

10 Cultural heritage

10.1 Introduction

This chapter considers the effects on cultural heritage resources arising from the construction and operation of the proposed wind farm at Bishopwood. The assessment has been informed by discussion with and information received from North Yorkshire County Council, Selby District Council and English Heritage. The impact of the proposal on listed buildings and their settings, on conservation areas, historic parks and gardens, and on scheduled ancient monuments within a study area of 6km from the centre of the wind farm has been assessed by one of North Energy's qualified planners. In addition, a desk-based archaeological assessment and a site walkover of the Bishopwood site was undertaken by Field Archaeology Specialists Ltd (FAS), of York, followed by a geophysical evaluation of the proposed turbine sites and routes of proposed tracks, by Wessex Archaeology. In total an area of seven hectares was surveyed and took in turbine hardstandings and the sites of the substation and temporary site compound. The results of the archaeological work appear in the preceding chapter.

For the purpose of this statement cultural heritage resources include the following:

- World Heritage Sites
- Conservation areas
- Listed buildings
- Scheduled ancient monuments, SAMs
- Registered historic parks and gardens
- Registered historic battlefields
- Historic parks and gardens of local significance.

The purpose of this chapter is to:

- Identify the cultural heritage baseline
- Assess the Bishopwood proposal in relation to possible direct and indirect impacts on cultural heritage resources
- Consider the potential effects of construction, operation and decommissioning of the turbine on the cultural heritage resources within the study area
- Propose measures, where appropriate, to mitigate any predicted significant adverse effects
- Identify any residual impacts.

10.2 Methodology

10.2.1 Review of relevant guidance

The assessment has been conducted with reference to relevant guidance concerning cultural heritage and the effect of wind farms, in particular:

- *PPG15 Planning and the Historic Environment*, *PPG16 Archaeology and Planning*, *PPS22 Renewable Energy*, and its companion guide¹

¹ Department of the Environment (1994) *PPG15 Planning and the Historic Environment*, ODP(1990) *PPG16 Archaeology and Planning*

Chapter 10 Cultural heritage

- English Heritage guidance on *Wind Energy and the Historic Environment*, and the more general *Conservation Principles Policies and Guidance for the Sustainable Management of the Historic Environment*².
- Scottish Planning Advice Note - *Renewable Energy Technologies, PAN 45, Revised 2002*³

As will be noted later in this chapter, the proposal would not give rise to any direct impacts on any cultural heritage resources. There would, however, be indirect effects on settings. Guidance on how to assess the extent of a setting and how a wind farm may affect a setting has been drawn from the above documents.

PPG15 paragraph 2.16 states:

Sections 16 and 66 of the act require authorities considering applications for planning permission or listed building consent for works that affect a listed building to have special regard to certain matters, including the desirability of preserving the setting of the building. The setting is often an essential part of the building's character, especially if a garden or grounds have been laid out to complement its design or function.

PPG15 paragraph 2.17 states:

Local planning authorities are required... to publish a notice of all applications... which, in their opinion, affects the setting of a listed building. This provision should not be interpreted too narrowly: the setting of a listed building may be limited to obviously ancillary land, but may include land at some distance from it... The setting of individual listed buildings very often owes its character to the harmony produced by a particular grouping of buildings (not necessarily all of great merit) and to the quality of the spaces created between them. Such areas require careful consideration... A proposed high or bulky building might also affect the setting of a listed building some distance away, or alter views of a historic skyline. In some cases, setting can only be defined by a historic assessment of a building's surroundings...

PPG16 paragraph 8 states:

Where nationally important archaeological remains, whether scheduled or not, and their settings, are affected by the proposed development there should be a presumption in favour of their physical preservation.

PPS22 paragraph 11 states:

In sites with nationally recognised designations (scheduled ancient monuments, conservation areas, listed buildings...) planning permission for renewable energy projects should only be granted where it can be

ODPM(2004) PPS22 *Renewable Energy*, ODPM(2004) PSS22 *Planning for renewable energy - The Companion Guide*

² English Heritage (2005) *Wind Energy and the Historic Environment*, October 2005 & English Heritage (2008) *Conservation Principles Policies and Guidance for the sustainable management of the historic environment*

³ Scottish Executive (2002) *Scottish Planning Advice Note - Renewable Energy Technologies, PAN 45, Revised 2002*

Chapter 10 Cultural heritage

demonstrated that the objectives of designation of the area will not be compromised by the development, and any significant adverse effects on the qualities for which the area has been designated are clearly outweighed by the environmental, social and economic benefits.

PPS22 Companion Guide Section 8 Wind Technical Annex paragraph 48 states:

Special care will be needed if proposed sites for wind turbines should happen to be near listed buildings or conservation areas. Paragraph 80 dealing with archaeology states: “Where nationally important remains and their settings are affected by proposed development they should normally be physically preserved. A desktop study, and a site walkover may be required, and a condition of planning permission for an archaeologist to hold a watching brief during construction may be considered.”

The English Heritage document *Conservation Principles Policies and Guidance for the Sustainable Management of the Historic Environment* sets out six principles which should guide the approach to the historic environment. The fifth is entitled “Decisions about change must be reasonable, transparent and consistent”.

Paragraph 5.3 states:

Potential conflict between sustaining heritage values of a place and other important public interests should be minimised by seeking the least harmful ways of accommodating those interests.

Paragraph 5.4 states:

If conflict cannot be avoided, the weight given to heritage values in making the decision should be proportionate to the significance of the place and the impact of the proposed change on that significance.

In the same document paragraphs 76 and 77 consider the contribution made by setting and context. Paragraph 76 states:

Setting is an established concept that relates to the surroundings in which a place is experienced, its local context, embracing present and past relationships to the adjacent landscape. Definition of the setting of a significant place will normally be guided by the extent to which material change within it could effect (enhance or diminish) the place’s significance.

Paragraph 77 states:

Context embraces any relationship between a place and other places. It can be, for example, cultural, intellectual, spatial or functional, so any one place can have a multi-layered context. The range of contextual relationships of a place will normally emerge from an understanding of its origins and evolution. Understanding context is particularly relevant to assessing whether a place has greater value for being part of a greater entity, or sharing characteristics with other places.

The same document also provides a definition of the term setting as “the surroundings in which a place is experienced, its local context, embracing present and past relationships to the adjacent landscape.”

