

## REVIEW

W. Krommenhoek and A. Vrij, KLEIPIJPEN: Drie eeuwen Nederlandse kleipijpen in foto's WEVO, Amstelveen, 1987, 336 pages (250 x 190mm).

and

D. H. Duco, De Nederlandse Kleipijp: Handboek voor dateren en determineren, Pijpenkabinet, Leiden, 1987, 159 pages (250 x 170mm).

1987 saw the publication of two substantial contributions to the study of Dutch clay tobacco pipes. Krommenhoek and Vrij attempt to represent three centuries of marked and decorated pipe production by a series of 958 photographs. There are four main chapters. The first, on heelmarks, begins with a series of forty-eight details of registered marks taken from the Gouda Guild-Board of c.1749 which is followed by 400 photographs of actual heelmarks at a scale of roughly six times the originals. These marks are ordered in groups: letter and figure marks; people; animals; flowers and plants; parts of the body, clothing and personal possessions; containers, pots and pans; tools and implements; furniture; musical instruments; buildings; shipping; sun, moon and stars; coats of arms; miscellaneous. Chapter two deals with 338 'side-marks', that is, moulded marks on the side of the bowl just above the heel or spur, mostly of 18th and 19th century date. These are classified in the same sequence of groups as the heelmarks and are illustrated at roughly life-size. Where the two sides differ significantly two views are included. Chapter three presents a sequence of over fifty mainly 17th century Baroque and Jonah-pipes, including a number of dated examples and Chapter four groups together a wide range of some 150 pipes produced for special occasions, such as weddings in the Orange family, the commemoration of the Peace of Aachen and characters in history. Armorial pipes and mottoes are also included. There are four specialised indexes; one tabulating all the side-marked initials in alphabetical order with details of the makers where known and any associated symbols; the second lists all the side-marked initials associated with a moulded representation of a pike; the third provides an alphabetical list of all initials associated with large single letters; the fourth appendix lists crowned numbers which occur as moulded side-marks. There is also a separate master index of figural marks, combining information from all four chapters. There is a single page bibliography and a good four-page summary in English.

This pleasing, hard covered volume is nicely printed and clearly organised. There is much new material and informative text and notes. Unfortunately a major problem is in the quality of the photographs themselves and in the way in which they have been reproduced. Apart from the prints taken from the Guild-Board, the originals for which are two-dimensional, many of the heelmark photographs are blurred and indistinct. Sometimes this is due to the original impression being poor, but often it seems that depth-of-field problems have not been properly addressed. The same applies to the moulded bowls, many of which are badly lit and poorly focused. The pale yellow paper, although of very good quality, also

reduces contrast. Another possible problem is that, although a list of collections used is given at the end, there is no certain way of re-locating the actual pipes used in the study. The fact that the heelmarks are enlarged by different amounts and are all published at the same size would also make accurate identification difficult. Good archaeological drawings would have greatly improved this book as a tool for research.

Duco's volume, which is the synthesis of some fifteen years' work, is designed to be a handbook for collectors, enthusiasts and archaeologists to enable them to date and source Dutch pipes. It is attractively and efficiently published on good white paper with excellent photographs and fine line drawings. He begins with an introductory chapter which deals with the arrival of pipemaking in the Netherlands, a summary of the chronology of the forty-four main pipemaking centres, a useful sequence of technical terms and definitions and an account of how pipes were actually made. The core of the book is provided by three chapters dealing with forms, marks and decoration respectively. He divides Dutch pipes from 1610 onwards into five basic forms: the 'double-conical', the 'funnel', the 'oval or ovoid', the 'curved' and the 'round bottomed' and provides summaries of their evolution together with regional variants and examples of poorer quality products of the same general type. In addition, as examples of production groups, he presents details of a mid-17th century hoard by the II maker, a group made by Jan Danens III of Gouda between 1767 and 1781 which includes a group of 'Irish' export types and a sequence of late 19th century pipes made by Arie van der Kleijn. There follows a brief survey of marks. Some sixty stamped marks are illustrated, followed by a smaller number of relief moulded marks. These are given as examples of the range likely to be encountered in Dutch pipes. A useful sequence of moulded marks on the side of the heel is then presented. This shows something of the range of Gouda Coat of Arms marks and also illustrates pipes bearing the Arms of such towns as Utrecht and 's-Hertogenbosch. The next fifty pages deal with decorated pipes, beginning with stamped stems and bowls. Mould decorated pipes are then presented in a sequence based on the five form types he had previously defined. Included in this section is a useful typology of Jonah-pipes, a fine series of armorial pipes and a nice selection of 19th century 'historic personality' pipes.

