

**ACCORD collaboration with the Colintraive and Glendaruel Development Trust  
Archaeology and History group:  
Summary Statement of Social Value**

Co-Authored by the Colintraive and Glendaruel Development Trust Archaeology and History group and the ACCORD project.

This document is deposited as part of the full ACCORD project archive held by the Archaeology Data Service <http://archaeologydataservice.ac.uk/>

## **Introduction**

The ACCORD team worked with the Colintraive and Glendaruel Development Trust (herein CGDT) Archaeology and History Group on 6<sup>th</sup> April and 21<sup>st</sup> – 22<sup>nd</sup> June 2014. Together we recorded and modelled 3 monuments located in the Kilmoden Parish: the Lephinkill Chambered Cairn; a cup and ring marked stone; and a World War 1 Memorial to two men who fell at Gallipoli. We used a range of technologies including photogrammetry, Reflectance Transformation Imaging (RTI) and laser scanning. This document provides information about the context of this work. There is a brief discussion of the historical value of the monuments with reference to wider sources. The main focus of this document is to describe the social value of the monuments for the CGDT Archaeology and History Group and the wider “ColGlen” community. Social value refers to a collective attachment to place that embodies meanings and values that are important to a community or communities (Jones and Leech 2015: paras 1.5 and 1.6; see also Johnston 1994 and Byrne et al. 2003). As will become clear, the value of the monuments discussed here is in part a product of the CGDT’s purchase of the Stronafian Forest in 2013. The role of 3D recording and modelling in expressing the existing value of the monuments, and in creating value, is also summarised.

## **The CGDT Archaeology and History group and “our forest”**

The CGDT Archaeology and History Group is a recently formed sub-committee of The Colintraive and Glendaruel Development Trust (<http://cgdt.org/about/>). The CGDT is governed by a Board of Directors, elected by the community. The Trust currently has approximately 40 official members; open to all those who are permanently resident in Colintraive and Glendaruel and on the electoral roll. The Trust is established as a Company Limited by Guarantee (SC350010) and is registered as a Charity (SC040002). The CGDT purchased Stronafian Forest, which covers 600 ha, in Glendaruel, as a social enterprise project in February 2013. The CGDT Archaeology and History group was founded following the purchase of the forest and an Archaeology Scotland Adopt-a-Monument workshop held in November 2013. This sub-group is currently made up of around 12 “passionate” and “driven” members of the local community, who see their work in the spirit of the CGDT as *“Making Colintraive and Glendaruel a better place to live and work”*. The group’s recent interest in the archaeology and history of the general area is framed within the CGDT’s purchase of the Stronafian Forest and the sense of ownership and belonging it entails. The group are currently developing heritage trails and interpretation boards in the forest. Group activities also include workshops with schoolchildren, and the surveying and recording of archaeological monuments.

Eleven members of the CGDT Archaeology and History Group took part in the ACCORD project. Members of the group who took part in ACCORD include holiday-homers, part-time inhabitants, those who had family ties going back generations, and the forest officers employed by the CGDT (there was a change in personnel in post over the ACCORD project).

## **Significance and social value**

The group express a strong sense of continuity with the past: “we live here now and are fascinated by what came before.” For some this was expressed through their genealogical tie to place. This

motivates the group to learn more about their landscape; indeed for some it was voiced as a duty or responsibility. For others, often newcomers to the area, taking part in the group is a place-making activity, an attempt to get more “in touch” through “the story” of their heritage in their local landscape. For all in the group, except perhaps the forest officers who had a more professional and managerial relationship with the local area, heritage was key to individuals’ identity and sense of belonging. Some individuals in the group described themselves as “incomers” with no genealogical tie to the area, but it was clearly expressed that this was not a requisite for being considered a local. Rather this status was achieved through active participation in the community, for example membership of CGDT and social enterprise projects.

A strong sense of “pride” in the “vibrant”, exciting” and “special” place of Colintrave and Glendaruel was expressed by all in the group. The relationship with the forest was not just about pragmatic legal ownership; working together as a community was seen as a key part of taking ownership and responsibility of the future wellbeing and success of the local area generally, which was considered to be a dispersed underpopulated “community at risk”. The archaeology and history has a prominent place in this vision helping to “make something that people want to come and see.” They see an opportunity to create something around the heritage that will “entice” outside public interest, and encourage those who are passing through the area to stop and explore. Therefore, the monuments in the forest were recognised as a key asset for tourism, leisure and local businesses. The group are clearly “passionate” about investing in the area’s social, economic, and historic value. “Getting the facts right” about the dates and national significance of the archaeological remains was raised as a very important issue in the Focus Group. This is representative of the ColGlen community’s character of “resilience” and “ambition”.