The English Heritage document *Wind Energy and the Historic Environment* on page 8 lists particular factors which “should be borne in mind when assessing the acceptability of wind developments within the setting of historic site”:

- **“Visual dominance:** Wind turbines are far greater in vertical scale than most historic features. Where an historic feature (such as a hill top monument or fortification, a church spire, or a plantation is the most visually dominant feature in the surrounding landscape, adjacent construction of turbines may be inappropriate.
- **Scale:** The extent of a wind farm and the number, density and disposition of its turbines will also contribute to its visual impact.
- **Intervisibility:** Certain archaeological or historic landscape features were intended to be seen from other historic sites. Construction of wind turbines should respect this intervisibility.
- **Vistas and sight-lines:** Designed landscapes invariably involve key vistas, prospects, panoramas and sight lines, or the use of topography to add drama. Location of turbines within key views, which may often extend beyond any designated area, should be avoided.
- **Movement, sound or light effects:** The movement associated with wind turbines as well as their scale may be a significant issue in certain historic settings. Adequate distance should always be provided between important historic sites and wind turbine developments to avoid being overshadowed or affected by noise and shadow flicker effects.
- **Unaltered settings:** The setting of some historic sites may be little changed from the period when the site was first constructed, used or abandoned. Largely unaltered settings for certain types of sites, particularly more ancient sites, may be rare survivals and especially vulnerable to modern intrusions such as wind turbines. This may be a particular issue in certain upland areas.”

PAN 45⁴ has been referred to, in considering the visual effects of the proposal on cultural heritage resources. It notes that “visual effects will be dependent on the distance over which a wind farm may be viewed, whether the turbines can be viewed adjacent to other features, different weather conditions, the character of the development and the landscape and nature of the visibility”. In Figure 8, of this document, it provides some definition of the relationship between distance and the prominence of a wind farm in an open landscape:

- “Within an area of 2km from a wind farm it will be a prominent feature
- Within an area between 2-5km from a wind farm it will be relatively prominent
- Between 5-15km, a wind farm will only be prominent in clear visibility and as part of the wider landscape; and
- Between 15-30km turbines will only be seen in very clear visibility and then as a minor element in the landscape.”

⁴ Scottish Executive (2002) PAN45, *Planning Advice Note PAN45 Renewable Energy Technologies* Fig 8

10.3 Guidance - overview

The above guidance provides a helpful context for assessing the impact of the proposal on the settings of cultural heritage resources, and can be summarised as follows:

- The setting of an historic site comprises its surroundings, context and relationship to the adjacent landscape
- Settings are very case specific
- Wind turbines give rise to specific types of impact on the settings of historic sites
- It must be demonstrated that the objectives of designation are not compromised by wind development
- Prominence is related to distance
- If conflict cannot be avoided, the weight given to heritage values in making the decision should be proportionate to the significance of the place and the impact of the proposed change on that significance.

10.4 Assessment of significance of effects on settings

The assessment took into account both the sensitivity of the cultural heritage resource and the significance of the expected effect. The following tables provide a generalised structure for the assessment.

Sensitivity has been assessed in relation to the designation status of the resource as indicated in Figure 10.1 below.

Degree of Sensitivity	Designation Status
Very High	World Heritage Sites (WHS)
High	Scheduled Ancient Monuments (SAMs), Grade I Listed Buildings, Registered Historic Battlefields, Registered Historic Parks and Gardens
Medium	Grade II* Listed Buildings, Conservation Areas
Low	Grade II Listed Buildings, Historic Parks and Gardens of Local Significance

Figure 10.1 Sensitivity

The severity of effects on settings has been considered in relation to the distance between the cultural heritage resource and the nearest turbine taking into account the guidance in *PAN 45* quoted in section 10.2 above.

Level of Magnitude	Definition
Very high	Presence within or immediately adjacent to the wind farm site
High	Extensive change to the setting of a SAM, WHS, Historic Park and Garden, Grade I, II* Listed Building within 2km of the wind farm site
Medium	Changes to settings of cultural heritage resources within 2-5km of the wind farm site
Low	Minor changes to settings of cultural heritage resources within 5-15km of the wind farm site

Figure 10.2 Severity

The significance of the potential effect can be derived by combining the above tables as follows in Figure 10.3 below:

Sensitivity	Very high	High	Medium	Low
Severity				
Very high	major	major	moderate	minor
High	major	major	moderate	minor
Medium	moderate	moderate	moderate	minor
Low	minor	minor	minor	not significant

Figure 10.3 Significance

While the approach above provides a systematic way of assessing significance with reference to the status of the cultural heritage resource and distance from the wind farm, local aspects of siting and screening, provided by vegetation and buildings noted during site inspection, are also important in drawing conclusions on the potential effect of the proposal on settings.

10.5 Data collection and consultation

In order to collect base information on the cultural heritage resources within the study area, the following steps were undertaken:

- Selby District Council, in a letter dated 18th December 2007, identified listed buildings that it wished to be considered in the assessment of the proposal

Chapter 10 Cultural heritage

- Information was received from the English Heritage Records of Ancient Monuments in the form of a summary report on scheduled ancient monuments within 6km of the centre of the site
- Further, more detailed, descriptions of the scheduled ancient monuments were obtained from the National Monuments Record
- Information was obtained by FAS from North Yorkshire County Council's Heritage Record Service on more local items of history associated with the site
- Discussions have taken place by telephone and email, and in person, with English Heritage, North Yorkshire County Council and Selby District Council on heritage issues. A draft of this chapter of the environmental statement was circulated to English Heritage during February 2009 and comments made have been reflected in the findings and conclusions.

Selby District Council requested that the assessment should include two conservation areas:

- Monk Fryston Conservation Area
- Hillam Conservation Area.

Selby District Council also requested that the assessment should include the following Listed Buildings:

- St Wilfred's Church, Brayton
- St Wilfred's House, Brayton
- Gateforth Hall Hotel
- The Coach House, Gateforth Hall
- West Lodge, off Hillam Road, near Gateforth Hall
- Monk Fryston Hall
- All Saints Church, Wistow
- 1 Church Hill, Wistow
- Birkin House, off Haddlesey Road, Birkin

Selby District Council did not identify any SAMs or other archaeological features for inclusion in the assessment.

