddler Street, Durham.

PROFESSOR RICHARD BRADLEY, MA, FSA, MIFA, Department of Archaeology, The University, Reading.

ALASTAIR BRAND, BA, 2 Springfield Buildings, Edinburgh.

MRS ANN BRAY, MA, Rockingham, Shore Road, Kilcreggan, Helensburgh, Dunbartonshire.

JOHN TERENCE BRAY, BSc, FGS, Rockingham, Shore Road, Kilcreggan, Helensburgh, Dunbartonshire.

MRS DOREEN BROWN, 64 Orchard Road, Edinburgh.

DR ALAN JAMES BRUFORD, BA, PhD, South Mains, West Linton, Peebleshire.

DR PAUL CHRISTOPHER BUCKLAND, BSc, PhD, FGS, FRES, Department of Archaeology & Prehistory, University of Sheffield, Sheffield.

CHRISTOPHER GEORGE PEARSON BURGESS, Ffr, 20 Arden Street, Edinburgh.

ANDREW HUGH CADMAN, BBusSc, Masson Hall, 2 South Lauder Road, Edinburgh.

MRS RUBY GUIDROZ CAMPBELL, MS, MEd, PhD, 3310 Fairway Drive, Baton Rouge, LA 70809, USA.

KERRY JAMES CARDELL, BA, MEd, Linton Court, Murieston Road, Edinburgh.

MISS ANN CARRINGTON, BA, 10 Marchmont Street, (1st Floor), Edinburgh.

MS ROSALIND L CHEYNE, 9 Westfield Terrace, Aberdeen.

ROBERT MUREL CLARK, JR, JD, 4627 North Central Expressway, Knox Central Place, No 2000, Dallas, Texas 75205.

GAVIN CLARKE, DipQS, ARICS, 31 Newton Crescent, Dunblane, Stirlingshire.

WILLIAM CLEMENTS, Flat 3/1, 18 Nithsdale Drive, Strathbungo, Glasgow.

ROBERT EDWARD CLOSE, BA, 1 Craigbrae Cottages, Drongan, Ayr.

DR ERIC NICOL CLOUSTON, MA, PhD, 150 High Street, Chesterton, Cambridge.

CARLTON HUGH COOK, 2105 Charlotte, Raleigh, NC 27607, USA.

MRS JANET COWE, 10 Ravensdowne, Berwick-upon-Tweed.

MRS KATHLEEN DALYELL, The Binns, Linlithgow, West Lothian.

THOMAS WILLIAM EGGELING, Stackald Brae, Donnies Lane, Stromness, Orkney.

ANDREW INNES FARRAR, 74 Leamington Terrace, Edinburgh.

MRS MOIRA ELIZABETH FINDLAY, BSc, 1 Douglas Drive, Cambuslang, Glasgow.

JAMES A FINEGAN, PO Box 1624 Vhfs, Warrenton, VA 22186, USA.

NORMAN JAMES FIRTH, MA, 35 Mcleod Road, Dumbarton.

DOM AMBROSE FLAVELL, OSB, MA, Pluscarden Abbey, Elgin, Morayshire.

MRS SUSAN ANN FLETCHER, BA, Blackmill Cottage, Glen Lonan Road, Taynuilt, Argyll.

MRS WENDY JANE FORREST, DA, 9 Westfield Terrace, Aberlour, Morayshire.

MRS SUSAN ALAN FRASER, MA, School of Scottish Studies, University of Edinburgh, 27 George Square, Edinburgh.

ALEXANDER GALBRAITH, Lynwood, 12 Station Avenue, Inverkip, Greenock, Renfrewshire.

MRS CATHERINE M GIBSON, 10 Hillfoot Drive, Bearsden, Glasgow.