The final chapter deals with the dating of pipes. Duco examines some of the more important dating systems which have been applied to Dutch pipes and finds them wanting. They are mostly too simplistic and do not take into account variations within individual factories let alone between pipes made in differing areas at different times. He is rightly cautious about the possibility of using pipes for absolute dating purposes and proposes what he describes as a 'deductive' dating method. This involves the consideration of a hierarchy of possible dating criteria which allows the researcher to 'home in' on the date of an individual pipe. These consist of 'general distinguishing features' such as form, 'elements tied to factories', such as individual marks or techniques and 'external factors' like documentary evidence or associated evidence of other types. These and other variables are laid out in a series of chronological tables which allow the date ranges of known formal, technical and decorative

types to be read off, so that by using these different factors in combination a satisfactory date range may be obtained. Whilst this approach is more logical and less idiosyncratic than many dating systems the date ranges of each of his variables have to be taken on trust. There is no attempt to present the evidence on which they are based. Indeed, some of the ranges suggested seem artificially precise. For example, it seems strange that the Gouda Arms mark on the side of the heel, with or without an S, and copies made in Alphen on Rhine, Germany, and elsewhere should all begin in 1740 exactly. Many of the stamped figural marks are current for very long periods and we are given no assistance in distinguishing between the same mark used at different dates. This impressive book concludes with an extensive select bibliography of 298 titles and an English summary.

Both these volumes make significant contributions to the study of Dutch pipes and are now essential reading for any non-Low Countries archaeologist who has to deal with Dutch pipes on excavations. Having said this, however, the state of Dutch pipe studies is, perhaps, less healthy than the appearance of these books might imply. Dutch pipes are generally of higher quality and are much more commonly marked than British ones. There is a very much bigger range of documents and artefactual evidence dealing both with the makers and the organisation of the industry than we have here. Yet there is still no comprehensive presentation or assessment of the documentary evidence, no full makers' list and no attempt to present a complete sequence of marks to aid identification. If you find a heel stamped Dutch bowl, for example, it may still be necessary to wade through hundreds of articles in the hope of finding a comparable example. Even then, Dutch marks are usually recorded as if, once registered, a mark remains identical for perhaps 200 or more years. There has been no general attempt to identify individual dies and, therefore, little possibility of dating a particular mark within its known range of currency. It is not possible to know whether similar marks figured by Friederich, Duco and Krommenhoekre from the same pipes or the same dies or, indeed, to locate these examples specifically in order to compare them with a new specimen. There is no attempt at a comprehensive list of makers. Again the literature is huge. Krommenhoek and Vrij illustrate forty of the 252 makers' marks recorded on one Gouda Guild-Board. It seems extraordinary that such extant Guild-Boards, which provide an outstanding and unique form of evidence, should not have been fully published with critical notes long before now, in the manner of Helbers and Goedewaagen's illustration of the marks on wrappers in 1942.

Dutch pipe research is mostly conducted by collectors and historians with little involvement by professional archaeologists. This is reflected in both these tomes, which give a great deal of time to the presentation of unusual decorative variables, rather than to the study of average quality pipes which were made and traded all over the world. All three authors relegate the very common crowned number and letter marks to summary notes and do not attempt to deal with the identification, dating and sourcing of these. The majority of the pipes illustrated and discussed are very rarely found outside the Netherlands. Archaeological evidence, acknowledged by Duco as an important source for the study of

pipes, is barely mentioned. There appear to be few well dated and closed excavated groups and no consideration of the problems of dealing with the myriad pipe fragments which turn up on most urban excavations, or the uses to which pipe evidence may be put. Much vital information appears to be either obscurely published or held by private individuals. In spite of this both volumes are a must for any serious post-medieval post-excavator.

P. J. Davey

#### REVIEW

#### Corpus van Middeleeuws aardewerk uit gesloten vondstcomplexen in Nederland en Vlaanderen

eds. D.P. Hallewas, T.J. Hoekstra, H.L. Janssen, K.Vlierman (Netherlands) and F. Verhaeghe (Flanders); (Loose A4).

Although the first publication of this new Corpus was issued in 1985 it seems to have received little notice in Britain. The present note is intended to summarise what has been achieved so far and to assess its importance for readers outside the Low Countries.

The object of the Corpus, summarised in a general introduction and instructions circulated with the first three groups in 1985, is to provide a systematic, standardised method of publishing closed, well dated, pottery assemblages from the Netherlands and Flanders. These would preferably consist of completely restorable vessels, although important sherd groups would also be considered. Previously unpublished material would be given priority. The term 'medieval' is not taken too literally and pottery groups dating from the 8th to the 18th centuries would be accepted.

Each group involves a summary introduction presenting information about dating, context, the general nature of the ceramic and other finds and bibliography. Each vessel then occupies two A4 pro-forma pages: the first is a tabulation of standardised information about the pot, the second is a conventional drawing. The instructions are clear and detailed. The form has four main sections. The first provides brief details of site, context number, location and accession number, dating and bibliography. The second covers technology in the following order: method of production (on the wheel, moulded etc.); size, density and type of inclusions; porosity, hardness and any peculiarities of the body itself; surface treatment, including type of glaze, slip and decorating technique; type of kiln atmosphere; colour of body; any other technical details such as cracks, drops of glaze etc. The third section allows the researcher to list any significant evidence which post-dates the actual production of the pot, such as wear-marks, sooting, secondary burning or chemical reactions in the soil, while the fourth allows an attribution of production centre, date and use to be offered. The second page of each