An archaeological desk based study of the proposal site and its surrounding area was undertaken by Field Archaeology Specialists Ltd (FAS), based in York. This study covered the Bishopwood proposal site, together with an additional wind farm proposal at Woodlane also in Selby District, located between Gateforth, West Haddlesey and Birkin, also being brought forward for planning approval by Prowind GmbH. The FAS desk study is included in Volume 4, within Appendix 9.1 and includes a baseline assessment covering distinct periods from the Palaeolithic to the present, an assessment of significance and potential, an assessment of impact, and recommendations.

A further geophysical study undertaken by Wessex Archaeology was carried out in February/March 2009. It is described and discussed in Chapter 9 and the full report appears in Volume 4, Appendix 9.2.

10.6 Definition of a study area

The listed buildings and conservation areas identified by Selby District Council, during the scoping process, to be considered when assessing the impact of the proposal, fall within an area approximately 4.5km from the edge of the proposal site and are included in the gazetteer in Volume 4, Appendix 10 and shown on a map within Volume 4, Appendix 21. As noted above, *PAN45* advises that at a distance of up to 2km in open landscape a wind farm is “likely to be a prominent feature,” between 2-5km it would be “relatively prominent” and beyond 5km it would “only be prominent in clear visibility - seen as part of the wider landscape.” In the context of this guidance a study area extending 4-5km from the perimeter of the proposal site was considered sufficient for the assessment of impact on settings of historic sites.

Data from English Heritage on historic sites can only be provided for regular shaped study areas. As the proposal site is irregular in form it was decided to obtain data for a circular area within 6km of the centre of the wind farm in order to capture the sites identified by Selby District Council and others within 4-5km of the edge of the proposal site.

A desk study was carried out which included the following:

- An assessment of the data obtained from English Heritage on the location of listed buildings and SAMs within the study area
- Consideration of the archaeological desk based assessment prepared by Field Archaeology Specialists Ltd
- Reference to wireframes and photomontage visualisations illustrating the proposed turbines from the visualisation viewpoints agreed with Selby District Council.

Field work undertaken on 17th December 2008 included a visit to each of the conservation areas and historic sites identified by Selby District Council, and other historic sites within the study area. Light conditions and visibility were good when the fieldwork was undertaken.

A map of the study area showing cultural heritage resources appears in Volume 4, Appendix 21.

10.7 Applying the English Heritage guidance on impact on settings and visual amenity

Some general conclusions were drawn regarding the applicability of two of the factors included in the English Heritage guidance on assessing the impact of wind energy on the historic environment quoted in section 10.2 above.

“Intervisibility” - work undertaken within the study area has not identified any “archaeological or historic landscape features which were intended to be seen from other historic sites.”

“Unaltered settings” - the study area and its wider surroundings have been progressively developed over many centuries and include significant large scale 20th Century structures - notably three major coal fired power stations and their associated grid infrastructure, a Ministry of Defence airfield, and a deep coal mine, now disused. In addition, railways and A class roads cross the study area and many of its villages have been expanded by the addition of new housing estates. It is concluded that

therefore there are no “unaltered settings” within the study area, of the kind described in the English Heritage guidance.

Given the above conclusions, the above two factors are not considered to be relevant to the following assessments, whereas the remaining four factors set out in the English Heritage Guidance, namely visual dominance, scale, vistas and sight-lines, movement, sound or light effects, are considered to be applicable. These have been taken into account and are referred to in the remainder of this chapter as the four relevant English Heritage factors.

A significant number of listed buildings in the study area are located within the conservation areas considered below. It is generally concluded that their settings are provided by the conservation area in which they are located. They have therefore been assessed as a group as part of their conservation area and not separately building by building.

10.8 Baseline conditions

10.8.1 *Cultural heritage sites within the proposal site*

There are no designated sites within the proposal site.

10.8.2 *Cultural heritage sites within the Environmental Impact Assessment study area*

The study area includes the following cultural heritage sites:

- Conservation areas at Monk Fryston, Hillam, Cawood and Selby
- Total listed buildings entries: seven Grade I, six Grade II* and 199 Grade II
- Five scheduled ancient monuments
- Each of these sites is identified in the schedule in the gazetteer in Volume 4, Appendix 10
- There is one Historic Park and Gardens of Local Importance, identified in Selby District Local Plan Appendix 8, within the study area: Monk Fryston Hall.

There are no World Heritage Sites, Registered Historic Parks and Gardens, or Registered Historic Battlefields within the study area.

10.8.3 *Key cultural heritage sites outside the study area*

World Heritage Sites (WHS):

- The nearest WHS to the proposal site is Studley Royal Park, including the remains of Fountains Abbey, which is located over 40km to the north west.

Registered Historic Battlefields:

- The nearest Registered Historic Battlefield to the proposal site is Towton Battlefield (1461), a key battlefield dating from the Wars of the Roses, located about 10km to the north west of the proposal site.

Registered Historic Parks and Gardens:

- The nearest Registered Historic Parks and Gardens to the proposal site are Nun Appleton Park, about 7km to the north, and Moreby Hall, about 12km to the north.

Historic Parks and Gardens of Local Importance:

- There are seven Historic Parks and Gardens of Local Importance, identified in Selby District Local Plan Appendix 8, outside the study area: Byram Hall about 7km to the south west, Carlton Towers about 12km to the south east, Grimston Hall about 11km to the north west, Hazelwood Castle about 12km to the north west, Newton Kyme Hall about 16km to the north west, Queen Margaret's School about 10km to the north and Scarthingwell Park about 8km to the north west.

10.9 Assessment - direct effects

There are no direct effects on any designated area, site or building of cultural heritage significance or scheduled ancient monument arising from the proposal.

10.10 Assessment - indirect effects on conservation areas

10.10.1 *Monk Fryston Conservation Area*

The village of Monk Fryson is located over 5km to the south west of the proposal site. The busy A63 linking Selby to the A1 passes through the centre of the village. A number of listed buildings are clustered in the historic centre of the village including the Church of St Wilfred, Grade I, Monk Fryston Hall and Prebendal House Grade II*. The development pattern within the village is typical of a medieval agricultural settlement with properties facing one another across the main and side streets, together with some larger properties of which Monk Fryston Hall is the most significant example, set within their own grounds planted with mature trees. The historic properties tend to look inwards into the village rather than outwards. The village is situated on slightly higher ground than land to the east in the direction of the proposal.