MRS MARGARET R GILL, 48 Ardean Court, Ardrossan, Ayrshire.
PROFESSOR DANIEL GILLIS, PhD, PO Box 29136, Philadelphia, PA 19127, U S A.
MICHAEL GILMAN, BA, 6 Osborne Road, Egham, Surrey.
JOHN GEOFFREY GLEAVE, BA, FRSA, 24 Muirpark Way, Drymen, Glasgow.
BRUCE KIRKNESS GORIE, Solbakk, Reid Crescent, Kirkwall, Orkney.
MRS DOROTHY M GORMLIE, DipCOT, MBAOT, 20 Arthurlie Street, Barrhead, Glasgow.
GENERAL SIR MICHAEL GOW, GCB, 18 Ann Street, Edinburgh.
MARTYN GREGORY, 34 Bury Street, St James's, London.
MRS HELEN HAMMOND, BA, 10 Carrington Street, 2r, Glasgow.
JOHN MARTIN HANKS, BA, AGA, PGCE, 60 Howard Street, Oxford.
STUART LOWE HARRIS, 23 Dovencot Grove, Edinburgh.
STEPHEN HARRISON, BA, FSA, FMA, MBIM, Langley House, Ramsey Road, Laxey, Isle of Man.
STEPHEN BRUCE HAY, Falcon Stone, 7 Orchard Park, Crieff, Perthshire.
JAMES THOMAS HAYS, jr, R.d. Box 29, Trembleau Park South, Keeseville, NY 12944, U S A.
DR SUSAN K HEMMINGS, BSc, PhD, 4 Knowes Road, Haddington, East Lothian.
MISS ELIZABETH MARGARET HENDERSON, 260 Blackness Road, Dundee.
JAMES BRUCE HENRY, Pinewood, Broadlie Road, Neilston, Glasgow.
DR ALBERT GEORGE HIGHLAND, MC, BA, PhD, Gateside House, Gateside, Cupar, Fife.
ANTHONY J HOWARD, LLB, FRGS, 30 Roslings Close, Chelmsford, Essex.
DR CHRISTOPHER ELWIN HOWLETT, BA, PhD, PGCE, 19 Ermine Street South, Papworth Everard, Cambridge.
JACK EDWARD HOXLEY, Waterhead, Coulter, Biggar, Lanarkshire.
FRASER JOHN HUNTER, BSc, Finnart, Larg Road, Stranraer, Wigtownshire.
ROBERT Llewellyn Hunter, 69 Craighill Drive, Clarkston, Glasgow.
MRS SUSAN LESLEY HUNTER, 69 Craighill Drive, Clarkston, Glasgow.
MRS WILLIAMINA HUNTER, 7 Netherby Apts, 1 Netherby Road, Cults, Aberdeen.
WILLIAM HENRY HURRY, Atoll Drive, Corona Del Mar, CA 92625, U S A.
MS JINNY HUTCHISON, MA, MSc, Historic Scotland, Room 367, 20 Brandon Street, Edinburgh.
JOHN A HUMPHREY, 126 Will Scarlet Lane, Williamsburg, VA 23185, U S A.
MRS P ANN JANY, BARONESS CANNESBIE, Sonnenhang 11, D-7035, Waldenburg.
WILLIAM JAMES JENNITT, 65 Woodilee Road, Motherwell, Lanarkshire.
DANIEL ALEXANDER JOHNSTON, BA, MIFA, 1 Randolph Place, Edinburgh.
HARRY M JONES, CEng, MIEE, 52 Craigleith View, Edinburgh.
WILLIAM KELLOCK, MIBS, Grianan, Spean Bridge, Inverness-shire.
MISS LESLEY LOVEL KETTERINGHAM, FSA, 3 Churchill Road, Lairg, Sutherland.
DON H LANGFORD, BA, 8767 S W, 129th Street, Miami, Florida 33176, U S A.
DOUGLAS GRANT LAW, Harbour Inn, Bowmore, Isle of Islay.