It is also hoped that the Stronafian forest will form a social hub and focal point for the dispersed inhabitants. Purchase of the Forest is associated with amenity, educational, and wellbeing benefits for the community. As one group member, who resides in Glendaruel, put it: “It would be lovely to have somewhere to go for a walk and meet for a coffee!”

### **The ACCORD project monuments**

In terms of social value, two of the monuments (The Cairn and the cup and ring marked stone) were chosen to be recorded as part of ACCORD primarily because of their location within the community owned Stronafian forest. However, so as to not exclude the Colintrave and wider community, the World War 1 memorial was also chosen for recording.

Current local interest in “The cairn” is framed by its location in the forest. Strong local interest in this monument did not exist prior to the purchase but is now increasing. Despite the focus on its ruinous state in the National Monument Record, it is seen as one of the most pristine monuments in the forest. Its age is also important, being seen as the oldest monument and the anchor for a narrative of human inhabitation of the area. Other factors which underpin the interest of the History and Archaeology Group in this monument are its visibility and accessibility, an ideal feature for a footpath, or “desire line”. The cairn is also perceived to be aesthetically pleasing and to be positioned at a good viewpoint above the valley. The group see it as an attraction and “hub” from which a sense of connection to the past emerges, and from which people can further explore the landscape.

Maps in the Colintrave Community Hall show the Neolithic cup and ring marked boulder located in the forest, but to the group this monument was shrouded in mystery and none of the members present at the ACCORD project had visited it. Nevertheless its chronological and cultural connection to the cairn instigated a desire to locate this monument. On the midsummer solstice 2014 we located the rock-art. The rock-art also happened to be situated in what was described as “the spiritual area of the forest”. It was also near to one of the “desire lines” leading up to “The cairn”. It

has become clear that re-discovering and recording this monument as part of the ACCORD project has generated a great sense of ownership, and the group now recognise its value as an asset for the forest.

Only one member of the group, having recently moved to Colintrave from Australia, knew about the existence of “the Gallipoli memorial” (WW1). On discussion, another member of the group remembered that they had a personal connection to the son of one of the individuals commemorated on the monument. The whole group felt it was important to record this monument in order to “raise awareness” of this “overlooked” site. Since we recorded this monument together, it has also been noted that next year is the 100 year anniversary of the deaths of the McKirdy brothers at Gallipoli commemorated here. The group now plan to hold an anniversary service at this monument in 2015, to mark the battle and lives lost.

**Lephinkill Chambered Cairn (NGR NS 0027 8432).** This cairn is not scheduled but is historically significant in terms of understanding the distribution of Neolithic settlement and burial. It is included in the National Monument Record (Canmore ID 40540), the RCAHMS Argyll Inventory, volume 6, and Henshall’s *Chambered Cairns of Scotland*.

This chambered cairn is situated above the valley floor about 600m E of Clachan of Glendaruel in a clearing within a forestry plantation. Described as a “Clyde-type long cairn”, it appears as a vegetation-covered irregular mound of stones (it is not immediately obvious to a visitor that it is an archaeological monument). The chamber is at the north end and is entered through a concave facade, now blocked by stones. It has been disturbed and robbed for building material.

In terms of the 3D recording and modelling, the CGDT Archaeology and History Group expressed a strong desire to create a model of the cairn which would show it as a visible, ancient and aesthetically pleasing monument. However, the monument was not conducive to photogrammetry or RTI, so instead we decided to use the technique of LiDAR as a last resort. As was expected due to the challenges of vegetation covering the monument, the result achieved was not technically good. Nevertheless, the group value the result as a product of their investment in the heritage, as a place-making activity.

**Cup and Ring Marked Stone (NGR NR 9985 8408).** This decorated boulder is situated in a recent deciduous plantation 100m SE of the road bridge (A886) over the nearby Clachan Burn. The Canmore (Canmore ID 39960) entry describes it as a sunk schist boulder. Its upper surface “bears ten cupmarks, one of which is surrounded by a single ring and another by a keyhole-shaped ring”. This Neolithic rock art is described as both hard to find and difficult to discern except “when wet and in low sun”. The boulder is not a Scheduled Monument, but it is included in the National Monument Record, and Morris’s *The prehistoric rock art of Argyll* (1977).

With the ACCORD project team the Group 3D modelled and recorded it using photogrammetry and RTI using halogen and LED light sources. The cup and rings are much more clearly visible in both the photogrammetric model and RTI images.