Arriving in Monk Fryston having travelled across the relatively flat landscape to the east there is a sense of being in a place with its own distinctive historic character. From within the village views towards the proposal site are very limited or non-existent because of the grain and density of development and the presence of mature trees. Only when leaving the village along roads leading to the east - Fryston Common Lane and the A63, would the wind farm begin to become apparent.

Although St Wilfred's Church is on slightly higher ground within the village it is very unlikely that the proposal would be visible to those visiting the building. The church has a square tower which is a localised landmark rather than being a dominant feature either within the village or the surrounding countryside. The proposal would not be seen in relation to the church tower from within the conservation area.

Photomontage Viewpoint 7 is located between Monk Fryston and Hillam on a footpath at Lumby Hill. Photomontage 7b illustrates the appearance of the wind farm which would be seen as a compact group of turbines occupying about 10 degrees of view. At a distance of 5.5km, the turbines would be seen as part of the wider landscape and are in scale with distant trees.

The four relevant English Heritage factors have been considered and there are no conflicts with their guidance.

The significance of the effect of the proposed wind farm on the setting of Monk Fryston conservation area is assessed to be **minor**, for the Grade I listed St Wilfred's Church and for the two Grade II* listed buildings the significance is assessed to be **minor**, and for the Grade II listed buildings the significance is assessed to be **minor**. At a distance of just over 5km from the proposal site the turbines would only be prominent in clear

visibility and as part of the wider landscape. The movement of the blades, sound or light effects would not be an issue at this distance. On leaving the village and heading west along the A63 the proposal would become increasingly prominent, in the same way as the existing power stations and pylon lines come in and out of view in journeys to and from the village. This does not however have any bearing or impact on the character, setting or purpose of the conservation area.

Monk Fryston conservation area provides its own setting and that of the listed buildings located within it. The essential character of Monk Fryston - a village cluster of historic buildings focused along the main street, urban in character and looking inward, complimented by mature trees in the grounds of its Hall and elsewhere, will not be affected by the proposal. Similarly it is also concluded that the settings of Monk Fryston's listed buildings are provided by the buildings and spaces of the conservation area as a whole and this would not be affected by the proposal.

10.10.2 *Hillam Conservation Area*

The village of Hillam is located less than 1km to the south of Monk Fryston and is over 5km from the proposal site. Hillam is physically joined to Monk Fryston but is a smaller, quieter village focused on minor local roads. The conservation area shares many of the built form characteristics of Monk Fryston - clustered development which looks inward towards the village streets and largely turns its back on the surrounding countryside. The majority of listed buildings are located in Chapel Lane and Hillam Hall Lane in the south east part of the village. Hillam Hall is listed Grade II and is surrounded by mature trees within its own grounds and other properties. There are a number of other Grade II listed buildings within the conservation area.

Photomontage Viewpoint 7 is located between Monk Fryston and Hillam on a footpath at Lumby Hill. Photomontage 7b illustrates the appearance of the wind farm which would be seen as a compact group of turbines occupying about 10 degrees of view. At a distance of 5.5km the turbines would be seen as part of the wider landscape and would be in scale with distant trees.

At a distance of over 5km from the proposal site the turbines would only be prominent in clear visibility and as part of the wider landscape. On leaving the village and heading west along Hillam Common Lane the proposal would become increasingly prominent, in the same way as the existing power stations and pylon lines come in and out of view in journeys to and from the village.

The four relevant English Heritage factors have been considered and there are no conflicts with their guidance.

The significance of the effect of the proposed wind farm on the setting of Hillam conservation area is assessed to be **minor**, and for its Grade II listed buildings the significance is assessed to be **minor**. Conclusions regarding the impact of the proposal on Hillam Conservation Area are essentially the same as those drawn in respect of Monk Fryston. The built form of the village provides the setting for its listed buildings and conservation area as a whole and this would not be affected by the proposal.

10.10.3 *Cawood Conservation Area*

The village of Cawood is located just over 5km to the north of the proposal site. Selby District Council did not request that it be included in the assessment, but it is located

on the edge of the study area. Cawood is located at a bridge crossing of the River Ouse and two busy B roads cross in its centre.

The village contains a number of listed buildings including the Gatehouse and adjacent Banqueting Hall both Grade I and part of Cawood Castle; All Saints Church is Grade I and Yew Tree House and Cottage and the Grange Grade II*. In addition the conservation area includes two scheduled ancient monuments - Cawood Castle and Castle Garth and Kensbury Moated Site. Most of the listed buildings are clustered within the village core. The Gatehouse is a three storey high square tower, which is a landmark within the village. All Saints Church is sited on the highest point within the village and has a square tower and is a significant feature in views from the local countryside and from across the River Ouse.

As in the case of Monk Fryston and Hillam the conservation area largely provides the setting of its listed buildings, the River Ouse and the adjacent farm land also provide part of that setting.

Cawood is a compact village centred on the Castle and the approach to the river crossing. The proposal would not be seen in relation to All Saints Church tower or the Gatehouse when they are viewed from within the conservation area.

Photomontage Viewpoint 6 is located on the southern side of Cawood on the B1222. Photomontage 6b illustrates the appearance of the wind farm which would be seen as a compact group of turbines occupying about 15 degrees of view. At a distance of just over 5km the turbines would be seen as part of the wider landscape and would be in scale with distant trees.

The four relevant English Heritage factors have been considered and there are no conflicts with their guidance.

The significance of the effect of the proposed wind farm on the setting of Cawood's SAMs is assessed to be **minor**, for its conservation area the significance is assessed to be **minor**, for its Grade I and II* listed buildings the significance is assessed to be **minor**, and for the Grade II listed buildings the significance is assessed to be **minor**. At a distance of just over 5km from the proposal site the turbines would only be prominent in clear visibility and as part of the wider landscape when viewed from the edge of the village. The movement of the blades, sound or light effects would not be an issue at this distance.

10.10.4 *Selby's Conservation Areas*

The centre of Selby is located about 4km from the proposal site. Initially there was a single conservation area within the centre of Selby but this has now been sub-divided into four separate areas - Selby Town, Leeds Road, Armoury Road and Brook Street, and Millgate. Selby District Council did not request that the town's conservation areas be included in the assessment, but they are located on the edge of the study area. Together they include the Abbey, the Abbots Staith Scheduled Ancient Monument and a relatively large number of listed buildings.