FRANK ALLEN LESTER, AB, BRFA, MA, 125-e Durwood Road, Knoxville, Tennessee 37922, U S A.
MS BETTY C LEVENER, 126 Will Scarlet Lane, Williamsburg, VA 23185, U S A.
PETER N LEWIS, MA MPhil, 12 Curling Pond Court, Cupar, Fife.
PIPE MAJOR WILLIAM LIVINGSTONE, JR, BA, LLB, Rr z, Whitby, Ontario, Canada.
DR WILLIAM LONIE, BSc, PhD, 11 Dean Place, Newstead, Melrose, Roxburghshire.
MISS DOROTHY MUIR LOW, MA, 1336 Pollockshaws Road, Glasgow.
MRS SHEILA McCLURE, MA, ALA, 17 Greenhorn's Well Drive, Falkirk.
ROGER WARING McCREDIE, BA, 39 Larchmont Road, PO Box 18152, Asheville, NC 28814, U S A.
FRANCIS R Mc Donald, 4511 Bluebird Lane, Laramie, Wyoming 82070, U S A.
MS ISOBEL McDonald, MA, 10 Marchhall Crescent, Edinburgh.
RANALD A MacDONALD, FSHAA, MRSH, 122 Lauriston Place, Edinburgh.
KENNETH JOHN NIXON McDougall, BSc, C/o Cray Research (UK) Ltd, Oldbury, Bracknell, Berks.
DR COLIN CRAWFORD JOSEPH MacFADYEN, BSc, PhD, The Mound, Courthill, Dalry, Ayrshire.
ALAN J McGOWAN, C/o Nairn Literary Institute Museum, Viewfield House, Nairn.
LADY MARY McGREGOR, Upper Sonachan, Dalmally, Argyll.
ANGUS ALLAN MacINNES, 36 Eastfield, Edinburgh.
DUGALD ALEXANDER MacInNES, BA, DAPDip, 3 Stirling Road, Kilsyth, Glasgow.
JOHN P McKay, BA, 923 N. Highland, Fullerton, CA 92632, U S A.
DONALD MacKILLOP, Aird Mo Ruin, Ferry Road, Berneray, Lochmaddy, Isle of N Uist.
GORDON KEITH MacLACHLAN, BSc, MRVS, The Sheiling, Brough, Dunne, Thurso, Caithness.
CHARLES ANDREWS MacLAUGHLIN, CE, San Antonio Avenue, PO Box 3183, Carmel-by-the-see, CA 93921, U S A.
IAN MacLENNAN, 39 Methil Road, Port Glasgow, Renfrewshire.
ALASTAIR MACLEAN MacLEOD, BA, DCG, Ljothus, 3 King Street, Kirkwall, Orkney.
JOHN MONCRIEFF MacMILLAN, 108 West Bow, Edinburgh.
CHARLES A McNEILL JR, 1098 Ladera Lane, Santa Barbara, CA 93108, U S A.
JOHN McNEILL, BA, MSc, 326 Lanark Road, Auchenheath, Lanark.
MRS NANCY MacNEIL OF BARRA, 5/8 Fountainhall Road, Edinburgh.
ROBERT MacINTOSH MacPHerson, Backhill of Auchmackar, Mintlaw, Peterhead, Aberdeenshire.
KENNETH I MALCOLM, ACIS, ACIB, AIB(SCOT), Bank House, 1 Clan Road, Dundee.
MERYVYN JAMES MALCOLM, K St J, TD, Little Barton, Tipton St John, Sidmouth, Devon.
THOMAS ROSS ANTHONY MALCOLM, BA, BCL, 58 St Sulphite Road, Westmount, Quebec, Canada.
MRS JANET MARSHALL, North Lodge, Gartocharn, Alexandria, Dunbartonshire.
REVEREND DENNIS ALBERT MARSHALL-BOYALL, DD, DLitt, ThB, 1 Cranleigh, Standish, Wigan, Lancs.