**WWI War Memorial (“The Gallipoli memorial”) (NGR NS 028 750).** This memorial is located on the foreshore just off the main road north of Colintrave. It is dedicated to two brothers, R.F. McKirdy and P.M. McKirdy, who fell at the Battle of Gallipoli. It is not included in the National Monument Record but there is an entry in the Imperial War Museum online War Memorial Archive. There it is described as an ornamental drinking fountain and unworked stone cairn. There are bronze lions on the fountainhead and the Badges of RNVR and Argyll and Sutherland Highlanders. The date of erection is unknown and it is noted that coastal erosion has affected the memorial. Dedications to a woman called Helen MacKirdy (who died 1983) and man called Ernest Brookes (who died 1988) have been later added, presumably descendants of the brothers.

The memorial was 3D recorded and modelled using photogrammetry by the group in collaboration with the ACCORD team on the weekend of 21<sup>st</sup> and 22<sup>nd</sup> June.

### **The impact of 3D modelling and recording**

For many members the 3D digital techniques were the hook for getting involved in ACCORD, not their heritage. One person even exclaimed, who had a professional background in using digital technologies, "It doesn't interest me until it gets digital." However, the group had not previously explored the use of these technologies to document or explore their heritage. Members of the group had been exposed to 3D visualisations on television, while two members had previously worked in industries that use 3D websites and graphic software. Virtual exploration, interactive learning, and engaging storytelling were all noted as opportunities which could arise from digitally created 3D visualisations.

It was clear that the process of recording and modelling the monuments had an impact in how people perceived and engaged with them. Only the chambered cairn was a strong focus of interest before the ACCORD weekend, while new relationships with the cup and ring marked boulder and the Gallipoli Memorial emerged. Indeed, as one person noted: "it's the things that are on your doorstep which you don't explore." Recording these latter two monuments in 3D added value to the Stronafian forest and wider ColGlen community; the cup and ring marked stone is now considered another heritage asset, whereas the WW1 war memorial contributes to a sense of community and local identity. Additionally, in the case of the rock art, the value of 3D recording lay in rendering the invisible visible. As one member of the group said, "I couldn't see why it was important and exciting before...now I see why!" In the case of "the Gallipoli memorial" recording it inspired multiple people in the group to find out more about the area's more recent past in living memory. One member interviewed a friend of one of the brothers commemorated. Todd Ferguson who had just returned after 20 years living in Australia and New Zealand, published an account on the ACCORD Blog (archived with the ADS), based on his own independent research about the McKirdy brothers. He was not motivated to do this because of any genealogical relationship, but rather it was a way of referencing his Australian identity where he now lives, since "Gallipoli, during World War One, is an event etched in the stone memorials and hearts of every ANZAC".

The group felt that the 3D recording and modelling technologies used were successful at enhancing the monuments. Importantly, the results are authentic because they had been made by the community of ColGlen, but it was noted that the models viewed on a computer screen or 3D printed would never replace the original in its landscape. Therefore, the results were regarded as useful engagement surrogates inspiring people to visit the "real thing".

The group are extremely enthusiastic about the potentials of photogrammetry and RTI for promotion, communication and engaging new audiences: for raising the profile of the forest, increasing access to the archaeology for educational and interpretation purposes, analysis (especially RTI) to understand the national significance of the monuments and encouraging visitors to the sites. Furthermore, the wow factor of the results was noted, they were recognised as "bringing the monuments to life" in a "visually stunning" way. As one group member repeatedly exclaimed: "it's like magic!" Members of the group felt that the techniques of RTI and photogrammetry offered a low cost to failure; constraints of time and money were not an issue, while results did not need professional or specialist validation. This point is important in terms of taking autonomous ownership over their heritage for their aims of developing a sustainable local economy and generating wellbeing benefits for the community, all centred on their legal ownership of the forest.

### **References:**

**Byrne, D., Brayshaw, H. and Ireland, T.** (2003) Social Significance: a discussion paper. Hurstville: New South Wales National Parks and Wildlife Service (2nd Edition).

**Henshall, A.** (1972) The Chambered Cairns of Scotland, Vol. 1.

**Johnston, C.** (1994) What is Social Value? A discussion paper. Canberra: Australian Government Publishing Service.

**Jones, S. and Leech S.** (2015) Valuing the Historic Environment: a Critical Review of Existing approaches to Social Value. London: AHRC.

**Morris, R. W. B.** (1977) The prehistoric rock art of Argyll. Poole: Dolphin Press.

**RCAHMS** (1988) The Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland. Argyll: an inventory of the monuments volume 6: Mid-Argyll and Cowal, prehistoric and early historic monuments: Edinburgh.

**Websites:**

<http://cgdt.org/about/> .Accessed 9<sup>th</sup> February 2015.