The centre of Selby is typical of an historic market town - densely developed and urban in character with the majority of the historic buildings facing into streets and urban spaces and with relatively few views out from the town into the surrounding

countryside. An exception to this is along the River Ouse and Selby Dam which provide some wider views including to the west and towards the proposal site.

The Abbey is the dominant feature within the centre of Selby. However it does not have the height and presence of York Minster which is a more dominant feature within its wider landscape as seen from approaches by rail and road - the Minster is a landmark indicating that a journey to York is nearing completion. Due to its smaller scale Selby Abbey does not act in this way in the wider landscape, but has a strong presence within its conservation area which in turn provides the Abbey's setting.

The proposal would not be seen in relation to the Abbey when it is viewed from within its surrounding conservation area, nor would it be seen from the majority of the town's conservation areas because of their built form.

Photomontage Viewpoint 4 is located at Flaxley Road on the north western edge of Selby and shows the proposed wind farm at a distance of 3.1km. Photomontage Viewpoints 5 and 6 are 3.6km and 5km respectively from the wind farm. The photomontages from these viewpoints illustrate the scale of turbines as viewed from Selby. At these distances the turbines are progressively seen as part of the wider landscape, and are in scale with distant trees.

The significance of the effect of the proposed wind farm on the setting of Selby's conservation areas is assessed to be **moderate**, for its Grade I and II* listed buildings. For the SAM, the significance is assessed to be **moderate**, and for its Grade II listed buildings the significance is assessed to be **minor**. At a distance of about 4km from the proposal site the turbines could be a relatively prominent feature when viewed from parts of Selby's conservation areas, however as described above, opportunities for seeing the wind farm would be severely limited by the built form of the urban area. The movement of the blades, sound or light effects would not have any effect on the setting of the conservation areas or that of their listed buildings at this distance.

10.11 Assessment - indirect effects on specific listed buildings

10.11.1 *St Wilfred's Church and St Wilfred's House, Brayton*

Brayton is located to the south west of Selby on the A19. St Wilfred's Church, Grade I, and House, Grade II, are located in the gap between the southern edge of Selby's built up area and Brayton village, and are about 3.3km from the proposal site. The church has a spire which is visible over a wide area and is set within extensive grounds and surrounded by mature trees. St Wilfred's House is adjacent to the church. The church, the house and the churchyard are all part of the same setting which contrasts sharply with the suburban housing development and schools located nearby. Open land to the west provides views towards the proposal site viewed over more distant housing and a railway line.

Taking each of the English Heritage four relevant factors concerning impact on settings in turn:

Visual dominance: The spire is dominant in the immediate vicinity of the church but it quickly loses this dominance in the context of nearby development in Brayton and Selby. Even when seen from the A19 adjacent to the churchyard, the impact of the spire is softened by the presence of mature trees, which would also screen glimpses of the proposed turbines at Bishopwood. The presence of the proposed turbines about

3.5km to the west will not interfere with the visual statement the spire makes within its locality.

Scale: Photomontage 4b from Viewpoint 4 at Flaxley Road on the north western edge of Selby, which shows the proposed wind farm from a slightly closer distance (3.1km), helps to illustrate the scale of turbines as viewed from the slightly more distant St Wilfred's (3.3km). At this distance the turbines are beginning to be seen as part of the wider landscape and are in scale with distant trees.

Vistas and sight-lines: There are no designed vistas or sight lines from or converging upon St Wilfred's Church.

Movement, sound or light effects: At a distance of about 3.3km from the nearest turbine it is possible that blade movement would draw attention to the turbines. However St Wilfred's Church would not be overshadowed or affected by noise and shadow flicker effects.

The significance of the effect of the proposed wind farm on the setting of St Wilfred's Church, Brayton is assessed to be **moderate** because of its Grade I listed status and its proximity to the proposed wind farm. At a distance of about 3.3km from the proposal site the turbines would be a relatively prominent feature when viewed from St Wilfred's Church, its churchyard or the adjacent St Wilfred's House, however the setting of the church and the house is provided largely by the churchyard and its mature trees and the adjacent housing development in Brayton and Selby and would not be affected by the proposal.

10.11.2 *Gateforth Hall, the Coach House, West Lodge off Hillam Road*

These properties form a single group, the Hall being listed Grade II* while the Coach House and West Lodge - which stands at the entrance to the grounds - are Grade II. In addition there are a number of other listed structures within this group - gates and piers, a ha-ha and Church Lodge. Gateforth Hall is about 2.4km from the proposal site and stands on rising ground just to the south of Hambleton Hough, a small wooded hill to the south of Hambleton. The main aspect of the house is towards the south west - looking directly towards Drax Power Station. Views to the north towards the proposal site are limited by the presence of Hambleton Hough.

Gateforth Hall is not situated within a designed landscape; its setting is provided by its immediate grounds, its surrounding buildings and the adjacent agricultural fields. The wider view from the front elevation of the Hall and longer distance views of the Hall from the surrounding area include the area's coal fired power stations and associated grid infrastructure.

At a distance of about 2.4km the proposed turbines would be relatively prominent. However the Zone of Theoretical Visibility (ZTV) map (see Volume 3, Drawings and Visualisations) suggests that their visibility from Gateforth Hall, its associated buildings and its grounds, would be very limited because of the intervening presence of Hambleton Hough.

The four relevant English Heritage factors have been considered and there are no conflicts with their guidance.

The addition of the proposed turbines as a backdrop to some of the more distant views of Gateforth Hall will not significantly affect a wider setting that already includes a number of large scale industrial structures. The immediate setting will not be changed by the proposal. The movement of the blades, sound or light effects would not have any effect on setting at this distance.

The significance of the effect of the proposed wind farm on the setting of Gateforth Hall is assessed to be **moderate** because of its Grade II* listed status and its proximity to the proposed wind farm. However it has been demonstrated that the setting of the Hall is provided largely by its immediate grounds which would not be affected by the proposal. In addition the ZTV map suggests that Hambleton Hough will fully or largely screen these properties from the proposal. The significance of the effect on the settings of the Grade II listed buildings and structures associated with Gateforth Hall, is assessed to be **minor**.

10.11.3 *All Saint's Church and 1 Church Hill Wistow*

Wistow is a linear village built along the B1223 and located about 3.5km from the proposal site. All Saint's Church, listed Grade I, has a square tower and is located opposite 1 Church Hill in the centre of the village. There are a number of other listed buildings within the historic core of the village, but Wistow does not have a conservation area. The older buildings in the village generally look inwards onto the main streets and generally turn their backs towards the surrounding countryside.