DR ROBERT MATHIESON, MB, ChB, FRCPATH, BA, MA, 62 Sydney Street, Cambridge.
MRS ANN M MILES, Deegala, Ramsay Road, Banchory, Kincardineshire.
DR STEVEN MITTHEN, BA, MSc, PhD, The Mcdonald Institute for Archaeological Research, 62 Sydney Street, Cambridge.
DR JANET MORGAN, MA, MA, DPhil, 13 Dean Terrace, Edinburgh.
DAVID GORDON MURRAY, 4 Moray Place, Edinburgh.
DAYTON J MURRAY, 9650 45th Way North, Pinellas Park, Florida 34666, U S A.
BOB J NEIL, 205 Dogwood Lane, Black Mountain, NC 28711, U S A.
MRS JULIA SEWARD NEIL, 205 Dogwood Lane, Black Mountain, NC 28711, U S A.
DESMOND JOSEPH O`BRIEN, MA, Droman House, Lasswade, Midlothian.
MAJOR PAUL IAN CRAVEN PAYNE, FRGS, Whitehall, Old Cleeve, Minehead, Somerset.
REVEREND MRS ISABELLA MCDONELL PENNINGTON, MA, BD, Red House, Penpont, Thornhill, Dumfriesshire.
MISS WINIFRED EVELYN PHILLIPS, DipArch, 304 Addison House, Grove End Road, London.
PAUL STEVEN PILLATH, MSc, BSc, DipArch, DipUD, MRTPI, 17 Stanley Street, Aberdeen.
DUNCAN KENNETH RAITT, BEng, 113 Kilmarnock Road, Top Left, Glasgow.
JEFFREY COLIN RANKIN, LLB, 31 Langside Park, Kilbarchan, Johnstone, Renfrewshire.
PAUL DAVID RODGERS, 73G Whitehall Place, Aberdeen.
PHILIP DAVID SANDS, BA, Silverhill, Woodlands of Durris, Banchory, Kincardineshire.
MS BARBARA G SCOTT, MA, 121 W. Thorne Street, Ripon, WR 54971, U S A.
RICHARD SHAW SERMON, BA, Hill Rise House, Hethe, Bicester, Oxon.
JAMES DICKINSON SHAW, 9210 Kingsbury Drive, Silver Spring, Maryland, 20910-4259, U S A.
MISS MHAIRI BELVA SHEWAN, 61 Albury Road, Aberdeen.
DUNCAN JOHN MUNRO SIMPSON, BEng, 2 Strond, Isle of Harris.
RT REVEREND MICHAEL SKELLY, 6 Marryat Street, Dunde.
DR ANDREW JOHN SLOAN, BSc, MLitt, EdD, LLB, Moonlight House, Killowcraw Shore, by Cambeltown, Argyll.
REVEREND ALBERT EDWARD SMITH, BD, Cathedral Manse, Dunkeld, Perthshire.
MICHAEL FORBES SMITH, BSc, HMConsul, British Consulate General, Dufourstrasse 56, 8008 Zurich, Switzerland.
RUSSELL A SMITH, 3 Massachusetts Avenue, Cherry Hill, New Jersey 08002, U S A.
PROFESSOR THOMAS CHRISTOPHER SMOUT, MA, PhD, FRSE, FBAZ, Chesterhill, Shore Road, Anstruther, Fife.
GAIVIN SPROTT, MA, 10a Warrender Park Terrace, Edinburgh.
The President welcomed new officers and Councillors to the Society, and all new Fellows. The Honorary Fellows were especially welcomed. Dr Anderson is to leave Scotland in the new year, to take up office as Director of the British Museum: the best wishes of the Society go with him, in his new post.

The Roll

The record of the deaths of the following Fellows, intimated during the year 1990–91, was not read at the meeting:

Mrs Agnes Rona M Barr, MA, 24 St Ninian’s Terrace, Edinburgh 1962
Miss Elizabeth Paterson Beattie, 47 McDonald Road, Edinburgh 1975
Gordon McKenzie Booth, 16 rue Chenier, Blainville, Quebec, Canada 1976
David Robert Bellamy Cay, 12 India Street, Edinburgh 1985
Michael Denzil Grierson Clayton, 6 Cobden Crescent, Edinburgh 1974
Ian Borthwick Cowan, MA, PhD, 119 Balshagry Avenue, Glasgow 1977
Johnstone Craig, TD, FRIBA, FRIAS, 58 Whitehouse Road, Edinburgh 1983
Mrs Margaret Bannatyne Cross 1963
The Rt Hon Lord Dunpark, TD, BA, LLB, 17 Heriot Row, Edinburgh 1973
Reverend Harold C M Eggo, TD, MA, Millholme, East Linton, East Lothian 1965
Reverend J I Crawford Finnic, 6 Horseleys Park, St Andrews, Fife 1958
William Sharpe Dobson, Milton, Nethy Bridge, Inverness-shire 1963
Mrs Mary Agnes Hamp-Hamilton, SSStJ, LRAM, Glentye, Sheriffmuir, Dunblane, Perthshire 1981
Mrs Margaret Bannatyne Cross 1963
Charles Hoy, 91 Comely Bank Road, Edinburgh 1979
Mrs Margaret Kooijman, 62 rue Rothschild, Geneva, Switzerland 1974
Meetings of the Society, 1990-91

George R Low, Rose Cottage, Upper Largo, Leven, Fife 1971
Robert William Marwick, AHWC, BSc, Walltower, Penicuik, Midlothian 1974
Ms Rhona Margaret Mitchell, Flat 4, 25 George Street, Perth 1983
John Stewart Liggat, CA, FCMA, 130 Blackford Avenue, Edinburgh 1973
George Stewart Middleton, BA, 68 St Abbs Road, Arbroath, Angus 1977
Harry C Monet-Lane, MA, FRNS, Sunningdale, 106 Welbeck Road, Bolsover, Chesterfield, Derbyshire 1967
William McAinsh, Jr., 1312 SW 18th Ct., Ft Lauderdale, FL 33315, U.S. 1989
Captain John Archibald Maclellan, MBE, 14 Dean Park Crescent, Edinburgh. 1971
Mrs Gwen MacLeod, 11 The Haven, Dalgety Bay, Fife 1982
Dr D Lamont McNab, Glenburn House, Ardrishaig, Argyll 1955
David Charles Scott-Moncrieff, 23 Cluny Drive, Edinburgh 1946
Mrs Lavinia Smiley, Castle Fraser, Sauchen, Aberdeenshire 1979
Miss Mary Lucy Smith, MA, 2 Albany Terrace, Dundee 1971
Bruce Alexander Stenhouse, MA, Flat 14, 6 Orchard Brae Avenue, Edinburgh 1982
William C Summers, 1 Bellevue Crescent, Edinburgh 1963
David Robertson Wanstall, MA, 9 Fair View Road, Dartmouth, Devon 1984
Mrs Jean Stothart Wilson, ALA, 52 Moss Street, Elgin, Morayshire 1969
Honorary Fellow
H M King Olav V of Norway 1990

Retiral of the Editor

The retiring Editor was thanked for all the work that he has undertaken on behalf of the Society and presented with a book, in token of the appreciation of the Society. The President outlined the editorial changes mentioned in the Annual Report; she informed Fellows that Dr Ann MacSween has been appointed Co-ordinating Editor for the year, and that a new Honorary Editor will be recommended for election at the next Anniversary Meeting.

Retiral of the Assistant Treasurer

The President thanked the Assistant Treasurer for all her work throughout her long association with the Society. The good wishes of the Society go with the Assistant Treasurer into her retirement, and she was presented with a cheque on behalf of Council and the Fellows.

Mrs Maureen MacLeod, the new Assistant Treasurer, was introduced to the Fellows and welcomed to the Society.

The Society’s appeal for the new Museum of Scotland

The President reported that so far the appeal has raised just over £8000. The fundraising evening had been a very enjoyable and successful event, raising c. £4000, though the Society still has some way to go before it approaches the original target of £60,000 for the appeal.

The following Communication was read:
‘On the drawing room from Hamilton Palace’, by Godfrey Evans, MA, AMA, FSA Scot., Curator of European metalwork and sculpture, Royal Museum of Scotland.
Instructions for Contributors to these Proceedings (Volume 122 onwards)

Papers and shorter notes are invited on all aspects of the archaeology and history of Scotland.