The setting of All Saint's Church, 1 Church Hill and the other listed buildings in Wistow is provided by the immediate village context rather than views over the wider countryside.

Photomontage Viewpoint 5 is located on the southern side of Wistow on the B1223, 3.6km from the proposal site. Photomontage 5b illustrates the appearance of the wind farm which would be seen as a compact group of turbines occupying about 15 degrees of view. At this distance the turbines would be seen as part of the wider landscape and are in scale with electricity supply infrastructure in the middle distance.

At a distance of about 3.5km from the proposal site the turbines would be a relatively prominent feature when viewed from the edge of Wistow. However the movement of the blades, sound or light effects would not have any effect on its setting at this distance.

The four relevant English Heritage factors have been considered and there are no conflicts with their guidance.

The significance of the effect of the proposed wind farm on the setting of All Saint's Church, Wistow is assessed to be **moderate** because of its Grade I listed status and its proximity to the proposed wind farm. However the setting of the Church is provided largely by its location within the centre of the village and would not be affected by the proposal. The significance of the effect on the setting of 1 Church Hill and other Grade II listed buildings within Wistow is assessed to be **minor**.

10.11.4 *Birkin House, off Haddlesey Road, Birkin*

Birkin House is listed Grade II and is located about 5.5km from the proposal site to the north east. The principle elevation of the house faces south into its immediate grounds

which provide its setting. There are other smaller properties and agricultural buildings on the north east side in the direction of the proposal site. The wider setting is provided by the flat agricultural fields and a line of 400kV pylons to the north.

At a distance of about 5.5km from the Bishopwood proposal site the turbines would not be a prominent feature when viewed from Birkin House, nor would the movement of the blades, sound or light effects have any effect on its setting at this distance. In addition a further wind farm proposal by Prowind GmbH at Wood Lane, near Gateforth, would intervene in any possible views of the Bishopwood proposal from Birkin House.

The four relevant English Heritage factors have been considered and there are no conflicts with their guidance.

The significance of the effect on the setting of Birkin House is assessed to be **minor**.

10.11.5 *Barn to the north east of Croft Farmhouse, Biggin*

This Grade II listed property is located on the southern edge of Biggin village about 3km from the proposal site. Its setting is provided by the immediate village environment, the main east coast railway line. Due to its proximity, Bishop Wood would significantly screen the proposed turbines from this property.

The four relevant English Heritage factors have been considered and there are no conflicts with their guidance.

The significance of the effect on the setting of the barn to the north east of Croft Farmhouse is assessed to be **minor**.

10.11.6 *Farmhouses to the north west of Selby - Flaxley Lodge, Outwoods Farm and Barn, Sparkhagg Farmhouse and barn, Elfhole Farm barn*

These properties are free standing farmhouses, listed Grade II, in some cases with associated barns and other features. Outwood House is about 1.7km from the proposal site and the closest, and Elfhole the furthest, at about 2.5km.

In each case, the settings of these farmhouses and associated buildings are provided by the adjacent fields, hedgerow trees, and other farm buildings each of which reinforces the appearance of a typical, set piece, small agricultural holding. At distances of between about 1.7 to 2.5km the proposed turbines would be relatively prominent when viewed to the south west of these farmhouses. When the farmhouses are viewed individually from the minor roads that cross this area their settings would not be significantly affected or compromised by the proposal.

The significance of the effect on the setting of the above farmhouses to the north west of Selby is assessed to be **minor**.

10.11.7 *Hempbridge Farm and adjacent buildings*

These Grade II listed buildings are located on the north western edge of Selby about 3.1km from the proposal site. While sharing similar features to the farmhouses reviewed above, the setting of these properties also includes suburban housing on the edge of Selby.

Photomontage Viewpoint 4 is located at Flaxley Road in the vicinity of Hempbridge Farm on the north western edge of Selby. Photomontage 4b shows the proposed wind farm at a distance of 3.1km. At this distance the turbines are progressively seen as part of the wider landscape, and are in scale with distant trees.

The three relevant English Heritage factors have been considered and there are no conflicts with their guidance.

The significance of the effect on the setting of Hempbridge Farm and adjacent buildings is assessed to be **minor**.

10.11.8 *Thorpe Hall, Thorpe Willoughby*

Thorpe Hall is listed Grade II and is built on the site of a scheduled ancient monument which is the site of a moated grange linked to Selby Abbey. The position of the moat can still be traced on site and the monument is regarded as a well preserved example of its type.

Dam Lane which links Thorpe Willoughby to Cawood passes close to Thorpe Hall and the Selby to Leeds railway line passes just a short distance to the south. On the opposite side of Dam Lane a range of currently disused farm buildings are also listed Grade II.

The proposed turbine closest to Thorpe Hall would be about 700m to the north west, with the remainder of the wind farm extending further to the west following a linear layout. One element of the wider setting of Thorpe Hall, when it is approached along Dam Lane, is the adjacent very open agricultural land to the west.

Photomontage Viewpoint 1 is located on Dam Lane, close to Thorpe Hall and the Selby to Leeds railway line. Photomontage 1a shows that at a distance of about 700m the nearest turbine, and the remainder of the wind farm, would be prominent features within this element of the wider setting of Thorpe Hall. At this distance from the nearest turbine Thorpe Hall is outside the area within which the movement of the blades, sound or light effects can have an effect on setting.

The immediate setting of Thorpe Hall is provided principally by the mature trees within its surrounding grounds on the east side of Dam Lane. When viewed from Dam Lane the principal aspects of the setting of Thorpe Hall (including its SAM) are provided by its grounds and mature trees and this aspect of its setting would not be affected by the proposal.

The setting of the currently disused listed range of agricultural buildings on the west side of Dam Lane is currently provided by the open agricultural land extending to the west and Dam Lane to the east. These buildings do not have any other immediate setting or surrounding trees as is the case at Thorpe Hall. The setting of this range of agricultural buildings would therefore be more affected than Thorpe Hall as the proposed turbines would be seen in its backdrop when viewed from Dam Lane and in their main view when looking out from the buildings.