In order to be considered for the next annual volume of these Proceedings, completed typescripts and illustrations must be sent to The Editor, The Society of Antiquaries of Scotland, The Royal Museum of Scotland, Queen Street, Edinburgh EH2 1JD, to arrive no later than 30 November each year. Prospective contributors are urged to consult the Editor as early as possible in the preparation of their work. (Those considering the preparation of a monograph should write to the Monographs Editor at the same address.)

Contributions (three copies) must be typed on one side of A4 paper, with double spacing and wide margins. Those using word-processors should consult the Editor as to whether the additional submission of a disk will be of assistance, as this can significantly reduce costs.

Each paper should be preceded by an Abstract of no more than 200 words.

Lengthy papers (eg reports of large excavations) which contain extensive appendices, tables, or specialist reports, may be most efficiently published, in part, on microfiche. Authors considering this medium must consult the Editor at a very early stage about the presentation of this material, for which separate guidance notes are available.

Acknowledgements. Authors are responsible for obtaining written permission for the reproduction of copyright material. The appropriate acknowledgement must be given.

Proofs. Authors will be sent one set of proofs only; authors will bear the cost of any significant or substantial changes to the text at proof stage.

Offprints. Authors are entitled to 24 free offprints of their paper. More copies can be ordered at proof stage.

At or before submission, each author should advise the Editor if their paper may attract a grant for publication. Authors are urged to make every effort to obtain such a grant from an appropriate source.

STYLE

Please ensure that the text, the illustrations, and the references all conform to the style of the latest volume of these Proceedings.

Headings within the text should be restricted to a hierarchy of no more than three grades. These should be clearly indicated in the margin of the typescript (A, B, C).

Dimensions shall be given in metric units (eg 1 km, 6 m, 48 mm). Please note the spacing. Centimetres should not be used. Imperial units may be quoted from earlier sources but the metric equivalents must also be given (in brackets).

Radiocarbon dates should be cited in their uncalibrated form, with the error at one standard deviation (eg 1530 ± 70 BC uncal), with full details of their laboratory reference numbers. The international convention BP should not be used by itself. Any calibration exercise must be fully explained and referenced.

Footnotes will not be used, but numbered notes that expand on points that would lie uncomfortably in the text may be listed at the end of the article.

REFERENCES

The Harvard system (author, date, page), set within the text, is preferred and should always be used when the majority of the references are to published books or articles. Numbered end-notes may, however, be used for articles on historical topics in which the references are predominantly to documentary material. Every manuscript referred to must be given its full reference number, assigned by its repository, including the folio or page number.

In either system, standard historical reference works may be referred to by their abbreviated titles (eg Acts Parl Scot), in the form given in the supplement to the Scottish Historical Review 42 (1963). All such abbreviations must be expanded in the list of references that must be set out at the end of each article, whichever system is used. Abbreviations of journals should conform to the style listed in Signpost for Archaeological Publication (3rd edn, 1991), published by the Council for British Archaeology, to the style of the British Archaeological Bibliography, or to the list in Scot Hist Rev 42 (1963). Examples of the correct form of each reference system may be found in volume 118, pages 285–7 (running notes), and volume 119, pages 27–31, 223–36 (Harvard).

ILLUSTRATIONS

Line drawings and photographs must be of the highest quality and must be submitted in their final form, in the correct proportion for reduction within the maximum space available: 190 × 140 mm. (It would greatly assist the Editor if those who are able to do so would also submit reduced versions of their drawings). Titles should not be within a drawing but should be included in the caption, for which an allowance of space must be made. Because of their expense, fold-outs should be avoided whenever possible. A metric scale must be included on each drawing. Areas to be cropped from photographs should be indicated on a transparent overlay. All illustrations within an article, whether drawings or photographs, will be numbered in sequence, eg Illus 5. Captions should be printed in a list separate from the text.