The significance of the effect on the setting of Thorpe Hall and the adjacent currently disused agricultural buildings is assessed to be **minor**, in terms of their Grade II listed status. The significance of the effect on the setting of Thorpe Hall in respect of its scheduled ancient monument status is assessed to be **major**. However the immediate

setting of the SAM moat is provided by Thorpe Hall and its grounds and would not be affected by the proposal.

10.11.9 *Barff Farmhouse, Thorpe Willoughby*

This property is listed Grade II and located in the south eastern corner of Thorpe Willoughby on rising ground just below Brayton Barff, and is about 1.6km from the proposal site. Housing development and the refurbishment of existing buildings was taking place within the grounds of the farmhouse at the time of the site visit. There are views from this elevated position across the roof tops of Thorpe Willoughby towards the proposal site.

The setting of Barff Farmhouse is provided primarily by the adjacent wooded hillside of Brayton Barff and the adjacent suburban housing development in Thorpe Willoughby. At a distance of about 1.6km the proposed turbines are likely to be a prominent feature in the middle distance but they will not affect the setting of the property which is provided by its immediate local context. The movement of the blades, sound and light effects will not have any effect on its setting at this distance.

The four relevant English Heritage factors have been considered and there are no conflicts with their guidance.

The significance of the effect on the setting of Barff Farmhouse as a Grade II listed building is assessed to be **minor**.

10.11.10 *Garth House, Walmsley House, The Old Vicarage, 22 Main Street, Hambleton*

These four Grade II listed buildings are about 1.2 to 1.5km from the proposal site, and are situated within the village of Hambleton. At this distance the proposed turbines are likely to be a prominent feature in the middle distance but seen over the roofs of other village properties. The setting of these listed buildings is that of the immediate village streets and other development and not the adjacent open countryside.

Photomontage Viewpoint 2 is located on the A63 on the eastern side of Hambleton. Photomontage 2b illustrates the view from this part of the village but without the screening effect that would be provided by buildings between the four listed buildings and the open countryside.

The four relevant English Heritage factors have been considered and while blade movement would draw attention to the turbines, these properties would not be overshadowed or affected by noise and shadow flicker effects.

The significance of the effect on the settings of the Grade II listed buildings within Hambleton is assessed to be **minor**.

10.11.11 *Other listed structures - milestones and bridges*

A number of listed milestones and canal bridges are located within the study area. Their location was examined on map and they were considered not to be affected by the proposal.

10.12 Assessment - indirect effects on scheduled ancient monuments

10.12.1 *Thorpe Hall site of moated grange linked to Selby Abbey*

This is dealt with in section 10.11.8 above.

10.12.2 *WWII Bombing Decoy Control Centre, Carr Lane, south of Scalm Park Farm*

This monument comprises the remains of a control room for a WWII dummy aerodrome. Its primary purpose was to divert enemy aircraft from attacking the nearby RAF station at Church Fenton. When it was in use dummy aircraft would have been placed in the surrounding area and flares lit at night suggesting the presence of a runway. The purpose of the control room was to provide a secure shelter for those who were encouraging enemy aircraft to drop their bombs at Scalm Park. Very few decoy stations still survive making the Carr Lane structure nationally important.

The understated appearance of the structure is such that only people with specialist knowledge would be aware of its history and significance. There are no other visible remains of the decoy airfield within the surrounding agricultural fields which would assist an interested observer in envisaging what the dummy aerodrome might have looked like during WWII.

The decoy control centre's current setting is provided by the surrounding open agricultural land, it does not have any perimeter fence. The nearest turbine is proposed within 450m of the decoy control centre and at this distance it, along with the wind farm as a whole, would be a prominent feature.

The significance of the effect on the setting of this SAM is assessed to be **major**. However the nature of this structure and its current lack of any apparent functional relationship with the surrounding farmland are such that this effect is considered not to compromise the reason for the monument's designation.

10.12.3 *Cawood Castle and Castle Garth*

This is dealt with in section 10.10.3 above.

10.12.4 *Kensbury moated site*

This is dealt with in section 10.10.3 above.

10.12.5 *The Abbots Staiths*

These are dealt with in section 10.10.4 above.

10.13 Assessment - indirect effects on Historic Parks and Gardens of Local Importance

10.13.1 *Monk Fryston Hall*

Section 10.10.1 describes the Monk Fryston Conservation Area which includes Monk Fryston Hall and its grounds, which are included within the Selby District Local Plan Appendix 8 list of Locally Important Historic Parks and Gardens. The Hall is about 5.5km from the nearest turbine.

The significance of the effect on the setting of the park and garden is assessed to be **minor**. Due to the built form of the village and the presence of mature trees the proposal is very unlikely to be seen from the grounds of Monk Fryston Hall and therefore will not affect its setting.

10.14 Assessment - no effects

10.14.1 *World Heritage Sites*

Given the 40km distance between the nearest WHS, Studley Royal and Fountains Abbey, and the proposal site it is considered that there will be no effects on the WHS as a result of the proposed development.

10.14.2 *Registered Historic Battlefield at Towton*

This Battlefield site is located at a distance of about 10km from the proposal site. Although this resource is considered to be highly sensitive, it is sufficiently far from the proposal site to have predicted effects of **minor** significance on its setting. It has not been considered in any further detail.

10.14.3 *Registered Historic Parks and Gardens*

The nearest Registered Historic Parks and Gardens to the proposal site are Nun Appleton Park, about 7km to the north, and Moreby Hall about 12km to the north. Although these resources are considered to be highly sensitive they are sufficiently far from the proposal site to have predicted effects of **minor** significance on their settings. They have not been considered in any further detail.

10.14.4 *Historic Parks and Gardens of Local Importance*

There are seven Historic Parks and Gardens of Local Importance identified in Selby District Local Plan Appendix 8 outside the study area: Byram Hall about 7km to the south west, Carlton Towers about 12km to the south east, Grimston Hall about 11km to the north west, Hazelwood Castle about 12km to the north west, Newton Kyme Hall about 16km to the north west, Queen Margaret's School about 10km to the north and Scarthingwell Park about 8km to the north west.

These resources are considered to be located sufficiently far from the proposal site to have predicted effects of **minor** significance on their settings. They have not been considered in any further detail.

10.15 Mitigation measures

10.15.1 *Construction phase - listed buildings*

There are no direct effects of the proposal on any listed building. Construction traffic will not pass Thorpe Hall, the nearest listed building to the site. In these circumstances mitigation measures are not required.

10.15.2 *Construction phase - conservation areas*

There are no direct effects of the proposal on any listed building, although the construction traffic route will pass a small number of individual listed buildings on the A19 and in Hambleton on the A63. The number of vehicle movements will increase on a limited number of days during the construction period as described in Chapter 15, but the majority vehicles will not be any heavier than other traffic regularly using these roads. In these circumstances mitigation measures are not required.

There are no direct affects of the proposal on any conservation area. In these circumstances mitigation measures are not required.

10.15.3 *Construction phase - SAMs and archaeology*

Care would be taken to ensure that no construction activity affects the WWII Decoy Control Centre on Carr Lane, which is the closest designated structure to the proposal site. The layout of tracks and turbines given in the planning application and illustrated in Figure 2.4 in Chapter 2, have been designed to prevent impact on the scheduled ancient monument by construction traffic. This can, if desired by Selby District Council, be further enforced though a planning condition.

Chapter 10 Cultural heritage

Archaeological field work to confirm the character of the archaeological resource within the proposal site, proposed in the section 6.0 of the FAS archaeological desk-based assessment (found in Appendix 10) should be undertaken following the grant of planning permission and prior to construction, and appropriate mitigation measures taken - such as recording and removal of finds. These requirements can be secured by the imposition of a planning condition.

10.15.4 *Operational phase*

There are no turbine operational issues that require mitigation measures in relation to listed buildings, conservation areas, SAMs or archaeology.

10.15.5 *Decommissioning*

If desired by Selby District Council a planning condition could be used to ensure that, during decommissioning, no activity affects the WWII decoy control centre on Carr Lane.

10.16 Residual impacts

There are no turbine residual impacts in relation to listed buildings, conservation areas SAMs or archaeology.

10.17 Summary and conclusions

This assessment of the potential impact of the proposal on cultural heritage has demonstrated the following:

- Advice contained in the English Heritage publication *Wind Energy and the Historic Environment* puts forward six factors which should be borne in mind when assessing the acceptability of developments within the setting of historic sites. Two of these factors are considered not to be applicable within the proposal study area. The remaining four have been taken into account in assessing potential impact on settings.
- Selby District Council provided a list of conservation areas and listed buildings that it wished to be considered in this assessment. A study area with radius of 6km from the centre of the proposal site has been adopted which captures these areas and properties together with a significant number of others, which have been assessed.
- There would be no direct impacts on any listed building, conservation area, SAM, or area of known archaeological potential arising from the Bishopwood Wind Farm proposal.
- The significance of the effect of the proposed wind farm on the setting of Selby's conservation areas is assessed to be **moderate**, and for its Grade I and II* listed buildings and SAM the significance is assessed to be **moderate**. At a distance of about 4km from the proposal site the turbines would be a relatively prominent feature when viewed from the Selby's conservation areas. However, the opportunities for seeing the wind farm would be severely limited by the built form of the urban area. The movement of the blades, sound or light effects would not have any effect on the setting of the conservation areas or that of their listed buildings at this distance.
- The significance of the effect of the proposed wind farm on the setting of St Wilfred's Church, Brayton is assessed to be **moderate** because of its Grade I listed status and its proximity to the proposed wind farm. At a distance of

about 3.3km from the proposal site the turbines would be a relatively prominent feature when viewed from St Wilfred's Church, its churchyard or the adjacent St Wilfred's House, however the setting of the church and the house is provided largely by the churchyard and its mature trees and the adjacent housing development in Brayton and Selby and would not be affected by the proposal.

- The significance of the effect of the proposed wind farm on the setting of Gateforth Hall is assessed to be **moderate** because of its Grade II* listed status and its proximity to the proposed wind farm. However it has been demonstrated that the setting of the Hall is provided largely by its immediate grounds which would not be affected by the proposal. In addition the ZTV map suggests that Hambleton Hough will fully or largely screen these properties from the proposal.
- The significance of the effect of the proposed wind farm on the setting of All Saint's Church, Wistow is assessed to be **moderate** because of its Grade I listed status and its proximity to the proposed wind farm. However the setting of the Church is provided largely by its location within the centre of the village and would not be affected by the proposal.
- The significance of the effect on the setting of Thorpe Hall in respect of its scheduled ancient monument status is assessed to be **major**. However the immediate setting of the SAM moat is provided by Thorpe Hall and its grounds and would not be affected by the proposal.
- The significance of the effect on the setting of the WWII Decoy Control Centre SAM at Scalm Park is assessed to be **major**. However the nature of this structure and its current lack of any apparent functional relationship with the surrounding farmland are such that this effect is considered not to compromise the reason for the monument's designation.
- All the remaining effects on cultural heritage resources are assessed to be **minor**.
- All the predicted effects can be considered to be temporary, and could be reversed at the end of the useful life of the wind farm, typically 25 years.

The English Heritage document *Conservation Principles Policies and Guidance for the sustainable management of the historic environment* referred to in section 10.2.1 above sets out six principles which should guide the approach to the historic environment. The fifth is entitled "Decisions about change must be reasonable, transparent and consistent". Paragraph 5.4 states:

If conflict cannot be avoided, the weight given to heritage values in making the decision should be proportionate to the significance of the place and the impact of the proposed change on that significance.

There are two scheduled ancient monuments where the effect on setting is assessed to be potentially major - Thorpe Hall Moated Grange, and Scalm Park WWII Decoy Control Centre. In the case of Thorpe Hall the immediate setting of the SAM is provided by the gardens and relatively recent buildings and this would not be affected by the proposal. In the case of the WWII Decoy Centre the setting of this SAM is provided by the surrounding fields which are affected by the proposal, however there is not obvious functional relationship between the remains of the Decoy Centre and its surroundings

Chapter 10 Cultural heritage

when viewed on site. In neither case is the effect of the proposal such that it could be considered to compromise the reasons for designation.

The significance of effects on the settings of Selby's conservation areas, Grade I and II* listed buildings has been assessed to be potentially moderate. However the use of photomontages and fieldwork inspection have demonstrated that in practice settings would be largely unaffected by the proposal.

In the light of the above assessment it is concluded that the design of the proposed wind farm at Bishopwood has minimised its potential impact on the settings of cultural heritage resources within the study area and that significant effects would be limited. The conclusion is therefore that the proposal is acceptable and as such it complies with the requirements of planning policy.